

1

2

3

4

5

6 NASSAU COUNTY LEGISLATURE

7

8 RICHARD NICOLELLO

9 PRESIDING OFFICER

10

11 HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES

12 COMMITTEE

13

14 LEGISLATOR ROSE MARIE WALKER

15 CHAIR

16

17

18 Theodore Roosevelt Building

19 1550 Franklin Avenue

20 Mineola, New York

21

22

23 February 5, 2020

24 7:11 P.M.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

A P P E A R A N C E S :

LEGISLATOR ROSE MARIE WALKER

Chair

LEGISLATOR JAMES KENNEDY

Vice Chair

LEGISLATOR LAURA SCHAEFER

LEGISLATOR C. WILLIAM GAYLOR

LEGISLATOR SIELA BYNOE

LEGISLATOR ARNOLD DRUCKER

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Before we
3 begin I'm going to ask Legislator Colonel
4 Gaylor to lead us in the pledge.

5 I will ask the clerk if he would
6 please take the roll.

7 MR. PULITZER: Thank you madam.
8 Health and Social Services Committee roll
9 call. Legislator Joshua Lafazan is not
10 present tonight. Legislator Arnold Drucker.

11 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Here.

12 MR. PULITZER: Filling in for
13 ranking member Delia DeRiggi-Whitton is
14 Ms. Bynoe.

15 LEGISLATOR BYNOE: Present.

16 MR. PULITZER: Legislator C.
17 William Gaylor III.

18 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: Present.

19 MR. PULITZER: Legislator Laura
20 Schaefer.

21 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: Here.

22 MR. PULITZER: Legislator James
23 Kennedy.

24 LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: Here.

25 MR. PULITZER: Joining us today

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 is Legislator Thomas McKeivitt. Chairwoman
3 Rose Marie Walker.

4 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Here.

5 MR. PULITZER: We have a quorum
6 ma'am.

7 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.

8 I would like to first just begin by
9 thanking everyone for being here tonight.
10 Sometimes during the middle of the week and we
11 have a hearing there's very, very few people
12 here but obviously this is very, very
13 important and I'm very happy to see so many
14 people here in attendance. I'd also certainly
15 like to thank our Social Services Department
16 for being here, and I believe we do have
17 representation from the Health Department
18 also.

19 We have read all about the
20 heartbreaking tragedy that occurred in Suffolk
21 County with the death of Thomas Valva. An
22 eight year old child who died of hypothermia
23 after being left overnight in a freezing
24 garage by his father and his father's
25 fiancée. Suffolk County is now undertaking a

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 comprehensive review of its Department of
3 Social Services to evaluate the policies,
4 procedures and resources to avoid tragedies
5 like this from happening again.

6 Before we even knew Suffolk was
7 doing that, we met and we said we need to meet
8 here in our legislature. We need to meet with
9 our department and hear what they have to
10 say. Hear that they have everything they need
11 to do the job that they have to do that lies
12 in front of them. So that is really our
13 purpose here tonight.

14 We will meet with our Social
15 Services Department and know that we have the
16 resources and the support they need to protect
17 all of our children. We have our commissioner
18 Nancy Nunziata here and I thank you so much
19 and your workers too. And you will explain
20 your operations of how your department works
21 and then answer any questions that we might
22 have or the public might have. I'm going to
23 ask Legislator Bynoe did you want to say
24 anything quickly?

25 LEGISLATOR BYNOE: I'd like to

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 first start out by thanking you Madam
3 Chairwoman for convening this very important
4 special legislative hearing as it relates to
5 the unspeakable tragedy of the death of Thomas
6 Valva. We do think it is important that we
7 are here today to make sure that our Nassau
8 County Department of Social Services and also
9 the Department of Health are resourced
10 properly to carry out the important work of
11 protecting the most vulnerable of our Nassau
12 community residents, the children. Without
13 further ado, I will turn the floor back over
14 to you.

15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.
16 Like we said, we are not doing this out of
17 suddenly thinking everything is wrong but we
18 wanted to be proactive rather than reactive
19 here in Nassau County.

20 So, we are going to begin. I'm
21 just going to let you know that we do have a
22 three minute limit on our speakers when it
23 gets to public comment time. Not that you're
24 going to be silenced immediately but we will
25 ask you after three minutes to wrap it up

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 because we do have a large crowd here tonight
3 and we'd like to have as many people be able
4 to speak as they can.

5 Just before the presentation starts
6 by our commissioner, I'm going to ask if the
7 president of our CSEA, Jerry Laricchiuta,
8 would please come up and say a few words.

9 MR. LARICCHIUTA: Good evening
10 Madam Chairwoman and the Health and Services
11 Committee. I have to tell you, this is
12 probably one of the most anxious and nervous
13 committee hearings that this group and my
14 union has ever attended and spoke at. What
15 I'd like to do for a second here is we have to
16 remember that this is revolving around an
17 eight year old boy. An innocent eight year
18 old child. I'd like to ask for a moment of
19 silence just in respect and in prayer to
20 Thomas Valva before we continue if that's all
21 right with the chair.

22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Absolutely.

23 MR. LARICCHIUTA: Thank you.
24 This is such a difficult I don't want to even
25 call it an issue. It's part of life here on

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 Long Island and this is involving our
3 children. I raised three daughters. I have
4 eight grandchildren right now ages eight
5 months to nine years old. I couldn't imagine
6 going through what this family is going
7 through.

8 What I'm here to speak about though
9 and you see this great group behind me. These
10 are our DSS, Department of Social Services CPS
11 workers. People that put their entire family,
12 their minds, their lives on the line every day
13 and their job is to make sure our children are
14 safe and they really want that done 110
15 percent right, not halfway done. So this is
16 not about a political move or -- this is about
17 life here and tragedy that happened because
18 something went wrong out in the Suffolk. I
19 don't know what and I'm not going to say
20 what. Let them determine that.

21 But what we are trying to say in
22 Nassau County we want to be a little
23 prospective about that. We were here in
24 October. These folks here have case loads
25 that are way above the recommended average.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 And if you don't think that matters in social
3 services and in CPS you are sincerely wrong.

4 I just had a chat with a few
5 people. They were filling me in and telling
6 me what goes on. Let's say the average is
7 recommended between 12 and 16 cases each.
8 Most of our CPS workers have over 20. 22,
9 23. We have a few that are over 30. That's
10 absurd and cannot be allowed. Cannot be
11 accepted. Because their jobs are to
12 constantly stay in touch with families and
13 children. When they get contacted by an
14 accusation, someone makes a complaint, they
15 have 24 hours --

16 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Excuse me.
17 Let's let Jerry speak please.

18 MR. LARICCHIUTA: She's right.
19 We do have unlimited funds, which brings us to
20 the question of why are we having this
21 conversation?

22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I'd ask
23 everyone you are more than welcome -- excuse
24 me.

25 MR. LARICCHIUTA: I will wait

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 until this is over.

3 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I'd ask
4 everyone to give everybody else the courtesy
5 of speaking.

6 MR. LARICCHIUTA: We're not even
7 arguing with them. We're agreeing with them.
8 We are agreeing with them that 75 percent of
9 your salaries are paid for. That's what
10 they're saying. I think. Can I make one more
11 statement? I don't want to increase this
12 anymore but they need to hear this because
13 these people -- you see the vitriol that's in
14 this room.

15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: You have to
16 understand that nothing you are shouting out
17 is going on the record. If you would like to
18 speak you are more than welcome to but you
19 fill out a form and you will get to speak.

20 MR. LARICCHIUTA: We're not
21 disagreeing with you.

22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: We would like
23 to hear what you have to say but we're asking
24 you to please follow the protocol of the
25 meeting.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 MR. LARICCHIUTA: Madam Chair,
3 here is what we are trying to say. There's no
4 reason to have case loads overloaded with 75
5 percent of their salaries are subsidized by
6 the federal and state government. Our
7 children are too important to overlook this.
8 Our commissioner, our new commissioner is
9 very, very helpful at this and she cares.

10 I'm only agreeing with the fact
11 that 75 percent of our workers' pay was
12 subsidized. We should have more. A lot
13 more. I'm sorry. We're going to shut it
14 down. They're not going to let anybody
15 speak. That's no way to show respect to the
16 families that have gone through this tragedy
17 either. I don't believe that's respect. We
18 want to respect the children. We want to
19 respect the families. But we represent the
20 people that are doing their best. You cannot
21 do a job if you're 50 percent staffed.

22 The bottom line is, look, help us
23 get the staffing up so we don't have this
24 tragedy in Nassau County. Please, we do not
25 want to ever see any tragedy like this in

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Nassau County.

3 These CPS workers behind us they
4 work hard. They dedicate their lives to this
5 and they're losing sleep and they're having
6 therapeutic sessions because of what happened
7 to little Thomas and they don't want this to
8 happen in Nassau. So please give us the
9 staffing that we need.

10 And Commissioner Nunziata, thank
11 you for everything that you've been doing. I
12 thank you Madam Chair.

13 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Excuse me.
14 I'm going to ask you one more time to please
15 sit. So now we can have the presentation by
16 our Department of Social Services. I ask you
17 kindly to please not disrupt. There are many
18 people in this room that would like to get up
19 and speak and it's very difficult for us to
20 move forward. I don't want to have put this
21 in recess because you're shouting over
22 everyone. I'm going to ask you kindly to
23 please follow the rules that everyone else
24 seems to be following.

25 And I'm going to ask now for our

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 commissioner to please give a presentation.

3 Jerry, thank you and I apologize
4 that you had to be disrupted so many times and
5 I thank you all the members who are here with
6 you. Thank you.

7 Good evening Chairwoman Walker,
8 Legislator Kennedy, members of the Health and
9 Social Services Committee as well as
10 Legislator Bynoe. I appreciate you having me
11 here to discuss the child welfare services in
12 Nassau County. It's my hope that at the end
13 of this presentation you will have a clear
14 picture of the scope of the program in Nassau
15 County, the systemic response we have in place
16 to address this very important issue and the
17 ways in which you can assist us moving
18 forward.

19 Before I begin my presentation, I'd
20 like to introduce you to three key managers
21 who are responsible for the child welfare
22 services in the county.

23 Sitting at the end here is Maria
24 Lauria. Maria was recently promoted to Social
25 Services program coordinator. In this new

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 capacity Maria will oversee all child welfare
3 programs, including Child Protective Services,
4 foster care and adoption and preventative
5 services. Maria is also the architect of the
6 blind removal system which has been recognized
7 nationally and has now been adopted
8 statewide. Maria has been with the department
9 over 30 years.

10 Jeannette Feingold to my left, is
11 the director of Child Protective Services and
12 she has been overseeing this department for
13 the past nine years.

14 To my far right at the end is Terry
15 McGuinness. Terry is the director of
16 Preventative Services and CPS Ongoing
17 programs. She has been supervising that unit
18 for four years.

19 To my immediate right is Rudy
20 Carmenati, who is the deputy county attorney
21 for the Department of Social Services. He has
22 been with the department for nine years. All
23 of them will be available to answer questions
24 as they come up today.

25 We come here this evening with a

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 very heavy heart over the events that have
3 unfolded in Suffolk County with the untimely
4 death of eight year Thomas Valva. As you
5 know, the investigation is ongoing and
6 therefore we cannot comment about that case.
7 We are here to answer questions about Nassau
8 County's Child Protective Services.

9 Each day our CPS staff are charged
10 with investigating reports of alleged abuse
11 and neglect in the county. In 2019 we
12 received an average of 680 reports per month
13 of alleged abuse and neglect. The work is
14 fast paced, it's very stressful and the stakes
15 are very high.

16 However, we are very fortunate in
17 that we have a department that is well trained
18 and dedicated and who work tirelessly to
19 ensure that Nassau County's children are
20 protected. With that, what I'd like to do is
21 get into the power point presentation.

22 So, the first slide is to give you
23 some basic demographics. Nationally the
24 picture is not a good one. Throughout the
25 United States during FY 2018 there were 4.3

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 million referrals to child protective service
3 agencies throughout the country. That
4 involved approximately 7.8 million children.

5 In New York State, in 2018, there
6 were 165,943 reports of child abuse and
7 neglect. Which represented 37.5 children out
8 of every thousand children were the subject of
9 a potential abuse and neglect report. Where
10 the cases were indicated, 30.7 per 1,000
11 children in New York were victims of potential
12 child abuse and neglect.

13 Here in Nassau County we fall below
14 the statewide average. In 2018 we had 6,370
15 reported allegations of abuse and neglect.
16 Which equates to a rate of 21.1 children for
17 every thousand children in Nassau County.
18 These would be confirmed cases where children
19 were victims of abuse and neglect.

20 What we know just from looking at
21 these numbers is that this issue is clearly a
22 national problem. We know it's a state
23 problem. And what we know is that right now
24 we take some solace, but certainly not much,
25 in knowing that our numbers at least fall well

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 below the statewide averages.

3 I want to talk a little bit about
4 the structure in our CPS department.
5 Currently we have approximately 65 staff and
6 we are bringing on more over the next
7 hopefully couple of weeks if not months. We
8 have four units. Each unit is headed by a --
9 we actually have more than four units. We
10 have four assistant directors. Those are
11 those case supes three and they oversee a
12 variety of staff in their unit. And what you
13 will see is that the staff are pretty evenly
14 spread out across the department. The
15 division, as I said, is headed by Jeannette
16 Feingold and she'll be speaking in a little
17 while. But that's how we have structured the
18 department.

19 We are bringing on 11 additional
20 case workers. So, eventually if I were to do
21 this organizational chart somewhere down the
22 next couple of weeks or month we would
23 probably have six different units. So we are
24 definitely expanding the staff there.

25 I want to talk about the issue and

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 what we do but it's really important, you
3 know, Jerry alluded to the staff that work
4 there and I have to tell you it's a very, very
5 special group. Our staff, our child
6 protective staff, is probably one of the most
7 dedicated group of people you will meet. Many
8 of them have been working for the department
9 for many years. They have dedicated
10 themselves in trying to meet the needs of the
11 families and children. They're very
12 thoughtful when it comes to confidentiality,
13 to coming to handling matters that are very,
14 very delicate. And these are very delicate
15 matters that they deal with. They're also
16 very diverse and they're very representative
17 of the communities in Nassau County that we
18 work with. We have a couple of superstars
19 among our staff.

20 In 2019 --
21 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Excuse me. I
22 said it before, you are welcome to speak. You
23 are not to shout out or you're going to have
24 to make us stop this hearing. It's not your
25 turn to speak and you are welcome to speak

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 when it's your turn but someone else is
3 speaking. Give them the courtesy of
4 listening. I'm going to ask again. I think
5 you are being very disrespectful to many, many
6 people in this room who want to continue the
7 hearing. That's fine.

8 As I stated before, we will be
9 having public comment after our presentation.
10 But right now it is our commissioner's turn to
11 speak and I would again respectfully ask you
12 to sit down and to stop shouting out and let
13 our commissioner and her staff finish the
14 presentation.

15 MS. NUNZIATA: Thank you.

16 On the next slide what we tried to
17 do is show the types of cases that we've
18 received over the past few years. And if you
19 look at those pie charts, what it shows is
20 that our numbers have remained fairly stable.
21 The largest percentage of reported cases,
22 reported allegations that we get, are in the
23 area of child neglect and child maltreatment.

24 Now, New York State Office of
25 Children and Family Services defines child

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 maltreatment, child neglect, refers to the
3 quality of care that a child is given from
4 those that are responsible for that child.
5 Things like lack of food, lack of clothing,
6 lack of shelter, lack of medical care would
7 all fall within that category.

8 If you take a look, more than 85
9 percent of our cases that have come into the
10 county over the past three years have been
11 reports of potential lack of food, clothing,
12 shelter, medical care, educational, neglect,
13 things like that. Our cases of severe
14 physical abuse or sexual abuse, though
15 significant, do not represent the majority of
16 our cases.

17 In terms of the next slide, it
18 takes a look at some of the case load ratios.
19 And the first box takes a look at the ratio,
20 case ratios for Child Protective Services
21 workers. Now, the numbers right now, we took
22 a snapshot. Understand that the numbers
23 you're looking at is a snapshot in time. So
24 as of the beginning of this week there were
25 1,086 active cases. These are cases that are

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 open and that are undergoing investigation.

3 We have currently 65 workers for an
4 average of 16.7 cases. Now we are adding
5 additional workers because we did receive
6 approval for an 11 additional case workers.
7 So, it's my hope that that ratio goes down.
8 Mind you that the number we are presenting
9 takes into account the entire CPS department.
10 It's not just a portion of CPS. It's not just
11 an investigative unit or the investigative
12 units. It's the entire department, including
13 all staff who work in CPS.

14 The second box speaks to the Child
15 Protective Services ongoing. These are cases
16 where there has been an indication of abuse
17 and neglect and these families are working
18 with us to try to -- where we are working with
19 them I should say, to try to strengthen their
20 family. We follow a number of these cases.
21 Currently we have about 173 active cases in
22 that unit. We have 18 case workers and they
23 carry 9.6 cases a piece.

24 Then I thought that I would just
25 also show you the foster care number. Foster

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 care number is not based on cases, it's based
3 on individual children. So currently we have
4 165 children in our custody, in our foster
5 care system. We have 20 case workers assigned
6 to those children for a ratio of 8.25 cases
7 per worker.

8 There is a recommended, and you may
9 have heard this, there is a recommended case
10 load ratio for CPS workers and that's
11 somewhere between 12 and 15 cases. That is a
12 state recommendation. Though you must know
13 it's not a state mandate. So we are in
14 striking distance of that. We are hoping that
15 as we continue to bring on additional staff
16 that we will be able to lower those numbers.

17 The other thing that when you look
18 at the case load ratio numbers we all have to
19 understand is that there's a real ebb and flow
20 to these numbers. Depending upon the month,
21 depended on the week, the case load could be
22 higher or lower depending on the amount of the
23 reports that we get in. Also depending on the
24 severity of the case. Sometimes we are
25 definitely going to have workers that have

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 more cases than others. It may be because a
3 particular worker has a certain skill set that
4 we feel is better matched with a case that we
5 have received.

6 So, the numbers, you know, will
7 change and the case ratios will change
8 depending upon the amount of the cases that we
9 are taking in, the amount of calls and the
10 amount of cases that we are actively
11 investigating.

12 The bottom line is we have to
13 investigate every single case that comes
14 through. We get all of our cases through the
15 state registry. Maybe the next slide
16 Jeannette will walk you through the process.
17 But for every case that comes through the
18 state registry to us that case must be
19 investigated. And there are various time
20 lines where we need to complete that
21 investigation.

22 So, since I've been on board, which
23 has been 90 days, I think it was just 90 days,
24 staffing has been one of my priorities. I'm
25 pleased to say that while we have not made all

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 the progress that we want to make we are
3 definitely making progress. I've certainly
4 got commitments from our fiscal folks that as
5 we need additional people they are at the
6 ready to assist us. Let's go to the next
7 one.

8 I'm going to turn the mic over to
9 Jeannette right now and Jeannette will walk
10 you through the process and really try to help
11 explain what happens from the time that we get
12 a case through making some kind of a
13 determination.

14 MS. FEINGOLD: Thank you. So,
15 the only way we can start an investigation is
16 when a report comes in through the state
17 central registry. Not a phone call to our
18 local Department of Social Services but
19 through the state central registry. Whereby,
20 a call has to get called in through the 1-800
21 number through Albany. That can happen either
22 through a mandated reporter or through a
23 person making a report to the state central
24 registry.

25 So when somebody makes a report, a

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 suspected allegation of neglect or abuse, a
3 reporter at the state takes that report. They
4 take that information, the demographics of the
5 subject, the children involved, their date of
6 birth, the address, the allegations. That
7 information. They take that information and
8 they send it back to Nassau County because we
9 are just talking about Nassau County right now
10 where the children live. Our registry unit in
11 Nassau County takes that information and they
12 verify that the children live in Nassau. And
13 once our registry unit takes that information
14 they send it to one of our investigative
15 units.

16 I would like to share that we are
17 open 24 hours a day. So we operate, just like
18 I said, 24 hours a day. We can take our
19 report at three o'clock in the morning. So we
20 are on call just like that. When we take our
21 report our report can be dispatched into one
22 of our different units. I will explain how
23 the process goes.

24 It can start off and it can go into
25 one of our straight investigative units

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 depending upon the allegations at hand. If
3 it's one of our specialty units, meaning if
4 it's physical abuse with a child under the age
5 of 13, it be could fractures, burns, a
6 fatality, it will go into our severe physical
7 abuse unit, which is housed out of Bethpage
8 and works with our special victims, the
9 police. That would be one of our units. If
10 it's sexual abuse for an adult, perpetuating
11 sexual abuse with a child, it would still go
12 out of Bethpage with our sexual abuse team
13 also working with the police.

14 If it's a court-ordered
15 investigation where that can only be handled
16 with a sitting family court judge would order
17 a court-ordered investigation that would come
18 to the court, that would go to a special
19 court-ordered unit where they would call in
20 the case and we would do a special
21 court-ordered investigation.

22 Or when a case comes in during the
23 night or a follow-up during the day, our night
24 staff or emergency staff would handle that
25 case. That unit does not carry a case load

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 but handles cases for follow-up during the
3 evenings and at night and on the weekends.

4 We also have a family assessment
5 unit. That's a nontraditional approach to
6 investigations and that is where a family
7 assessment response, where it's an engagement
8 approach to investigations. Those are our
9 different approaches to investigations.

10 Our other investigation unit is
11 where it's not a specialty unit but we have
12 eight additional investigation units that
13 handle our investigations that come in.

14 And once we get a report for
15 investigation we have 24 hours to begin our
16 investigation. And our investigation begins
17 with either a source contact or a face-to-face
18 investigation. Once we have that, beginning
19 our 24 hour contact, that's where we have to
20 assess the safety of the child. That's where
21 we begin our investigation. That determines
22 the imminency of the child and the children at
23 home. To assess the safety of the children.
24 To make sure that there's no imminent danger.
25 We go out and assess their safety and make

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 sure that there's no harm to the children.
3 That the children can in fact remain in the
4 home.

5 If need be, if we have to do a
6 safety plan for the children, if we have to
7 provide interventions in the home, if we have
8 to provide some referrals, some resources and
9 we continue to go out to the home continuously
10 to make collateral contacts, to make visits,
11 to interview everybody in the home. To
12 interview school personnel, to interview
13 medical providers, mental health providers.
14 Whoever is involved with the family. To
15 interview neighbors. To interview whoever is
16 involved with the family.

17 Sometimes we need to make referrals
18 and to make other provisions that are needed
19 for the family at large. We need to make a
20 seven-day safety assessment for the family.
21 And in that seven-day safety assessment we
22 need to document what was done and if the
23 family is at any risk.

24 Now, might I add, through the
25 investigation we need to continue to assess

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 the safety of the family and document it. We
3 continue through progress notes and continue.
4 And if at any time we feel there is any risk
5 we need to, if need be, go to court and file
6 petitions. And if we have to, we might have
7 to do a removal. But that is not our goal.

8 Our goal is to try at all times to
9 keep the family together and to meet with
10 family and offer any kind of resources. We
11 always believe we look for the strength in the
12 family and to work with the family and to
13 utilize the skills necessary that the family
14 does in fact have. What we do know is that
15 all families do have strengths and skills and
16 we utilize that.

17 On the outset we have 60 days to
18 make a determination in any given case. So
19 that's what we go on the outset of. As I
20 stated, we go through, and for our
21 investigation, we have to go through -- we
22 work with the kids. We interview every
23 child. We interview every parent. We
24 interview people that aren't in the home and
25 we continue forth with our investigation.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 If in fact we believe that the
3 workers feel that we do have to have a removal
4 we go forth and we have what's called our
5 blind removal. Because no worker should have
6 to feel that they have to make a decision on
7 their own. We bring forth a team. And in our
8 team it's met with administrators, with the
9 director of children services, preventive
10 services ongoing, our legal team, and we all
11 meet together and discuss the case and offer
12 services that need to be offered. Of if we
13 need to have a removal, we bring forth that
14 information and then we go forth and present
15 that. And we present that to the court
16 because the court is the one that makes the
17 ultimate decision as to whether or not a
18 removal will be upheld. Because it's the
19 judges that make that ultimate final
20 decision. Or in fact we can provide the
21 resources that are necessary to keep that
22 family intact.

23 Within our 60 days we have to make
24 a determination for the case and our case can
25 go in a variety of ways. We can make a

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 determination where the case would be
3 unfounded. Where that there would be no
4 credible evidence to substantiate the case.
5 Our case could be unindicated and closed.
6 Meaning that there would be some credible
7 evidence to indicate the case but we are
8 closing the case because the family was able
9 to follow through with us and follow our
10 recommendations. So we are able to close the
11 case.

12 Our case could be indicated and
13 open and we are opening the case because the
14 family was not able to work with us and we
15 have to go to family court and file a neglect
16 petition. So we have to take that route
17 because we need the arm of the court. Or we
18 have to indicate the case and open it and
19 we're placing the children in foster care.
20 Sometimes we just have to indicate an open and
21 use our resources and refer the children to
22 preventive services. Or we open the case to
23 PINS because the family needs PINS diversion
24 services. I think that might cover our
25 investigation area.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 MS. NUNZIATA: I just to want to
3 give you an idea of the budget as it relates
4 to our child welfare services.

5 So, the Department of Social
6 Services, as you will see in this current
7 slide, represents about 22 percent of the
8 general fund budget. The next chart shows you
9 that the services portion of the general fund
10 budget, the personnel costs, are about 48
11 percent. So again, that includes the Child
12 Protective Services unit.

13 The next slide breaks out the
14 budget, the current operating budget by
15 category. The NIFA-approved budget that we
16 have. I want to point you toward the
17 authorized head count. So, we have an
18 authorized head count for the department of
19 576 employees. We currently have 545 on
20 board. We are bringing another 18 on board.
21 Of those 18, 11 are case work staff going to
22 CPS. Currently we are 94 percent filled in
23 terms of the authorized positions. 94 percent
24 of those positions are filled and three
25 percent remain vacant and we are actively

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 canvassing. We do have a civil service list
3 already for case workers. We are in the
4 process of canvassing that list so we can get
5 these folks on board.

6 It does take a little bit of time
7 because there is extensive training that CPS
8 staff have to go through before they can
9 actually begin working on cases, and I believe
10 that's a seven week process. And it is a
11 state-required training. So on-boarding
12 people does take some time.

13 And we also, in addition to what
14 the state provides, we also do a tremendous
15 amount of supplementary training at the
16 department for folks that are going into this
17 unit. It's a highly specialized unit and we
18 want our best trained folks there.

19 I think that is it for my
20 presentation and certainly if you have
21 questions or want to table them let me know.
22 Thank you.

23 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you
24 Commissioner. I'm just going to start and
25 then we will all be asking questions.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Legislator Muscarella has joined us also.

3 I know you're new to the department
4 and you're new to Nassau County government.
5 Have you had the opportunity to conduct a
6 review of the policies, the procedures and the
7 resources within CPS?

8 MS. NUNZIATA: I can't say that
9 we have done a formal review but certainly
10 I've been looking at every single department
11 and certainly CPS is one on my list. It's at
12 the top of my list. We've definitely been
13 talking about the staffing from the minute I
14 walked in to the position. Jeannette was
15 extremely vocal in letting me know that we
16 needed some additional staff. So,
17 fortunately, I have been lobbying and talking
18 to every single person I can speak to and we
19 did get approval on those 11 staff and I'm
20 hoping to get some additional.

21 That is probably our biggest
22 resource that we have needed is actually the
23 staffing. Like I said, many of our staff that
24 we have on board have been doing this work for
25 a while. So we have a pretty good, skilled

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 group of workers out there.

3 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I know you
4 said you have staff of 65 case workers,
5 correct?

6 MS. NUNZIATA: 65 workers. CPS
7 workers. Some of them are case workers. Some
8 of them have other titles.

9 LEGISLATOR WALKER: How many of
10 that staff would you say are actually case
11 workers? Case workers that have a case load?

12 MS. NUNZIATA: Every single one
13 of them. Plus we have the assistant directors
14 and we have supervisors.

15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: All 65 of
16 those are case workers? They have a case load
17 of --

18 MS. NUNZIATA: They're field
19 workers.

20 LEGISLATOR WALKER: What is the
21 difference between a field worker and a case
22 worker?

23 MS. FEINGOLD: Those are field
24 workers. Those are 65 field workers.

25 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Each one of

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 those has a case load? Every one of those 65
3 workers has a case load?

4 MS. FEINGOLD: Yes.

5 LEGISLATOR WALKER: So that case
6 load of what did we say we had, 1,086, that is
7 divided, well, basically equally. Maybe
8 someone has --

9 MS. FEINGOLD: That's an
10 average. Those 65 case workers, when you say
11 16.7, that 1,086 is averaged out over 65 case
12 workers.

13 LEGISLATOR WALKER: So somebody
14 could have 18 and somebody could have
15 whatever?

16 MS. FEINGOLD: Correct.

17 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Do any of our
18 case workers have a larger number? Not even
19 close to 16 or 18?

20 MS. FEINGOLD: Yes.

21 LEGISLATOR WALKER: What might
22 that number be?

23 MS. FEINGOLD: Some might have
24 30.

25 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Why, if we

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 basically try to even it out, why would some
3 have 30? It just concerns me. It's hard
4 enough to have smaller case load and really
5 devote -- and I'm not saying any of them are
6 doing something wrong, but someone that has a
7 case load of 30 is a lot different. That's
8 almost double the amount of what somebody else
9 might have.

10 MS. NUNZIATA: Sometimes what has
11 happened -- again, this has been since I have
12 been observing the department. We have lost a
13 number of people and when you lose people it
14 takes a while to bring people on. Those cases
15 have to go somewhere. Often times then those
16 cases go to the folks that are on staff.
17 Again, it may not be the best system but we
18 have to manage the case load. Whether staff
19 are coming or going or retiring we still have
20 to manage the case load.

21 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Right. So
22 then are we really talking about 65 case
23 workers or are there times there's only 40
24 case workers or 30 something case workers?

25 MS. NUNZIATA: There could be

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 different -- depending on the point in time
3 again the numbers could be different. But our
4 case load is without a doubt some folks have
5 larger case loads than others. What the hope
6 is, is that as we bring additional people on
7 we want to try to get the case load down for
8 everyone to what the recommended standard is.
9 That's what we are working on.

10 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I would hope
11 that we would do that. But I'm not really
12 quite grasping -- we have 65 case workers
13 you're saying.

14 MS. NUNZIATA: Right now, yes, we
15 do.

16 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Yet some have
17 a case load of 30. Some have a lot less and
18 those numbers fluctuate. How do we some days
19 have 65 and other days we have 40?

20 MS. FEINGOLD: You don't have
21 that drastic drop, 65 to 40, number one. You
22 might have 65 to 63. You have a drop because
23 you have people who are out on maternity
24 leave. You have a drop because people who are
25 out on medical leave. That's why you have a

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 drop.

3 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Right now do
4 we have that drop? I really want to know how
5 many --

6 MS. FEINGOLD: You have a drop
7 between 65 to 62. That's what you have a drop
8 of. When you count. When you count that.
9 You have a drop because you count how many
10 vacant lines you have because lines that can't
11 be filled. That's where you have a count.
12 That's where you have your count. You have a
13 drop when you ask how come a worker has 30
14 cases and a worker has 15. You have variation
15 in case loads because you have workers that
16 have different skill sets is one reason why
17 there's a variation in case loads. We try to
18 manage out the case loads. Cases are given
19 out on a rotating basis. You have to be fair
20 in how a worker gets a case.

21 A worker is given a case. When you
22 get a case, a case is given out on a rotating
23 basis within a unit. So that it's fair for
24 every worker to get a case. That's how a case
25 is given out. So, a supervisor manages a

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 worker and how they do a case. They work with
3 their worker in doing a case. Some workers
4 have a greater skill set and a supervisor
5 works with that worker in handling their
6 case. Some workers are much more proficient
7 and we work with those workers in trying to
8 get down their cases. And that's where we
9 have some problem. We don't have 50 workers
10 that have 30 cases. We don't have that. We
11 have a couple of workers that have high case
12 loads, and we are working with those workers
13 to get those cases down.

14 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I hear what
15 you're saying. My major concern is that if we
16 are lacking the number of people that we need,
17 I know you said we are hiring 11 more and it
18 will take time for training and so forth. But
19 if we need to be hiring 30 more or 40 more
20 that's what we need to be looking at. Because
21 when it comes to our children and the safety
22 of our children and the safety of these
23 families, we need to know that we have
24 enough. We need to know that you have
25 enough. Again, this isn't putting you on the

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 spot. If you need more we need to hear that
3 you need more.

4 MS. NUNZIATA: Let me tell you
5 what we did. We have approval for 11 and just
6 last week or two weeks ago, I can't remember,
7 I put in for another 20. So it is ongoing.
8 We are putting in the request. I have a
9 commitment that as we need the resources we
10 will get them. So we have 11 approved. We
11 have another 20 that just went in. Request
12 for 20. 20 additional.

13 MS. FEINGOLD: This is a
14 continuing process is what we need. We need a
15 continuing training group that goes one after
16 another after another. It's not a process
17 where you hire 30 and then you just stop.

18 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I get that.

19 MS. FEINGOLD: It takes a while
20 to train people. Going up to Rensselaer to
21 train people. And we continue with this
22 process. It takes a good three years to make
23 a case worker. This is a very, very difficult
24 job to be a case worker. There's a lot of
25 emotions involved. What our workers do to go

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 out there, the families that we service, we
3 don't want to take these children. We want to
4 build these families. We want to keep our
5 children together. We're not there to rip
6 families apart. We want to build these
7 families. We want to support them. We want
8 to keep them together. That's our job. We
9 have families too. That's not what we want to
10 do. But we can only do that with the
11 resources that we have. We're people. We're
12 human. But we need resources out there and we
13 need to continue to do that.

14 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Jeannette,
15 I'm not questioning -- I mean you all give 100
16 percent and the care and the love that you
17 have you want to do right. As do we. We want
18 to make sure that you have every single thing
19 possible that you need. Again, I don't want
20 you to think we're questioning or we're saying
21 like oh, you're not doing. If you need more
22 to do what you have to do we have to know
23 that. We have to know that to be able to give
24 you more. To do everything we can to ensure
25 the safety of these young children and these

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 families. So, that's where we are.

3 MS. NUNZIATA: I think I speak
4 for everyone at this table in saying thank you
5 for that support because we need the support.
6 We need the additional staffing. We need all
7 of you to support us in that effort. So thank
8 you.

9 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I do have
10 more but I know there's a lot of us here. I'm
11 going to let others ask some questions.
12 Anybody want to go first? Legislator
13 Schaefer.

14 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: In this
15 moment I just have one topic want to cover.
16 So, you mentioned this word I think maybe
17 once. I've certainly read about it quite a
18 bit about it over the last couple of weeks,
19 unfounded. It sounds like a word that's placed
20 on a lot of situations and nothing is then
21 done to help that child. That's what we're
22 reading. That's what we are hearing. That's
23 what we're seeing. I want to know what kind
24 of scenario ends up in an unfounded. To me,
25 I'm wondering that your hands aren't tied by

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 certain laws or things like that that you
3 can't move further within a situation to take
4 another step to help a child.

5 What would be an unfounded scenario
6 situation? When would there be an instance
7 where you weren't be able to move forward
8 because of a law? These are things that we
9 want to change in addition to getting you
10 help.

11 MS. NUNZIATA: Probably Jeannette
12 will be able to give you an example. But what
13 I can tell you is that the difference between
14 an indicated case and an unfounded case is
15 credible evidence. We have to be able to show
16 pictures and documents and all of that to try
17 to get a case indicated. Sometimes we will go
18 out on a case and we may find that -- people
19 call in these cases for many, many different
20 reasons. So sometimes we may get a case that
21 says there is no food in the house. Okay?
22 And that the children come to school hungry.
23 Obviously we have to do an investigation.

24 We may go to the house and find
25 that there is food in that refrigerator. But

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 we may go to the school and they may say the
3 kid is always hungry. So then we have to
4 continue to dig a little deeper to find out
5 what is happening there. Then we have to
6 widen the investigation.

7 So, we don't go and make a
8 determination. As Jeannette said, we have 60
9 days once we have determined that the child is
10 not at imminent risk we have 60 days to
11 decide. But our job is to produce for the
12 courts credible evidence and then they decide
13 what's credible.

14 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: After you
15 have a situation like that, after you get say
16 a phone call about something like that
17 example, how long before you're going to the
18 house to check on that?

19 MS. NUNZIATA: We have to go out
20 in 24 hours on every call.

21 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: Then I
22 would assume you are interviewing a teacher at
23 school as well to find out where they're
24 coming from because they're making allegations
25 of child abuse to start with?

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 MS. NUNZIATA: Absolutely. We
3 are interviewing everybody to make a
4 determination as to what we're told by perhaps
5 the parents and what is being told by the
6 school or anyone else. We interview
7 neighbors. We interview anybody that we need
8 to speak to.

9 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: I know this
10 is kind of a broad question. Where do you
11 think a lot of the disconnect is? Where is
12 there a disconnect that is resulting in
13 situations like, God help us, this? I'm sure
14 this is not the first time something like this
15 has happened. I know it isn't. This is one
16 that's in the news right now and this should
17 never happen.

18 MS. NUNZIATA: It's really hard
19 for me to comment on that because every
20 situation is very different and it's very
21 unique. Even a report of there's no food in
22 the home, that kind of a report could look
23 different depending upon the family and
24 depending upon what is going on. So I can't
25 say with 100 percent certainty where the gaps

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 are.

3 What I can say is that what we do
4 is gather the information. If we have to go
5 to court with it we give the court the
6 information. They then make determinations
7 and they make recommendations.

8 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: If you go
9 to court with credible evidence how often do
10 you find that the court ends up -- like what
11 do they do? Do they mandate that you remove
12 the child? Does it happen often? Does it
13 not?

14 MS. FEINGOLD: Not always does
15 the court agree with us.

16 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: Even with
17 credible evidence? What you're supposed to be
18 producing?

19 MS. FEINGOLD: Absolutely. So
20 when the court doesn't agree with us, they
21 will order us, they will order the child
22 returned to the home or with another party and
23 will order us, the department, to do A, B, C
24 and D and we will have to do that. That's
25 what we have to do. We might not agree with

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 it and we might appeal. Which we have
3 appealed in the past. But we have to follow
4 the court's directive. We have done that in
5 the past.

6 What everybody should know is that
7 we also have certain mandates that we have to
8 follow by OCFS because they're our governing
9 body. And what people do not understand is
10 that we cannot make any type of judgments.
11 The law is it's a minimum degree of care of
12 what the parent provides. So we might not
13 like the way a parent parents a child or cares
14 for a child, but it's a minimum degree of
15 care. So as long as they're providing
16 shelter, food, clothing, education and housing
17 then it's okay. As long as they're meeting
18 that minimum degree of care they're meeting
19 the standard.

20 MS. NUNZIATA: One of the other
21 things that I want to mention to you is that
22 in light of recent events I have been asked to
23 put together a child welfare panel. What we
24 are doing is, we have a couple of leaders in
25 the child welfare community here in Nassau

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 County that will be working with me to take a
3 look at our system. Take a look at the system
4 to see if there are any service gaps. See
5 where we can make changes, make improvements
6 et cetera. I have some of the names. I can't
7 announce them yet but you will be hearing
8 about that shortly.

9 LEGISLATOR SCHAEFER: Whereabouts
10 are the people going to be from?

11 MS. NUNZIATA: Actually they're
12 from the provider community. People that --
13 other organizations that have been doing this
14 work for quite some time.

15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Jeannette,
16 could I just ask you to, I know you said like
17 a name is given to the state and then the
18 state sees where the county is then you're
19 notified. Is that the only way? Like if
20 somebody calls the Department of Social
21 Services and says -- if I picked up the phone
22 and said, you know, my neighbor, the situation
23 with my neighbor's house is really bad or
24 whatever. Do you say to me like oh, you have
25 to call this number in the state? Or can you

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 just address it immediately?

3 MS. FEINGOLD: The law is that we
4 cannot go out and do an investigation without
5 a report coming in to the state central
6 registry. So we would discuss it with you.
7 Tell you that a report has to be made to the
8 state central registry. So we would go over
9 that with you. We would give you the number
10 to the state central registry and tell you
11 that a report has to be made.

12 There are times, because we have
13 our registry unit that talks to people, and
14 because we are also an educational unit, our
15 registry unit, so we speak to the public and
16 help them. And also as a social services
17 area, due to the new law, we do, if someone
18 leaves a message on a machine we can't ignore
19 that message, we then take that information
20 and make a report to the state central
21 registry. But we cannot just go out.

22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: You have to
23 go through the state?

24 MS. FEINGOLD: That is the only
25 way that we can go out. A report has to come

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 through the state central registry. That's
3 the law. Even the police can't call us and
4 say I have this person yada, yada, yada. I
5 tell the police you have to call the state
6 central registry. First of all, the police
7 are a mandated reporter so they should know
8 better. But they have to make the report.

9 MS. NUNZIATA: Just a reminder.
10 It's New York State OCFS, Office of Children
11 and Family Services, that really sets all
12 these mandates. We are kind of a branch or
13 them. They monitor everything we do and we
14 are answerable to them. So the process that
15 Jeannette just laid out is their process that
16 we must follow. We are mandated to follow.

17 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Legislator
18 Kennedy.

19 LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: Thank you
20 Legislator Walker. Hi. Question just popped
21 into my head based on what was just said. The
22 challenges that you're faced with, do you feel
23 that your mission is hindered by existing law
24 or by policy or are there other things that
25 you see as being getting in the way so to

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 speak?

3 MS. NUNZIATA: No. I don't think
4 there's anything that I've seen on a local
5 level that would get in the way. I think that
6 the state -- remember, we have to essentially
7 follow what they tell us when it comes to
8 child protective services. So if there are
9 any changes that are made in policy and
10 procedure it's generated from New York State
11 OCFS. That's the way that it works.

12 LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: From the
13 state. Okay. I was also wondering, do we or
14 I should say how many case workers are in the
15 county's employ who are trained to work with
16 children who may not be able to communicate?
17 Such as children with autism and other
18 disabilities.

19 MS. NUNZIATA: I don't know the
20 exact number but I can definitely get back to
21 you and I will get back to you in writing.

22 LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: Thank you.
23 I was wondering what kind of experience do
24 some of the case workers have who -- there was
25 mentioned that some case workers have as many

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 as 30 cases. I'm just curious as to what
3 additional experience do case workers have
4 that would get them to accumulate that many
5 cases? And what is it that maybe some case
6 workers might be missing and might need as far
7 as training is concerned to put them in a
8 position where they could handle more case
9 load?

10 MS. NUNZIATA: The staff could
11 vary in terms of, first of all, educational
12 levels and experience levels. And what we do,
13 again, regardless of where they are -- and in
14 any department you're going to have folks that
15 have been with the department for many years
16 and have been doing CPS work for a long time
17 and others that are new to the department. So
18 our job really is to keep training people so
19 that we can make sure that at some point
20 everybody reaches a certain level of
21 competency and comfortability with the work.

22 The work in CPS is probably among
23 one of the most difficult departments to work
24 in. Just like our APS unit. These are folks
25 that could be, you know, that are at high

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 risk, our children and our older adults. So
3 the training becomes very, very important and
4 we have a pretty robust training program.

5 LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: One other
6 question. As far as when case workers visit
7 homes, I was just wondering what is the
8 protocol speaking with the children, speaking
9 with neighbors, teachers?

10 MS. FEINGOLD: First of all, when
11 we get a case our case workers go out
12 unannounced. They have training in
13 interviewing skills to interview with the
14 children. And it depends upon the
15 allegations. Because at times they might
16 interview, depending upon the allegations, to
17 interview the children at school. Because you
18 want to interview the children at a safe
19 setting sometimes away from the parents. Even
20 when they interview the children at home you
21 want to interview them away from the parents
22 so they feel comfortable in speaking with
23 regard to the allegations.

24 They review the allegations with
25 the children and the parents separately. They

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 interview them separately. They don't
3 interview them together. And they review the
4 allegations. So they ask them -- they read
5 the allegations to them line by line. They
6 read the allegation and they review it and ask
7 them exactly what happened. Both with parents
8 and with children. That's a traditional
9 investigation for CPS.

10 For FAR, for the Family Assessment
11 Response, because, if you recall, I said there
12 are traditional investigations and FAR. The
13 difference with FAR, because CPS is
14 involuntary and FAR is a voluntary approach,
15 FAR is a family approach and that's an
16 engagement approach where you're not
17 addressing allegations, you're addressing the
18 fact that there is a concern. There is a
19 concern. So how can we identify the concern
20 and help find a resolution to it. So there's
21 two different approaches. And FAR started in
22 2012. So our FAR approach started in 2012.
23 That's the difference.

24 LEGISLATOR KENNEDY: Thank you.
25 That's all I have right now.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I know you
3 said there are -- you have scheduled and
4 unscheduled and especially when it comes time
5 for investigation. But on a regular basis do
6 the case workers go out and -- excuse me
7 please -- do the case workers go out announced
8 or unannounced? If I know I'm having company
9 at my house I make sure I clean my house,
10 everything looks nice. You have everything
11 you need. Do you make unscheduled visits?
12 This is when you have a case established. How
13 often do you go? Do you go all different
14 times of the day? Do you go in the evening?
15 Early in the mornings?

16 MS. FEINGOLD: For investigations
17 when we get a case it's unannounced and we go
18 at all different times. The reason is you
19 have allegations. So the whole point of the
20 allegations is because you have to see what
21 the allegations are and you want to see if in
22 fact they're true or not true. So, some of
23 the allegations could be that the house is
24 filthy. There's dirty dishes all over the
25 place. The clothes are all out. There's

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 drugs all over the place.

3 So if you're making an appointment,
4 then the place could be sparkling clean and
5 you're not going to be able to see if any of
6 that is true. So we go unannounced. Further
7 along down the case it could be that we make
8 appointments. But for initial investigations
9 that's how we do it. That's the protocol.

10 LEGISLATOR WALKER: You don't
11 think that would be beneficial to continue to
12 do throughout? If you have a case that you go
13 at all different times unannounced?

14 MS. FEINGOLD: That's what we do,
15 unannounced. It depends on the
16 circumstances. If we can't catch up with
17 somebody eventually we make appointments. But
18 during the night and weekends that's what we
19 do. That's what we have to do.

20 MS. NUNZIATA: If I could just
21 add, in the time that the case is active with
22 us, that first 24 hours, seven days, 60 days,
23 we are constantly monitoring that situation.
24 If there are any changes or anything that we
25 perceive that begins to be problematic, then

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 of course we may not keep appointments and we
3 may just show up unannounced. Again, it
4 depends on the circumstances. But know that
5 we are monitoring those case at all times.

6 MS. FEINGOLD: Let me say this is
7 very quick paced investigations. Cases are
8 coming in and in and in. We don't have time
9 to sit there and make appointments. The
10 workers are in the field and they're getting
11 another case. They're running from one case
12 to the next case to the next case. They can't
13 sit there and make appointments. That's what
14 they're doing.

15 On occasion an appointment is
16 made. If there's an appointment at a school,
17 something like that. School meeting or a
18 meeting at a counseling agency or something
19 like that. But they're running from one case
20 to the next during investigations. It's
21 different in a preventive program or ongoing
22 where it's established case load where they
23 have something like that. So it's a little
24 different.

25 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Legislator

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Gaylor.

3 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: Thank you
4 very much. Couple of quick questions.
5 Welcome to Nassau County by the way
6 Commissioner. You come at a great time
7 because it's a time where a new set of eyes
8 can look at a system that may be
9 overburdened. I don't know. Maybe not.

10 I'm most concerned by what I heard
11 as far as your testimony concerning it's not
12 the best system. What you hope for is to try
13 to get numbers down. But what exactly is your
14 plan? You should have a plan I would think, a
15 very detailed plan, on how to reduce the case
16 work load for somebody who has 30 versus
17 somebody who has ten cases. To me it seems
18 very easy. Just take a case away from
19 somebody and give it to somebody else. You
20 keep doing that until you average it out to
21 what you think is appropriate. 12 to 15.

22 Because somebody with 30 cases,
23 even if they have more experience or more
24 training or more seniority, in my opinion
25 would seem to be overworked, overburdened and

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 then maybe not able to do a thorough job as
3 they would like to do because they've got to
4 be running from one call to the next when
5 they're getting in the car and moving.
6 There's eight hours in a day. That's where I
7 have some concern. I would like to hear your
8 thoughts on what specifically is the plan to
9 bring that average number down to prevent
10 somebody from having 30.

11 MS. NUNZIATA: Last week I met
12 with all of the CPS staff and one of the
13 things that they brought up was exactly that
14 issue. Which is they need help. They're
15 happy to hear about the 11 staff that have
16 been approved but that they need help.

17 One of the things I'm in the
18 process of doing is taking a look at within
19 the Child Welfare Unit and that unit where we
20 can maybe move some cases. They really need
21 help in the field because there's a lot of
22 time spent when you've got to go out there and
23 make those assessments.

24 So I am actively working on seeing
25 where we can move some of those cases to

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 perhaps folks that work in child welfare
3 services but don't have the extensive field
4 work. I'm looking at that right now. The
5 overall plan obviously is to continue to
6 increase the staff and really do a rolling
7 training.

8 As I said to you, I already put in
9 for another 20 positions because we lose
10 people all the time. We lose people because
11 of salaries or we have a fair number of people
12 that retire or somebody gets sick. Those are
13 things that we can't predict but we need to
14 plan for.

15 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR:
16 Approximately, if you know, you may not, how
17 many case workers have 30 or more cases
18 currently?

19 MS. NUNZIATA: I don't know the
20 number offhand but I can get back to you for
21 sure on that.

22 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: Do you think
23 it's a dozen?

24 MS. NUNZIATA: No. It's a small
25 number.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: On one hand?

3 MS. NUNZIATA: I think so.

4 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: Do we provide
5 some supervisory oversight to somebody with 30
6 cases?

7 MS. FEINGOLD: Yes, we do.

8 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: And how? In
9 what capacity?

10 MS. FEINGOLD: Let me see. Well,
11 they're monitored quite closely. They're sat
12 with. Their cases are reviewed. They're
13 detailed daily basis on what they should be
14 doing with their cases. On what they should
15 be handing in on a daily basis. What cases
16 they should be going out with. So they're
17 really handled with kid gloves on what they
18 should be doing.

19 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: As you've
20 indicated you report to the state. Basically
21 OCFS. Do you provide a monthly, a weekly a
22 daily report on the activity?

23 MS. NUNZIATA: No. They actually
24 gather our numbers as we enter into the case
25 record system and all. They collect our data

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 and statistics. They issue reports.

3 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: You don't
4 produce a report yourself?

5 MS. NUNZIATA: For them?

6 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: For anybody.

7 MS. NUNZIATA: Not for OCFS to my
8 knowledge. But we receive plenty of reports
9 from them. They collect our numbers because
10 we use their system. Then when we get those
11 numbers, if they give them to us however
12 monthly or quarterly then I would be reviewing
13 them with Jeannette and now Maria.

14 LEGISLATOR GAYLOR: Thank you.

15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Legislator
16 Bynoe.

17 LEGISLATOR BYNOE: Thank you
18 Chairwoman. Good evening Commissioner and
19 those accompanied. I have a couple of
20 questions in the interest of trying to make
21 sure that the public has an opportunity to ask
22 questions.

23 The more you call out the more time
24 it's going to take me to get through my
25 questions.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 I want to talk a little bit about
3 the training experience. You have 11
4 positions that were previously approved. You
5 requested an additional 20; is that correct?

6 MS. NUNZIATA: Correct.

7 LEGISLATOR BYNOE: That's 31
8 workers. Explain to me what a training
9 process looks like in terms of the time that
10 someone is hired to the time in which they
11 will actually be able to manage cases. What
12 is the training period?

13 MS. NUNZIATA: I'm going to again
14 refer to Jeannette because she has these folks
15 and puts them right through.

16 MS. FEINGOLD: What happens, once
17 they start, like we said, it's a seven-week
18 core program up in Rensselaer. But when they
19 start they first start with us. It's CBT
20 training. They start on the computer. So
21 they get a little familiarized with that.
22 They go up to the Rensselaer. When I say
23 seven weeks they go three days here. Then
24 they're with us. They take some training in
25 our agency. Three days up in Rensselaer.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Then when they are with our agency
3 they do some in classroom training. They do
4 some on computer training and they shadow some
5 of our workers in the field. And they are
6 sitting with our staff. They're reading case
7 records. They're coming into removal meetings
8 with us. They're sitting in case of the
9 week. So they're following us around.

10 But the mere part is that they are
11 going with out staff shadowing. They're not
12 doing anything but they're shadowing. They're
13 getting the experience trained. Not only with
14 CPS but with foster care and preventive
15 services. They're doing that. They're doing
16 that for the first seven weeks. They're
17 getting the full flavor of that.

18 Then infused with that they get
19 domestic violence training. They get opioid
20 training. They get substance abuse. They go
21 to the safe center. So they also go with sex
22 abuse. They go with physical abuse.

23 I don't know if you can hear me
24 because of that.

25 But they get all of that training.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 So they get the full flavor on it. And not
3 until I guess about four months into that then
4 we give them one case. But the one case that
5 they have they work with a case worker. So
6 they go out and they do the interview. So
7 when they do the interview with the case
8 worker they do the interview as well as the
9 case worker does the interview. So they each
10 write up a progress note and they're with the
11 training supervisor. Not only are they with
12 the training supervisor, they're with the
13 supervisor from staff development. So they
14 have a dual person doing it.

15 So they're with a group of people
16 amongst their peers as well. So they do
17 that. And although they're done with --
18 although I say seven weeks it's really 14
19 weeks because of the three days on and two
20 days off. So they do that. And with us it
21 turns out to be nine months with Nassau for
22 training.

23 LEGISLATOR BYNOE: Thank you for
24 that thorough answer. One other question. We
25 know that OCFS would state that you should

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 have no more than 12 to 15 cases. Is there a
3 professional standard that might differ from
4 that?

5 MS. NUNZIATA: They recommended
6 12 to 15 cases. As far as we know, there is
7 no state mandate. All the state regs say is
8 sufficient number of staff. They don't
9 specify any particular mandate. So the
10 recommended case load is 12 so 15.

11 LEGISLATOR BYNOE: Thank you very
12 much.

13 LEGISLATOR WALKER: We have one
14 more legislator to ask questions and then it's
15 public comment. Legislator Drucker.

16 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Thank you
17 Chairwoman Walker. I will try to keep it
18 brief.

19 Jeannette, Legislator Gaylor -- I'm
20 sure that each of you when you have an
21 opportunity to speak would like your comments
22 to not be overshadowed by people shouting
23 out. I would hope you would give the same
24 respect.

25 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I told you we

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 have one more legislator to ask questions.

3 Then the public comment will begin.

4 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Let's wait
5 it out.

6 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I don't know
7 what you're talking about 60 percent of the
8 time. If I have to stay here until three
9 o'clock in the morning to hear all of you I
10 will.

11 Legislator Drucker. Give
12 Legislator Drucker the courtesy. Legislator
13 Drucker could have been finished with his
14 questions by now and had the public speaking.

15 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Jeannette,
16 you talked about balancing the case load. Can
17 you hear me?

18 Jeannette you talked about
19 balancing the case load. This is a follow-up
20 to Legislator Gaylor asked that question and I
21 appreciate your answer. But you talk about a
22 rotation and how you're assigning the cases.
23 I'm curious how someone does get to 30 if
24 you're doing a rotation. Why can't it be more
25 balanced? Are you doing it per case deciding

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 which one a case worker is more qualified to
3 handle or are you trying just to balance it
4 out? I know Nancy you explained there are
5 times when you are down some staffing. But
6 when you're assigning the case load why can't
7 it be more balanced? Why does there have to
8 be such a disparity? Almost two to one. Does
9 it have to do with qualifications or just the
10 way your system -- how are you determining
11 that ratio?

12 MS. FEINGOLD: When we assign
13 cases it goes on a rotation so it's fair and
14 equitable to all the case workers.

15 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: How is it
16 fair and equitable for someone to have 30 and
17 someone to have 15?

18 MS. FEINGOLD: When there are
19 times we pull a case out of rotation based
20 upon the allegations if it might be more
21 suitable due to the skills of a worker for
22 them to handle a case. If we kept assigning
23 cases to workers based upon their case load it
24 would never be fair and equitable because of
25 the way cases -- because of the way workers

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 would handle their cases. It would be unfair
3 for workers. Because workers who handle cases
4 quicker -- you just couldn't distribute cases
5 that way because the way a case load works a
6 worker couldn't handle a case load that way.
7 It has to be a fair and equal distribution
8 among cases to go that way.

9 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: So it's
10 basically a subjective evaluation that you
11 make on each particular case to determine
12 which case worker could handle more cases than
13 someone else?

14 MS. FEINGOLD: No. It's just a
15 fair and equitable distribution. There are
16 times when we pull cases from workers but it
17 has to be an equal rotation just across the
18 floor. Even when we distribute cases across
19 the floor it has to be an equal distribution
20 across the floor.

21 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: So the
22 disparity then is fair and equitable in your
23 opinion then when someone has 30 and someone
24 has 15?

25 MS. FEINGOLD: That's the way the

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 case load is managed.

3 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: No. It's
4 also the way it's assigned.

5 MS. FEINGOLD: No. Absolutely
6 not. It's assigned fair and equitable.

7 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: That's what
8 I'm asking you. How is assigned fair and
9 equitable if someone has 30 and someone has
10 15?

11 MS. FEINGOLD: It depends upon
12 the management of the case.

13 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: I guess
14 we're going in circles there. Let me go to my
15 next question. Before I get to that question,
16 what has to occur before a report of abuse or
17 neglect is determined to be unfounded? What
18 actually has to happen.

19 MS. NUNZIATA: We have to do a
20 complete investigation.

21 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: What are the
22 factors that will lead you to make that
23 determination after 60 days?

24 MS. NUNZIATA: It depends on
25 whether we can provide credible evidence or

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 not as outlined by OCFS and the laws that
3 mandate us.

4 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: You also
5 stated that the reports can look very
6 different depending on the circumstances when
7 you conduct your visits or interview; isn't
8 that correct.

9 MS. NUNZIATA: Sure. Every case
10 is different.

11 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: Would you
12 agree that our teachers and our educators
13 provide the most accurate, definitive
14 assessment of a particular situation?

15 MS. NUNZIATA: I don't know that
16 I can say that. I really can't comment on
17 that.

18 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: I
19 understand. I imagine that, in my opinion,
20 teachers and educators who see these kids come
21 to school every single day can have a much
22 better assessment of what's going on and they
23 interview that one or two interviews that
24 occur. I just wanted to know how much weight
25 or reliance are you giving to reports that are

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 made by teachers and educators or that they
3 corroborate a report of neglect or abuse?

4 MS. NUNZIATA: Listen, it depends
5 on the case. One of the reasons why we do an
6 exhaustive investigation that involves
7 provides going to children's school and
8 speaking to school staff is because obviously
9 we want to hear what they say. So it
10 definitely weighs into whether we believe we
11 have the credible evidence. And certainly
12 whether the court does. Because at the end of
13 the day that's where it stops for us, at the
14 court.

15 LEGISLATOR DRUCKER: I appreciate
16 that. The only reason I'm really asking these
17 questions because we can't help but compare
18 about what happened in Suffolk County and
19 that's why I'm asking those questions. In
20 those situations there were a lot of reports.

21 I'm going to defer. Not ask some
22 of the other questions I have.

23 LEGISLATOR WALKER: I'm going to
24 ask our first speaker to come to the
25 microphone and I would ask Justyna Zubko-Valva

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 to come to the microphone. All I can tell you
3 is that certainly our hearts go out to you and
4 our thoughts and prayers are with you and just
5 know that God bless you. We just want to do
6 whatever we can.

7 MS. ZUBKO-VALVA: Thank you so
8 much. I appreciate that. I'm running with a
9 severe cold but I'm here obviously for my son
10 Tommy because what happened to him was
11 preventable. And I'm here on behalf of all
12 other innocent children that are in the same
13 position as Tommy and my two other kids were
14 and obviously three other girls involved in
15 the situation that cannot speak for
16 themselves. They need extreme help because
17 the people, the institutions supposed to
18 protect them. Make sure they safe and
19 actually were protecting the abusers.

20 It's hard to listen to explanations
21 provided by Nassau County CPS in regards to
22 understaffing. It's a problem for this
23 organization. I think the biggest concern
24 that we all should think about is the
25 corruption inside the organization. As you

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 know, when it comes to corruption there is no
3 room for justice. No room for truth. There
4 is no room for unbiased. I mean, corruption
5 just destroys everything. No matter what
6 evidence you have in a case, no matter what
7 arguments are you going to provide this based
8 on 100 percent evidence, it's always going to
9 be not enough.

10 And most of the time when it
11 happened, my case, my cry for help for my
12 children, was being turned against me. So let
13 me just speak about my story a little bit.
14 What happened to me and my children. Maybe
15 this way you can all understand where I'm
16 coming from. What happened in this case.

17 I just want to start from obviously
18 many people have questions how come the
19 children were removed from loving and caring
20 mother who took care of them since they were
21 born and how come this was possible. Well,
22 when the divorce proceeding started obviously
23 the first judge on the case, Judge Ricipiano,
24 he did not even grant to the father overnight
25 visitations based upon the evidence of

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 hardcore pornography addiction that I
3 presented to the court. The case went to
4 Judge Zimmerman.

5 Judge Zimmerman issued fictional
6 temporary order of protection against me on
7 September 6, 2017. That fictional document
8 was not in the court minutes, not in the
9 Department of Justice registry. Everything
10 was done so immediately and brutally to remove
11 my children from under my care and place them
12 with the abuser father.

13 Two weeks later, on September 20,
14 2017, another fictional order of protection
15 was issued against me that allow me to have
16 unsupervised visitation with my children based
17 on the stipulation that was signed by all the
18 parties involving Judge Zimmerman.

19 Now you see the contradiction in
20 those two issued orders. First order
21 completely depriving me from any contact with
22 my children. Ability to even speak with them
23 or contacting their school or place where they
24 were living to the point that I was able to
25 pick them up and actually spend few hours once

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 a week.

3 After Judge Zimmerman removed
4 herself from this case and the case went to
5 Judge Lawrence. Unfortunately that did not
6 stop the corruption. In order to justify the
7 removal of my children, the father filed false
8 allegations against me with Suffolk County
9 CPS. The case was opened. On January 14,
10 2018 during one of my visitations I discover
11 on Tommy, my angel who is in heaven now,
12 enormous injuries on his body. The area of
13 buttocks. I discover black and -- bruises,
14 coagulated blood spots, injuries, dark red
15 marks. I took a picture of it. I call my
16 friend Kathy, who is my neighbor, to obviously
17 see the signs of injuries.

18 After I drop off the kids to their
19 father's home I reported the case to CPS.
20 Unfortunately the CPS case worker, Michelle
21 Clark from Suffolk County CPS, she retaliate
22 against me and three days later she went to
23 the court and file two neglect petitions. One
24 against me and one against the father. The
25 false allegations against me took me almost a

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 year and a half to defend myself in court.
3 When I did not have attorney I presented
4 myself. But I always extended for the truth
5 and always had all the evidence in the case.

6 As a result of it, in April 12,
7 2019, all the allegations, false allegations
8 were dismissed.

9 Now in terms of the father he was
10 never arrested. The children were never
11 removed from under his abusive and sadistic
12 care. As well as he only received regular
13 order of protection and classes from the
14 library. The punishment was a joke. You
15 know, once that happened during the neglect
16 proceeding, actually judge from Suffolk County
17 Family Court he recognized that I was fit
18 mother and he issued on March 6, 2018 he
19 issued order that allow me to have
20 unsupervised visitation with my children. He
21 only told me to go to Nassau County Supreme
22 Court Judge Lawrence and ask for schedule.

23 But Judge Lawrence, being obviously
24 so enormously influenced by already corruption
25 that was taking place in my case, refused to

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 obey the higher court order because the
3 neglect case takes a priority over the divorce
4 case. Then he purposely and deliberately did
5 not allow me to see my children for almost two
6 years.

7 I kept addressing on the record,
8 and you can check the court minutes, every
9 single time the severe abuse of my children
10 from the hands of their father. I kept
11 informing him, begging on the court records to
12 immediately remove the children from under
13 abusive, sadistic care of their father because
14 the children are going to die. They're not
15 safe. They come to school looking for food on
16 the classroom floor. In the garbage. They
17 wear diapers even though they were potty
18 trained at two years old. At some point there
19 are medical records that only show less than
20 one percent body mass index which indicates
21 almost starvation to death. Basically, all my
22 cries for help for my children was just being
23 dismissed and was left without any answer.

24 The attorney for the children, Dana
25 McCabe, she always acted like the best friend

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 of my husband's attorney. There's no secret
3 she's got very high powered brother who is
4 very high powered person in FBI and all this
5 connections, corruption, influence, caused
6 Tommy to die.

7 I strongly stand by fighting for
8 justice for Tommy. Having all those people
9 who were involved in case involving my family
10 who did absolutely nothing to help my
11 children, who knew about the severe abuse, who
12 completely failed to address my concerns, my
13 enormous pleadings for help for my children, I
14 want them to be held accountable. They should
15 be charged criminally to the highest extent of
16 the law. Just because somebody is a judge or
17 prosecutor or holds this powerful position in
18 the government it doesn't mean that somebody
19 is above the law. Because we have to protect
20 our children who cannot speak for themselves.

21 If it comes to Nassau County CPS,
22 obviously I was dealing most of the time with
23 Suffolk County CPS, which a lot of information
24 that's in the media, the reports, the most
25 severe reports, which I want to read you one,

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 were closed the next day without any
3 investigation. Just as explanation was a
4 duplicate report. That's why all CPS workers
5 were able to go around the system to make sure
6 the investigation is never going to be
7 initiated. Even though they are responsible
8 to conduct 60-day investigation. Interview
9 all the people involved. Interview the person
10 who reported the allegations.

11 The report that was filed on
12 February 27, 2019, which was closed the next
13 day without any investigation, was the report
14 that was still filed when the father of my
15 children had order of protection that was
16 issued by Judge Shank. Unfortunately he was
17 not arrested and the children were never
18 removed from his abusive care.

19 The report reads, For the past week
20 Anthony, nine years old, has been coming to
21 school with his clothes and backpack soaked in
22 urine. Anthony has been staying in the garage
23 and is not allowed in his room due to him
24 urinating in his bed. As a result of the
25 child being soaked in urine, he has a fowl

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 odor and is extremely cold. Stepmother Angela
3 and father Michael are aware that the child is
4 arriving at school soiled and failed to
5 adequately address the concern. The child's
6 feet and hands are bright red, but it's
7 unknown if this is a result of the child being
8 soaked in urine. There are five other
9 children in home, names and ages unknown, that
10 have unknown roles at this time.

11 Obviously the seven day follow-up
12 was never completed. It actually, on this
13 report, which I have a document, it says the
14 termination was suspended and closed as
15 duplicate. That's how those CPS case workers
16 got away with not investigating this extremely
17 severe report of abuse, which, as you know,
18 what caused Tommy's death, hypothermia in the
19 garage. So there were already indicators that
20 the children were kept in the garage, that the
21 CPS knew about it since February. But I
22 believe it was for much longer period of
23 time.

24 The next report filed not even a
25 month later also closed without any

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 investigation. Also closed as a duplicate and
3 also the termination was listed here as
4 suspended.

5 Anthony, nine, is on the autism
6 spectrum. For the last couple of weeks the
7 stepparent Angela and father Michael have
8 encouraged Anthony to scream and keep quiet
9 while getting off the bus. The stepparent and
10 father do not adequately feed Anthony or
11 Thomas, seven years old. As a result, the
12 children have lost weight. The children are
13 frequently hungry, beg for food and eat food
14 out of the garbage.

15 As a formal punishment, the
16 stepparent and father forced Anthony to stay
17 in the garage for excessive periods of time.
18 There is no heat in the garage and is cold.
19 On unknown date, Thomas sustained bruise on
20 his left eye. No explanations were provided
21 making the injury suspicious. The stepparent
22 and father will be made alleged subject and
23 mother, obviously me, and listed all other
24 children unknown.

25 The last report -- obviously those

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 reports to my knowledge are on 20. There are
3 probably more but those are the ones that I
4 requested the records from state central
5 registry. They were provided to me.

6 The last report was filed November
7 18, 2019. CPS had 60 days to investigate. In
8 this report, I was on the phone with actually
9 the supervisor of the CPS case worker Jen
10 Montal, January 7th. Which was ten days
11 before Tommy's death. And I beg her to not
12 close those reports because there is a history
13 of severe abuse and she has to look back and
14 she has to follow each report that was filed.
15 And if the children are not going to be
16 removed they going to die. They're not safe
17 where they are.

18 She only told me that children have
19 scratches on their faces because they play
20 football. That's what the father claimed. I
21 said to her that it's impossible because when
22 you play football you wear helmet on.
23 Whatever she was trying to through the
24 information transparent to me was completely
25 different than what the report stated. I

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 going to read you the report.

3 Thomas, age eight, has bruises and
4 abrasions all over his face.

5 So he wasn't scratched, right?

6 Anthony, age ten, has bruises near
7 his left eye and ear. Explanation for the
8 injuries are suspicious in nature. Therefore
9 Michael father and Angela, mother of those
10 three girls, will be the alleged subjects.
11 Thomas and Anthony are treated differently in
12 the family. The mother and father ration how
13 much food Tommy and Anthony are allowed to
14 eat. As a result, the children are very pale
15 and underweight. The children are always
16 hungry and begging for food. The loss of
17 Angela age six, Gia age seven -- I'm not going
18 to obviously list. And me an unknown.

19 What I can tell you from my
20 personal experience, the only way you can help
21 children is to stop the corruption that does
22 exist inside the CPS. Inside the court
23 system. We're talking about the web of
24 corruption. We're talking about courts,
25 police, DA's office, CPS.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 I went everywhere begging for help
3 for my children. I file numerous complaints
4 hoping that there is only one person, one
5 institution who's going to fight for my
6 children, who is going to hear my story and
7 they going to interview what is the time to
8 save my kid's life. This was preventable.

9 In 2016 there was severe strong
10 allegations with regard to sexual abuse of my
11 children. I went to Cohen's Children's
12 Hospital where the specimen was taken
13 obviously from three of my children. The
14 doctor who did obviously the kids he told me
15 he has to hold the test results and give it to
16 the detectives to be tested. Those specimens
17 were never tested. The Nassau County
18 detectives never came to pick up to be given
19 to the lab.

20 Then you have the reports where my
21 son was coming to school bent in half, with
22 his tushy hurts, with finger marks on his
23 arms. The children were sexually abused and
24 father and Angela receiving enormous amounts
25 of money under accounts ranging from 30,000 to

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 130,000 a month.

3 I do hope there's going to be
4 federal investigation in regards to extreme
5 abuse of my kids. Extreme. What those kids
6 went through God only knows. It's going to
7 take such a long time for their healing
8 process to be completed. But there are more
9 children out there that needs to be saved.
10 More loving parents that are the victims of
11 this corrupted system. All the judges in my
12 case have to be held accountable. We still
13 have Donna McCabe on the case, who completely
14 failed to help my children. Who laugh at me
15 when I address the abuse of my kids with the
16 courts.

17 We still have Ed Heep in Suffolk
18 County Child Protective Services supervisor is
19 actually overseeing now the case involving the
20 death of Tommy. Why? Why do people who
21 should be in jail are still working? Still
22 have jobs.

23 So, just want to at the end thank
24 you everybody for love and support you have
25 been extending to us, me and my family. It

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 means so much to us. I know Tommy touched so
3 many hearts of so many people who truly care
4 about the children. Truly care about kids
5 being placed in loving and safe environment.
6 And I do hope that this is going to bring
7 changes. So let the change begin. Thank
8 you.

9 LEGISLATOR WALKER: We are going
10 to move along with public comment. Our next
11 speaker is Thomas Liotti.

12 MR. LIOTTI: Thank you very
13 much. I appreciate the fact that the
14 legislature is having this meeting tonight,
15 and I know some of you very well. And I think
16 if this were a courtroom I would probably have
17 a slightly different question that I would
18 pose to CPS and DSS. That question would be,
19 why didn't someone listen to Justyna? And
20 what caused the system to break down? That
21 wasn't answered tonight. We heard a lot of
22 bureaucratic folderol about the process and so
23 forth. But that specific question about what
24 happened here to protect Thomas or not protect
25 Thomas was never answered by CPS or DSS. Not

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 even asked. I'm going to try to answer that
3 question now.

4 I'm an attorney. I am Thomas
5 Liotti. A proactive attorney in private
6 practice for more than 42 years throughout the
7 state and nation. Usually representing
8 individuals and causes.

9 While the horrors of the Valva case
10 have driven home a point for some of us about
11 alleged neglect and incompetence of CPS and
12 DSS in cases of domestic violence and child
13 abuse, your focus, if honest, should also be
14 on a corrupt system that allows for the
15 nomination of judges who have paid for their
16 judgeships, who are chosen by political bosses
17 and lobbyists like Al D'Amato. Who are in
18 some cases cross-endorsed with no prior
19 judicial experience, like Justice Joseph H.
20 Lorentz who should be immediately removed and
21 suspended without pay from his position as a
22 supreme court justice. The same should happen
23 with respect to Justice Hope Zimmerman, who I
24 understand has retired and basically run for
25 the hills.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 But these are problems within the
3 system. It is a system not based upon merit
4 and independence. It is a system based upon
5 dependence where political parties depend for
6 their existence on campaign contributions and
7 in return dole out judgeships as a reward. It
8 is a corrupt system that allows for campaign
9 contributions to judicial campaigns by
10 lawyers, forensic psychologists and
11 accountants and attorneys for children,
12 lobbyists and litigants who expect and do
13 receive corrupt, favorable rulings and
14 assignments from a corrupt judiciary that
15 knows who has contributed to their campaigns.
16 A judiciary which does not disclose those
17 contributions or recuse themselves when
18 parties or lawyers come before them to collect
19 the favors for the contributions they have
20 made.

21 A part of the corrupt system are
22 bar associations and their judiciary
23 committees that go along with these illicit
24 practices. All lawyers, if not railing
25 against these practices, are a part of a

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 corrupt system and defy their oaths to uphold
3 the Constitution.

4 There is no psychological screening
5 of judicial candidates. Judicial candidates
6 are not required to demonstrate their
7 sensitivity to women's and children's issues
8 or even to show a modicum of respect or
9 politeness or the capacity to learn about
10 these issues and humbly admit to what they do
11 not know. Instead, we have too much arrogance
12 in a political and judicial system run by
13 political bosses.

14 I have been a village justice for
15 29 years. I am registered as a blank. When I
16 run for office every four years I do so under
17 my own party. The judicial independence
18 party. I do not solicit or accept campaign
19 contributions. I do not spend my own money.
20 I encourage others to run against me. No one
21 has except for my first campaign. I run on my
22 record, which is what all judicial and other
23 candidates should do. Thank you very much.

24 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.
25 Jennifer Melnick.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 MS. MELNICK: First, I want to
3 offer my condolences to Thomas Valva's mother
4 and brothers.

5 My name is Jennifer Melnick. I'm a
6 psychotherapist in private practice and a
7 forensic social worker. I'm on the assigned
8 counsel for attorneys for children's mental
9 health panel where I'm appointed on cases in
10 family court on Long Island and the city. The
11 majority of cases I work are on abuse,
12 neglect, delinquency and PINS cases and nearly
13 all of them I have been in contact with
14 associated CPS workers.

15 What I have encountered through my
16 contact with Nassau County CPS in my opinion
17 extends beyond an issue of case load and leads
18 in to questions about training, supervision
19 and checks and balances.

20 The cases I'm brought in on are
21 already in family court. I have been involved
22 in cases where there were allegations of
23 significant educational neglect where CPS has
24 been actively involved for an extended period
25 and where the CPS worker had no knowledge that

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 the children have educational service needs
3 and that they have extensive IAPs that were
4 not being adhered to.

5 On other cases where housing was
6 the only barrier to reunification, the CPS
7 worker refused to assist the parent in
8 navigating the housing services department
9 within the same centralized building and the
10 child continued to languish in out-of-home
11 care. Basic oversight ensuring adherence to
12 the Family Court Act and OCFS guidelines would
13 have assisted in easily progressing these
14 cases and providing less detrimental
15 outcomes.

16 Generally speaking, the family
17 court process is not natural for families.
18 Counties outside of Nassau are by no means
19 problem free. But in other counties there are
20 layers of OCFS services and best practices in
21 place in an effort to insulate families with
22 preventive services. To my knowledge, there
23 are minimum intensive home-based OCFS services
24 and I have no where in many cases to refer
25 clients to unless they can travel.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 It is unrealistic to expect that
3 weekly or biweekly home visits or office
4 visits in a centralized location as opposed to
5 scattered site field offices will allow for an
6 accurate or complete picture of what's going
7 on and ensure that kids are safe at home.

8 On another note, Suffolk County and
9 New York City have interdisciplinary,
10 institutionalized legal services representing
11 children in court so that there are more eyes
12 and ears actively involved behind the scenes
13 on cases beyond the scope reported by CPS from
14 court date to court date.

15 In Nassau County, where independent
16 lawyers for children either don't know or
17 don't access assigned counsel specialized
18 services, there is not a loud enough voice for
19 children questioning the action or lack of
20 action by CPS and this puts kids at risk.

21 When there is a devastating injury
22 or fatality, full communities go on notice.
23 Everything is questioned and there's an
24 impetus for change. It should never have to
25 come to this.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 As a resident of Nassau County, I
3 hope to see a redistribution of resources that
4 put safety of children and service needs of
5 their families, particularly in underserved
6 and oppressed communities, ahead of
7 centralized models. And in my capacity on the
8 mental health panel, I'm committed to
9 continually helping to institute the necessary
10 changes on both micro and macro levels one
11 case at a time. Thank you.

12 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Dolores
13 Feliciano.

14 MS. FELICIANO: Evening. I stand
15 before you all tonight as a true witness to
16 the corruption of CPS and our family court
17 system. January 2020 has marked seven years
18 since this team wrongfully and unjustifiably
19 took and then placed my daughter into harm's
20 way. In brief this is our story.

21 I sent this to New York Post, NYAG
22 press office, Governor Cuomo, Gloria Alfred,
23 News 12, Geraldo, Fios News, Fox News. I was
24 invited to be on Dr. Phil's show. Newsday
25 reporter who took my story and turned it into

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 CPS excuses for their wrongdoings. This was
3 written August 10, 2016.

4 After four years of being
5 victimized by their harassment, neglect, lies
6 and horror, I decided to take the Suffolk
7 County CPS to Supreme Court of Appeals. In
8 2012 the agency had neglected to investigate
9 an open case called in by my daughter's
10 pediatrician regarding having been abused in
11 her father's household. Additionally, the
12 Fifth Precinct child advocate agency felt
13 compelled to call CPS due to my daughter's
14 distressful phone calls. Yet stated that they
15 couldn't open a case because there was no
16 physical evidence.

17 Since I challenged the county on
18 their negligence of that case, they had talked
19 their way into getting an OP, order of
20 protection, granted against me without an
21 investigation. Furthermore, having both my
22 children taken away from me and their home in
23 order to cover up their mistakes. How they
24 did this was another horrific story itself.

25 Yet my oldest was returned home

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 soon after trying to get them to prove their
3 accusations when in reality they withdrew from
4 an indication hearing while vacating the OP
5 and supervised sibling visits. How can this
6 be if I was accused of being harmful? The
7 county had gone out of their way to try and
8 have me either go broke, break down or be
9 arrested to have this closed. Not to mention
10 the people they used to help them to cover
11 up. Court attorneys, medical evaluation,
12 forensic evaluation, civilians, politics,
13 media and last but not least, retired law
14 enforcement.

15 My trial against them -- please let
16 me finish -- my trial against them was
17 granted. The testimony was poor due to no
18 fact finding and contradicting inaccurate
19 medical evaluation. Yet a trial ceased to
20 commence. Two months later my attorney
21 forfeited to cross-exam the doctor, the county
22 and to further with the trial. Instead
23 conspired with the county to have me coerced
24 to primarily take stipulations in order for
25 them to want to withdraw the case when they

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 had already withdrew from an indication
3 hearing.

4 After five attorneys and my entire
5 life savings, I realized that I needed to turn
6 to the aid of the Supreme Court of Appeals.
7 How can I, a noncriminal, school official, as
8 well as a security official having had a ten
9 year background in security checks, kept from
10 seeing my child unjustifiably by the courts
11 for three years now. That was back in 2016.

12 The appellate division took my case
13 and granted me a court-appointed attorney. I
14 wrote this myself. I wrote this petition
15 myself. Evidence from A through Z.

16 After the review of all court
17 documents, my attorney submitted a brief
18 stating that the trial court, the county and
19 my trial attorney had erred and that my due
20 process rights were violated due to
21 ineffective assistance of counsel.

22 The case is presently being
23 reviewed by the highest court of appeals in
24 Albany and still at this time my youngest
25 daughter is being wrongfully kept from seeing

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 me, her mother, and additional family. I
3 don't want my child to be another statistic
4 before anything becomes aware to the public.

5 So if anyone has ever been or is in
6 the similar horrific situation, please speak
7 out and let's try to get something finally
8 done about the corruptive, terrorist, very
9 politically run controlled family courts and
10 county CPS system.

11 By the way, I've already tried
12 contacting our congressman and was told by an
13 intern that he doesn't get involved with the
14 courts. Furthermore, I received a brush off
15 from a legislator back in 2011 when reporting
16 the situation. I'm presently still reaching
17 out to broadcast news and editors to state the
18 problem. Yet still no bite. Instead I'm
19 being told that this is a very common story
20 and that I needed something sexy to catch
21 their ears and eyes of the public.

22 They have managed to manipulate,
23 influence and deceive the corrupted family
24 court system to work along with the
25 perpetrators, a retired NYPD ranking officer

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 married to the father of my child to hide
3 their abuse upon her. The favoritism of their
4 money and work status has kept my daughter in
5 harm's way for the past five years and
6 continues today.

7 Parental alienation is what's going
8 on right now. And I don't believe that the
9 schools are not involved as well. Teachers
10 are limited to what they are allowed to
11 report.

12 My daughter has also been kept from
13 food deprivation. I will not go into the
14 horrific false allegations that were put upon
15 me about what my daughter had gone through.
16 Her birthday is September 19th. She shares
17 what Tommy went through and more.

18 This is my first time ever being
19 able to speak my story and I've tried since
20 2010. I became my own paralegal. I've
21 learned about what our system is. And it
22 saddens me to know that these people who are
23 trying to do a good job have so limited
24 vices. Our Congress needs to change this
25 system. They put it there. I was told by a

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 CPS supervisor calling one weekend with my
3 daughter's behavioral -- excuse me -- that if
4 I wanted change I would have to talk to
5 Congress.

6 2010 I created two Youtube videos.
7 Please check out family justifiably torn
8 apart. There are many that I found the same
9 title as mine. I made this card. Put it on
10 all cars, train stations, workplaces. I may
11 be risking my job right now but you know
12 what? I don't care. I don't care. My oldest
13 was taken and I will end with just this. I
14 love you sweetheart. She had wanted to speak
15 to the judge which, by the way, was first John
16 Kelly then Bernard Chen. She wrote this when
17 she was 13.

18 When I was growing up in middle
19 school I heard a lot about Child protective
20 Services, or CPS, from my peers, though they
21 did not know what CPS truly was, it protects
22 us. They had laughed and made jokes about it
23 though I never knew why. I thought CPS was
24 also a good thing. Helping kids and making
25 things right for families. I was wrong.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 One day out of the blue I was
3 called down to the guidance office. Sitting
4 in a room with my principal and vice
5 principal -- I will not mention names -- and
6 the CPS worker. You are going to a group home
7 was the first thing he had said to me.
8 Although we met one other time before in
9 guidance just to discuss some things which was
10 rudely done while my school was in session.

11 I was not expecting this. I was in
12 shock. I was scared. Desperately waiting an
13 explanation, he had said an order of
14 protection was placed against my mom for
15 failing to miss a court date. I didn't
16 believe him. When he took me to the group
17 home I was shy and still in shock. It was
18 nice place. Well kept to itself. However, I
19 was still terrified and helpless. Every night
20 I remember crying in my bed asking why and
21 how. My mom never misses a court date I
22 thought. What does this have to do with me?
23 Did I do something wrong? What's going to
24 happen now?

25 I was so happy when I got the

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 opportunity to visit my sister at the social
3 services building a while later. We had
4 always laughed together there, ignoring most
5 of the intimidated glares from some
6 supervisors and security people. I brought
7 toys to her and gifts on holidays and fun
8 games we could play. I was so overjoyed to
9 see her and so was she when she saw me.
10 However, I heard her frequently ask me when am
11 I going home to mommy? I would reply we are
12 working on things. We'll try to make things
13 better for all of this.

14 Also, when I had given her a snack
15 she would tell the supervisors please don't
16 tell Michelle I'm eating and drinking this.
17 They would ask why not? She would stutter and
18 be nervous to tell them an answer. I can now
19 say as a big sister I've seen Melanie's
20 reflection from the other house and I strive
21 to help my mom in bringing us together again.

22 I now say that CPS stands for
23 changing people's statements instead of Child
24 Protective Services. Being in the past
25 experiences that led me and my mom that we had

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 to deal with them. I have so badly wanted to
3 talk to the judge about my feelings towards
4 all this. Honestly, I can say I'm fed up. I
5 cannot believe this procrastination in this
6 and I'm growing very impatient. All I want to
7 see is my sister home and happy with us. This
8 has gone on way too long with this. I must
9 state that I am very disappointed in all of
10 this and the people working with this. I am
11 still waiting with my mom to see at least some
12 improvement with this case and we want to see
13 things turned out for the better for us and
14 for Melanie.

15 It's notarized and signed by her.
16 I will end with this and thank you
17 very much for waiting. I have two favorite
18 quotes. In every truth passes three stages
19 before it is recognized. In the first it is
20 ridiculed. In the second it is opposed. In
21 the third it is regarded as self evident.
22 Arthur Shopenhaur.

23 My second. Man who walks with
24 integrity walks securely. Man who walks in
25 crooked path will be found out. And that is

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 unknown.

3 In God we trust and we are taught
4 to trust the people that we see before us. We
5 need to do something immediately. We need to
6 call Congress. We cannot do this alone.
7 Please. Thank you.

8 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Marie Tooker
9 is it? I apologize if I'm saying any name
10 incorrectly.

11 MS. TOOKER: Good evening
12 everybody. I had a speech but after hearing
13 CPS, which I feel was a violation of our
14 Eighth Amendment, cruel and unusual punishment
15 inflicted upon many of that have PTSD that
16 have experienced our children being stolen or
17 the unthinkable.

18 All that are saying here one thing
19 that I just heard from a CPS worker sitting
20 behind me, she made fun and said three
21 minutes, three minutes. Now I know other
22 people were disrespectful but they're supposed
23 to be above and beyond courteous and
24 respectful. And if she could be that way in
25 the public like that what is she like when

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 she's on her job with having no compassion for
3 anybody's feelings. Especially that woman who
4 was just speaking about still not having her
5 child.

6 I come from Suffolk County and I
7 went before the legislature yesterday. And I
8 think the most important thing is that no one
9 is recognizing that Judge Tantone he gave full
10 custody to the father of this horrific
11 situation that has happened. But what he
12 erred at, what he made a grave error at, is
13 that he gave temporary custody, emergency
14 temporary custody to Justyna. And I'm going
15 to stand here now and beg all of you, I've
16 already wrote letters, I begged, I pleaded, I
17 beg all of today you want change? You want to
18 see that you have care and you have compassion
19 and you have a moral compass? God, please
20 call, write, go there, get Judge Tantone to
21 change his decision and give full custody to
22 Justyna with prejudice so she never has to go
23 into the corrupt, horrific, sick court ever
24 again. We already know that it's corrupt. It
25 is already known. You already know. Here it

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 is. Everything that they said is already in
3 every report you possibly can see on the web.

4 This time is for the public. You
5 need to hear what's happening behind the
6 scenes with mommies who are suffering. Who
7 are losing their children. Something that is
8 irreparable. Something that you cannot
9 erase. It's a silent disability that you
10 never get over.

11 God gave you your children. You
12 need to protect them. And when the
13 authorities, the powers that be, are so
14 corrupt they stop you from protecting your
15 children, where is our asylum? Where is the
16 American parents' asylum from our own
17 government?

18 God please, I beg all of you, it's
19 not about us today. It's not about me and my
20 story and what I experienced. I saved my
21 children. I was strong enough. I saved my
22 children. My animals were sacrificed
23 instead. Today it's about Justyna.

24 All I want to know, everybody, how
25 many people want her to have full custody

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 now? Full custody. Nothing more. And every
3 judge arrested. There are a full things that
4 need to be done. That's the most important.
5 I'm sorry everybody. Excuse me. I don't want
6 to take your time I just want to say a few
7 more things.

8 Perjury needs to be prosecuted. As
9 soon as there is a false claim and you prove
10 it -- they said they need credible evidence.
11 As soon as it's false go arrest that person
12 for perjury. We demand video recordings and
13 videos in the courtroom. What are you hiding
14 if you don't want it to be video recorded? We
15 need the Bar Association and the corrupt
16 judiciary to be investigated by the Department
17 of Justice. We need to abolish immunity.

18 We need drug and alcohol testing to
19 every powers that be that are in office. They
20 need to be evaluated and they need to be
21 tested for the Constitution.

22 And one more thing. Bribery is
23 rampant. It's paid to play all the way.
24 Thank you sir with all my heart. I had met
25 the first gentleman attorney that finally

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 stood up to you bullies. Because a black robe
3 is a bully and he has all this power to take
4 your life away. Please, with all my heart,
5 get her full custody. Do it now. Do it now.
6 Thank you.

7 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you
8 Marie. Dawn Corrigan.

9 MS. CORRIGAN: Hello. My name is
10 Dawn Corrigan and just about eight years ago I
11 found myself at the mercy of the family court
12 system in Suffolk County. Many mothers like
13 myself find themselves at the mercy of this
14 cruel, corrupt and unjust system.
15 Fortunately, I was able to navigate the
16 corruption. I withdrew my petition for full
17 custody of my children. I put an order to
18 show cause because the supervising judge,
19 David Feinlick, called CPS from my petition,
20 which had absolutely no allegation of abuse,
21 neglect or child maltreatment and CPS showed
22 up at my house. I wound up going to the
23 Second Department because Judge David Feinlick
24 refused to hear my order to show cause. He
25 had no legal basis to have CPS come to my

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 house to begin with. And I won in the Second
3 Department.

4 I won because I fought and because
5 I knew. Had I not done that I could have been
6 any one of these people here. I stayed in a
7 sick situation because my children were at
8 risk because this judge abused his power. You
9 can look it up yourself if you'd like.

10 The family court system, the
11 judges, the law guardians and CPS are
12 unethical in all of their actions. I did my
13 own research after this terrible situation.
14 They're destroying families. No one can get
15 through any of this insanity with CPS.

16 In my recent discoveries I have
17 found that it's become known to me actually
18 that in multiple townships in Suffolk County
19 the town officials are enlisting the Suffolk
20 County Police Department and Child Protective
21 Services to help them steal homes. I know
22 this to be true. The town shows up at a set
23 residence. They have registries now for
24 people that are in foreclosure and for people
25 that are just late with their mortgages. And

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 they're targeting minorities, they're
3 targeting women, children. They're targeting
4 people in lower social economic areas.

5 They show up to a house and they
6 have CPS there and they have the ASPCA to
7 steal their animals. They're literally
8 ordering people out of their homes by
9 threatening them and intimidating them and
10 instilling fear and telling parents that if
11 you don't leave within five or ten minutes we
12 are going to steal your children. We are
13 going to take your children. This is
14 happening.

15 Parents don't want to vacant their
16 properties. They threaten them with arrest
17 and they're taking children and stealing
18 people's homes under the guise of zombie
19 home. They have no jurisdiction to do this.
20 They have no search warrants and they're
21 illegally searching people's properties and
22 illegally seizing their properties and
23 illegally seizing their homes and their
24 children.

25 I'm here today to bring awareness

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 of this horrendous crime that's happening in
3 our communities, and I want everybody to know
4 that CPS was sent to my house on a fishing
5 expedition. And had they spent more time
6 investigating real allegations of abuse from
7 some of these parents and stop wasting time
8 coming to my house for false, trumped up
9 charges. Ridiculous. You can look it up. If
10 you want to see the report you can just go.
11 Corrigan versus Suffolk County Child
12 Protective Services and Suffolk County. Go
13 look it up. I one in the Second District. He
14 had no jurisdiction to call CPS to go to my
15 house. You know how many people he does that
16 to? He's retired now. But they're all doing
17 it. It's a racket because they're making
18 money. Every child has about ten or 15 jobs
19 attached to them, between social workers and
20 law guardians and case workers and case
21 managers. It's ridiculous. It's just a way
22 to make money.

23 So anyway, I just wanted to finish
24 with this by Robert F. Kennedy. Every time we
25 turn our heads the other way when we see the

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 law flouted, when we tolerate what we know to
3 be wrong, when we close our eyes and ears to
4 the corrupt because we are too busy or too
5 frightened, when we fail to speak up and speak
6 out we strike a blow against freedom, decency
7 and justice. Thank you.

8 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you
9 Dawn. Sara Keenan.

10 MS. KEENAN: I am here as another
11 grieving mother. Yet tomorrow my daughter
12 will be dead six years. Lana choked, was
13 resuscitated at home and brought to South Side
14 as a precaution. There began a slew of
15 medical misadventures leading to a slow six
16 week death for my child. A child abuse
17 specialist named Dr. Jamie Hoffman Rosenfeld
18 from Cohen's Hospital reported that I possibly
19 shook my daughter. Child abuse specialists'
20 reports are not verified by CPS.

21 My two sons were immediately
22 removed and I was left a mother spinning, not
23 understanding how my life was being pulled
24 apart in a family court system that left me
25 with less rights than an arrested criminal.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 The medical examiner's report came
3 back showing absolutely no signs of injury.
4 Yet the county ignored the evidence and put me
5 to trial in front of Bernie Chang anyway. Let
6 me repeat. CPS took it upon themselves to
7 ignore the Special Victims Unit, the Suffolk
8 County DA's Office, as well as the New York
9 City Medical Examiner and put me on trial for
10 shaking my daughter to death anyway.

11 There are no constraints on family
12 court. There is no oversight and they're left
13 with far too much power in the hands of
14 unqualified people.

15 I'm currently in active litigation
16 with both Suffolk County and Northwell in
17 federal court. The only reason I could obtain
18 standing was because I had the money to fight
19 the system and refuse to say I was negligent.
20 So many CPS victims are forced to take the
21 neglect plea to get their children back from
22 foster care leaving them with no civil rights
23 recourse.

24 CPS workers need to be given the
25 tools to do their jobs. They are a farce.

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 They have absolutely no investigational
3 training but are looked upon by the court for
4 all pertinent case investigation and
5 evidence. This alone is absurdly flawed. The
6 very people sent to investigate use cookie
7 cutter forms for submission to family court
8 suggesting removal with only hearsay as their
9 motivation. Article 10 of the Family Court
10 Act leaves them with a breath of power far
11 beyond their training. And what is left is a
12 system that clamors to cover its constant
13 errors and interference in the lives of
14 innocent families with only the children as
15 victims. Thank you.

16 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you
17 Sara. Kathy Cole.

18 MS. COLE: Hi. I just wanted to
19 before, I was going to say before you hit my
20 timer can I say something quick? I was at the
21 legislative meeting yesterday and I've worked
22 personally with a few of the legislators
23 regarding this issue and I really wish that
24 the meeting was done flipped. Yesterday at
25 the meeting the public was allowed to speak

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 first. The CPS workers, the commissioner
3 heard what everyone had to say and then that
4 generated the questions. You need to hear
5 from the victims to know where the problems
6 are.

7 So, I'm here to give Thomas a
8 voice. I started this Facebook group. I met
9 with Justyna. I've been with her to court. I
10 never met her before. So, we're here to give
11 Thomas a voice.

12 My name is Kathy Cole, and I have
13 been a contractor for schools in New York
14 State and New York City and many other states
15 across the nation specific to school gym
16 safety issues. I became a whistleblower after
17 reporting noncompliance and safety violations
18 mandated by law in New York State to protect
19 the kids. Laws that were enacted because two
20 children were crushed and killed in their
21 school gym electric divider. One here on Long
22 Island. She was nine years old. Her name was
23 Deanna Moon.

24 The safety violations and dangerous
25 issues, much like this case, are not limited

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 to Nassau or Suffolk County. They are
3 systemic throughout the nation. It took
4 several deaths and horrific accidents to get a
5 national attention for the June safety issue.
6 Specifically the last step of a child in
7 Virginia, Wesley Lapicki, only nine years old,
8 was crushed and killed in a school gym divider
9 on May 18, 2018. Wesley's death was the spark
10 that lit national reform on this gym safety
11 issue.

12 I pray and we promise, Justyna,
13 that Thomas' death will be, which was
14 preventable and tragic, will be the spark that
15 will bring systemic changes to the agencies
16 that are entrusted with our most beloved
17 children.

18 I am now working with the national
19 agency in DC to set a minimum safety standard
20 for the safety issue in the school gyms. Over
21 20 years of working to expose and rectify the
22 issues, it is time for change in that arena
23 and it is time for change in CPS and family
24 court.

25 In 2014, I started a radio show,

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 All Facted Up. There is no pun in that name.
3 I had all the facts and they fell on deaf
4 ears. Just like this case, there was
5 government abuse, cover-ups and just massive
6 dysfunction at the highest levels of New York
7 State and New York City departments of
8 education.

9 Money won't solve this issue. You
10 need to account for every dollar that is spent
11 before you throw money at an already
12 dysfunctional system.

13 After my first radio show I was
14 inundated with frantic calls from both moms
15 and dads begging me to help expose the
16 corruption, abuse and cover-ups in CPS and
17 family court systems here on Long Island. I
18 literally stopped my radio show in good faith
19 so that I could focus on my gym safety issue.
20 I knew I could make change there. I didn't
21 know how to make change here, then, in 2014.

22 While I watched News 12 and other
23 channels and I witnessed the horror of Tommy's
24 death, the image of those parents calling me
25 and begging me to help them with the

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 corruption and the abusive power in CPS and
3 the court system came back to haunt me. I
4 immediately had a call to action meeting at my
5 home with the hopes of springing something
6 into action. Very shortly after I was
7 contacted and asked to come to court last
8 Monday for the temporary hearing for Justyna,
9 Geno and Mike regarding their children, the
10 parents in that house of horrors.

11 I'm documenting dozens of victims
12 that are reaching out again. Stories in both
13 Nassau and Suffolk County. I have literally
14 spent over 100 hours the past probably week
15 listening to tortured parents fearing for
16 their children's safety.

17 I went to and spoke at the Suffolk
18 County Legislature yesterday and I truly hope
19 that you're going to have a joint task force
20 and Long Island will be the spark for national
21 reform. And we all beg you to please demand
22 an external investigation into the agencies
23 that failed Thomas.

24 I'm just going to end with this.
25 One of the most powerful scenes in a movie

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 that I believe changed me forever was in the
3 movie A Time to Kill. A young black girl in
4 the deep south many years ago was abducted by
5 white men. She was raped and brutalized and
6 left for dead. Her father wound up killing
7 the rapists. His lawyer, during his trial,
8 asked the jury to please close their eyes. To
9 imagine this child being brutally raped,
10 almost killed, tortured and left for dead.
11 Now imagine she was white. And the jury set
12 the dad free.

13 I ask you now to close your eyes.
14 To think about what Tommy went through and now
15 imagine he was your son. We don't have a
16 choice but to act. Let Thomas's death be the
17 spark that lights national reform.

18 Justyna did give me some ideas when
19 I met her in the court. The first thing I
20 said was how could Thomas be alive today? And
21 without hesitation it was videotaped
22 investigation for the parents and the
23 children. Because there are false -- and I'm
24 not blaming anybody, no one wanted Thomas to
25 die. But if you're tired, if you're

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 overworked, if you don't have the skills and
3 you're writing reports that children's lives
4 depend on, they need to be videotaped so that
5 if there is a he said she said it's there.

6 I'm happy to tell you that the
7 Suffolk County Legislature is already looking
8 into appropriating funds for the proper video
9 equipment. That's what we were told
10 yesterday.

11 Another thing that I think you
12 touched on -- I'm sorry, I don't know your
13 name -- about unfounded. So, unfounded could
14 be that they go to the door after this 24-hour
15 period that they have and no one is home.
16 That's unfounded. It could be that they knock
17 on the door and the parents say you can't come
18 in. That's unfounded. Seventeen calls
19 begging for Thomas's life was unfounded. We
20 have a huge, huge problem. Thank you very
21 much.

22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you
23 Kathy. Debbie Lyons.

24 MS. LYONS: Good evening. My
25 name is Debbie Lyons. I'm the director of the

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 Child Advocacy Center at the Safe Center. We
3 are grateful to be here this evening to share
4 our experience working closely with the Nassau
5 County Department of Social Services and
6 particularly Child Protective Services. At
7 the Safe Center, we serve victims of child
8 abuse, domestic violence, sexual assault and
9 human trafficking. DSS is an essential
10 partner in this work and without their support
11 we could not provide vital services such as
12 our child advocacy center, safe housing for
13 domestic violence victims, the county's victim
14 hotline and services for victims of child sex
15 trafficking.

16 Unlike many counties around the
17 state, Nassau County DSS has committed two
18 specialized investigative units that are
19 collocated at our Bethpage facility. These
20 case workers have completed hours of
21 additional training on developmentally
22 appropriate and trauma-informed approaches to
23 working with children and families impacted by
24 abuse. They're tasked with responding to some
25 of the most complicated abuse reports and work

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 side by side with a team of criminal justice
3 professionals to investigate allegations of
4 child sexual and severe physical abuse. In
5 2019 alone we jointly responded to nearly
6 1,000 allegations of abuse at the child
7 advocacy center.

8 We are here tonight because of a
9 tragic child fatality. If we truly wish to
10 understand what happened it is important to
11 put CPS into context. Child Protective
12 Services does not operate in a vacuum. They
13 rely on the community to identify and report
14 signs of abuse. On departmental policy to
15 dictate what workers are allowed to do. And
16 on judges for final approval of CPS
17 intervention.

18 In addition, state level guidance
19 regarding child protective interventions have
20 a significant impact on the degree to which
21 workers are empowered to intervene.
22 Collectively, we can do more to educate our
23 community on responding to concerns and to
24 advocate for more effective child protective
25 policy at the local, state and federal level.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 There is no greater tragedy for our child
3 protective system and no outcome which they
4 work harder to avoid than the death of a
5 child. It sends a ripple of emotion through
6 the community which can make us want to find
7 an immediate solution and place blame. It is
8 important that we are not reactionary, but
9 rather thoughtful and deliberate in order to
10 create lasting change that keeps children
11 safe. This would be a true testament to
12 Thomas Valva's memory. Thank you.

13 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you
14 Debbie. Regan Murphy.

15 MS. DILIBERTO: I have been
16 working in tandem here to represent Jacqueline
17 Francetti and her daughter. My name is Dee
18 Jae Diliberto. Thank you for allowing us to
19 have this opportunity tonight.

20 I graduated from law school
21 recently and I filed for divorce after my
22 first semester of law school, which was over
23 nine years ago. My custody case is ongoing.
24 I served a New York State Supreme Court
25 internship. I worked in health law policy

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 clinic. I served a postgraduate fellowship at
3 Lawyers for Children. I'm working with the
4 New York State Assembly on promoting judicial
5 and legislative reform. And I started a
6 foundation while I was in law school called
7 Raising the Bar for Families where I advocate
8 pro bono for people who are going through
9 divorce, custody and domestic violence.

10 I can't discuss the details of my
11 ongoing nine-year custody battle but I can
12 tell you a summary of my divorce proceedings.

13 Through my divorce I learned that
14 the system is not applying the laws and the
15 standards and procedures equally. I was
16 comforted by my law school dean, my
17 professors, attorneys and other people who
18 would say that the system was so greatly
19 broken. The state has spent tens of millions
20 of dollars on a commission under former Chief
21 Justice Judith Kaye called the Miller
22 Commission which defines specifically ways
23 that we can improve the system. But they
24 haven't implemented those ways and children
25 are still being harmed and killed.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 In my case, my husband made over
3 \$20 million during our marriage. I ran out of
4 money to pay my legal fees after I had spent
5 over \$350,000. Despite the fact that I had a
6 prenup and post-nup that was depositive of 95
7 percent of the equitable distribution. But
8 the courts deprived me and my children of
9 orders of child support, spousal support and
10 attorney fees for almost eight years. After I
11 ran out of money, my husband was only paying
12 us a voluntary amount of child support that
13 was \$2,642 a month. While he was paying about
14 \$55,000 a month on his own expenses. I was a
15 full-time mom going to law school, a pro se
16 litigant and the subject of multiple CPS
17 investigations. I've always had full custody
18 of my children but I don't know how long
19 that's going to last.

20 Fortunately, I graduated, I passed
21 the bar and my children are alive. It's not
22 the same for my friend Jacqueline Francetti.
23 Regan Murphy and I are here to tell you her
24 story.

25 MS. MURPHY: Good evening. My

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 name is Regan Murphy. I'm a close family
3 friend of Jacqueline for over 30 years. She's
4 unable to attend this hearing this evening but
5 her voice is critical when talking about child
6 protection from abusive and murderous parents
7 in Nassau County and New York State. I'm
8 going to read her statement to you.

9 I'm Jacqueline Francetti. I am
10 Kiera's mom. This is Kiera. Three years ago
11 my beautiful, fiercely independent 28 month
12 old daughter Kiera, who loved Elmo and Mickey
13 Mouse, was murdered. She was the subject of a
14 custody case in Nassau County Family Court.
15 Kiera was shot twice in the back while she
16 slept by her father. He then set fire to his
17 home and he committed on suicide. Kiera's
18 murder was 100 percent preventable.

19 Many were involved in Kiera's
20 case. If anyone had proper training, had
21 knowledge of family violence or frankly even
22 cared about her, Kiera who would be alive
23 today.

24 When I walked into Nassau County
25 Family Court for the first time I thought

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Kiera would be protected. That the health and
3 safety of our children would be top priority.

4 I was wrong and now Kiera is gone forever.

5 MS. DILIBERTO: Let me tell you
6 Kiera's story through the words of Jacquelyn
7 Francetti.

8 When I notified the Nassau County
9 Family Court that I was being stalked,
10 repeatedly harassed, threatened, verbally and
11 emotionally abused, the family court judge,
12 Daniel Peterson, yelled at me to grow up.
13 Despite my fears and clear evidence of
14 domestic violence, coercive control abuse,
15 rage issues and her father being suicidal, Dr.
16 Larry Cohen, the forensic evaluator, dismissed
17 that her father was suicidal and recommended
18 joint custody because he believed a father
19 should always play a role in the child's
20 life. Or death. And her father did play that
21 role. He shot Kiera twice in the back while
22 she slept.

23 Nassau County Protective Services,
24 we laugh when we say protective services,
25 noted that he had overly aggressive play

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 style, anger and rage issues, cursed and
3 threatened Jacqueline in front of the baby and
4 was suicidal. But nonetheless, they concluded
5 that there was no domestic violence and they
6 claimed the case was low risk. I want to know
7 what CPS deems high risk.

8 Jacqueline notified Kiera's
9 attorney, the attorney for the child, Glynn
10 Cocaleo, many times. She told him that things
11 were wrong. The father of the baby was not
12 following court orders or medical directives,
13 which is physical abuse. She told them that
14 there was emotional distress when Kiera would
15 return to the mother and the father was
16 becoming more and more unhinged.

17 At their last hearing for Kiera,
18 Judge Daniel Peterson actually said this is
19 not a life or death situation. Judge Peterson
20 you were wrong. Every person involved in
21 Kiera's case is still practicing. Not one
22 person has been reprimanded, sanctioned or
23 moved from practice. So it's safe to say that
24 the body count of children being murdered will
25 increase.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Kiera's case was a textbook. Too
3 many children are being murdered by a mother
4 or father due to the failings of the New York
5 State Family Court system. Transparency and
6 accountability are desperately needed. The
7 Office of Court Administration hopes that you
8 will write Jacqueline off. They hope that you
9 will write off all the other murdered children
10 as isolated incidents. Had the Office of
11 Court Administration taken action years ago,
12 Kiera and many other children would be alive
13 and playing today.

14 Sadly, 81 percent of abusers are
15 getting custody or unsupervised visitation.
16 81 percent. The Nassau County and New York
17 State Family Court systems are failing.
18 Jacqueline is begging you to step up, step in
19 and make change. We need to turn around what
20 is now being called the New York State fatal
21 court system instead of the family court
22 system. Child safety is not complicated.

23 Jacqueline and everyone here today
24 wants to work with you to usher in the changes
25 right away. Jacqueline just returned from

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 Albany where she spent four days working with
3 the New York State Assembly. Based on Kiera's
4 story alone, five bills will be introduced
5 this session.

6 Here in Nassau County what can you
7 do to move this forward? What are the next
8 steps? Let us honor Kiera and all of the
9 children who have been needlessly murdered.
10 Their little voices cannot be silenced. Their
11 stories must be heard. We will not go away
12 quietly. It's time for a change. Thank you
13 very much for your time and attention to
14 this.

15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you
16 Regan and Dee Jae. Andrea Bergin.

17 MS. BERGIN: Hi. Thank you for
18 having us. I'm hear to speak on behalf of
19 myself as well as the FCLU. I just want to
20 thank Justyna and all the other parents and
21 everybody that have told their story. I think
22 it's so important and it needs to be heard.

23 I can't say how incredibly
24 disappointed I am that DSS was allowed to
25 leave. It's fine. If you aren't going to let

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 the people speak first then it should have
3 been known that they had to wait because
4 otherwise this is a farce. If they do not
5 hear what the concerns are, we were just
6 supposed to listen to them and the excuses
7 they have of why everything is okay. But they
8 can't listen to us about what the problems
9 are. That bothers me very much. And it seems
10 like this is kind of just a meeting just to
11 pacify angry people, not to actually cause any
12 change and that's very disappointing because I
13 had a lot of hope for this.

14 Another thing that makes me think
15 this is that there was an email, there was a
16 newsletter email sent out the other day from,
17 I'm sorry, Ms. Schaefer. It announced this
18 public hearing following the tragic death of
19 Thomas Valva and the details for this
20 meeting. At the end it actually read, after
21 the announcement Legislator Schaefer said this
22 hearing will serve as a checkup on an already
23 phenomenal Health and Social Services
24 department. We need to make sure they have
25 the proper resources and staffing that they

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 need to be successful.

3 Now, very quickly, an email was
4 sent out to recall that previous email. Which
5 is understandable because you have the death
6 of a child in the same paragraph as
7 phenomenal. That seemed to be a little bit of
8 a juxtaposition there. Again, that, combined
9 with DSS leaving and not having to hear
10 anything, just shows that I have very little
11 faith that anything is going to change here.
12 It has to go through to these people. They
13 have to understand. You have to hear this.
14 This is dangerous.

15 What happened to Justyna and her
16 son is a nightmare. It is the worst possible
17 outcome of what can happen in a custody case.
18 But it's not an anomaly. And there are a lot
19 of other kids out there that are being abused
20 and neglected and ignored and it feels like
21 they still are.

22 I know this is in the news. I know
23 you wanted to hold a meeting. But is anything
24 going to get done or is it just for show?

25 I understand that CPS has their

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 hands tied to a certain extent. I'm sorry
3 that they're understaffed, overworked,
4 underpaid. But parents shouldn't have to pay
5 for these bureaucratic issues with a child's
6 life. That is not acceptable.

7 I know there are plenty of
8 wonderful CPS workers out there. But you know
9 what? You heard yourself tonight. Some of
10 them have 30 children, 30 families. That is
11 insurmountable and impossible to monitor
12 properly. It can't be done. It needs to
13 change. There were a lot of different
14 institutions and people who were neglectful
15 and horrific in this case. Judge Zimmerman
16 Lorentz, Chang, Donna McCabe. And out of CPS,
17 June Johnson, Michelle Clark. There are a
18 number of other people who were responsible.

19 I know CPS was saying this happened
20 in Suffolk County, it was mostly Suffolk
21 County, but it started here and it doesn't
22 matter. The problem, the corruption it runs
23 all through. It doesn't matter what county
24 we're in or honestly what town, what state.
25 It's here. It's destroyed. It's broken.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 It's corrupt. And it needs to be fixed. I
3 really am praying to God that something gets
4 done.

5 And again, I'm so disappointed that
6 all of the CPS and all of DSS left before
7 anyone spoke. Honestly, you should be ashamed
8 that you let that happen. Thank you.

9 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you
10 Andrea. Eva George.

11 MS. GEORGE: Good evening. First
12 of all, I want to say my condolences to
13 Justyna. And I just want to say the whole
14 town and many of the country is grieving with
15 you. We are so sorry for your loss.

16 I also have ongoing custody battle,
17 so I am unable to really talk too much about
18 that. But I also went through a divorce here
19 at the supreme court from March 2015 with
20 Judge Zimmerman. I fled abuse in June 2015
21 with my three children. Which were also
22 abused by their father. Including myself.
23 And I trusted my faith basically in the hands
24 of the family court to protect my children.
25 And little did I know that when that journey

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 started, which he already stated before it
3 started that nobody is going to believe you.
4 No judge is going to believe you. I'm going
5 to take everything from you.

6 And so many times these abusers and
7 these domestic violence cases or sometimes
8 women are allowed to manipulate the system
9 constantly over and over again.

10 As a mother, the more I spoke my
11 children are in danger the more I started
12 losing my children and the more I was silenced
13 in the court system. I was forced to give
14 them first supervised visits. Which they did
15 not even want. My son, who was beaten by his
16 father, was forced to have a supervised visit,
17 even that he did not want and he probably had
18 said that to his law guardian. He wanted a
19 supervised meeting. He actually attacked. He
20 was hitting his father because he was so
21 angry.

22 I had my daughter, who was then
23 nine years old, after every supervised visit
24 or a forced phone calls, there were forced
25 phone calls every other day that I was not

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 allowed to be in a room because they were
3 thinking I'm interfering with the phone
4 calls. My daughter would start beating
5 herself repeatedly. Throwing things. And
6 this is a typical girl who was joyful, played
7 gymnastics and there was not much anything I
8 was able to do to protect her. The more I
9 started to protect them the more he cried
10 parental alienation.

11 Parental alienation is one of the
12 number one things that abusers are allowed to
13 use in the court system to silence the victims
14 and silence the mothers or sometimes the
15 fathers who are trying to protect their own
16 children. I had no voice. In order to
17 protect -- instead of me for the courts to
18 protect my children from them, I had to prove
19 in court that I'm not alienating my children
20 from their abuser. That's awful. That's very
21 sick.

22 Instead of them concentrating on my
23 husband abusing the children or being a danger
24 to me, all I was forced to do time and time
25 again in a hearing and the stipulation is

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 showing that I am taking them, I'm forcing
3 them, even though my son used to hide in the
4 trunk of the car sometimes refusing to come
5 out of the car to go to supervised meetings.
6 But if I didn't do that, I would have been
7 held in contempt of the court and I would have
8 more endangered my children. So if I
9 protected my children I would have harmed my
10 children more by protecting them. How
11 confusing.

12 Now, eventually, after they stopped
13 supervised visits with my children after my
14 son attacked his father in a supervised visit
15 and I'm shopping for Christmas gifts in
16 Target. The supervisor called that he is
17 about to call the police. That my son is not
18 calming down. I couldn't even go pick him
19 up. I can hear him in the background
20 screaming pick me up, I don't want to be
21 here. I couldn't even go pick him up because
22 the supervisor wasn't even done. But that
23 prevented in some of those things eventually
24 stopped the supervised with the two older
25 ones.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 But then I had a six year old who
3 was unable to speak for himself and didn't
4 understand or did not communicate. They
5 protected the two older ones but they did not
6 protect my little one, which continued
7 supervised visits. And eventually, after
8 three months, started getting unsupervised
9 visits with his father. Now you have two
10 older siblings who are terrified seeing their
11 younger brother me dropping him to
12 unsupervised visits. How traumatizing is that
13 for older siblings to see that? That they
14 know what this man has done to them and there
15 is nothing that I could have done because then
16 I would have been alienating my child from his
17 father. That's bigger crime than abuse in
18 this day.

19 But basically it took one of those
20 unsupervised visits. My son came home
21 alleging a situation that his dad did. I took
22 him to the law guardian. I took him to the
23 psychologist. Because we're in a court
24 proceeding. I'm taking him to all these
25 places that I need to do just to protect

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 them. And he told his story basically what
3 was happening. And I believe one of those
4 things sparked a CPS investigation with my
5 son.

6 Even after the fact that CPS
7 investigation started, they still forced me to
8 make my son go to unsupervised visits with his
9 dad. And when the day came my son was so
10 scared but there was nothing I could do. He
11 screamed, he cried, he pulled my hair. He's
12 five, six years old begging me mom, don't make
13 me go. I'm trying to plead with the father he
14 doesn't want to come. He said bring him.
15 This is exactly how the other two were going
16 to come. Kicking and screaming. They don't
17 care.

18 Eventually I started taping this
19 situation that was happening and it was
20 basically enough. And at the end of the
21 screaming with my son my son said I told the
22 law guardian and I told the psychologist I
23 don't want to go. Which were the same people
24 that said a couple of days before that my son
25 wants to go. I was screaming with my lawyer

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 two days before there's no way my son wants to
3 go. He's lying. No. You have to make him
4 go.

5 I took that recording and I emailed
6 it to the law guardian, to my lawyer and to
7 the psychologist and that was the last time my
8 son had an unsupervised visit with his dad.
9 Due to a very good lawyer fighting for me and
10 I think eventually who realized my situation
11 was very dire for my children. I got full
12 custody of my children in 2017.

13 But I'm in my third round of
14 custody battle with the same, and I have to
15 live through this nightmare time and time
16 again and it never probably ends. Something
17 needs to be done. We need to believe the
18 mothers and sometimes the fathers who say that
19 there's abuse. Their victims need to be
20 protected and the children need to be
21 protected. Children need a voice. Thank you
22 for your time.

23 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you
24 Eva. Annetta Korszum.

25 MS. KORSZUM: I am a survivor of

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 Child Protective Services in Nassau County.
3 Forty years ago I was five years old. Taken
4 away from my immigrant parents that didn't
5 know how to speak English. I stand here
6 before you to say that I made it. I am a
7 survivor. That I will not go into detail as
8 to what I had to go through in order to
9 survive.

10 One thing I learned when I trained
11 as an emergency medical technician, a nurse,
12 as well as having a master's in business
13 administration and finance, the most valuable
14 lesson I learned whenever you want the answers
15 you always have to follow the money.

16 Many years ago, Ms. Walker, I sent
17 you letters on how more services were needed
18 for this disabled concerning violence. You
19 did nothing. As far as I'm concerned, the
20 blood of Thomas Valva is on your hands.

21 One of those people was my father.
22 Today is my father's birthday. I visit him at
23 Holy Root Cemetery at St. Bridget's in
24 Westbury. He would have been 84 years old.
25 He was yet another victim of how great a job

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Nassau County is doing.

3 Today I am here as a voice for
4 Thomas Valva. An eight year old autistic boy
5 who now speaks for the children, the disabled
6 and those that have suffered and lost their
7 lives before it was their time in Nassau
8 County at the hands of a generation and a
9 group of people that were empowered to serve
10 the people of this county. In fact, have done
11 quite the opposite. Instead financially
12 benefitted themselves in their positions of
13 power and titles.

14 To paraphrase the words of a 16
15 year old activist known as Greta Thunberg, who
16 spoke and addressed the United Nations. You
17 have stolen my dreams in childhood with your
18 empty words. How dare you. You have failed
19 us. But the young people are starting to
20 understand your betrayal. The eyes of all
21 future generations are upon you right here
22 right now. If you choose to continue to fail
23 us, I say we will never forgive you for what
24 you have done. We will not let you get away
25 with this. Right now is where we draw the

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 line. The world is waking up to these
3 abuses. Change is coming whether you like it
4 or not.

5 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you
6 Annetta. Marilyn Paulis-Kneski.

7 MS. PAULIS-KNESKI: Good
8 evening. I come to you as a recently retired
9 detective from the NYPD. I spent the last 12
10 plus years of my 20 year career investigating
11 child abuse cases in the county of Queens. By
12 all means, there are deficiencies at every
13 level and every agency. Right now we have
14 this one to highlight maybe some of the
15 deficiencies that we have in our system right
16 now.

17 I'm sad that DSS did not stay to
18 hear what I have to say or even explain a
19 couple of things. They threw up a couple of
20 figures on the board saying 87 percent of
21 their cases in 2019 were maltreatment and
22 neglect and only ten percent were physical,
23 two percent sexual.

24 A lot of cases come in as
25 maltreatment and neglect. That's just like

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 scraping the surface. There's a whole iceberg
3 underneath. When you do a forensic interview
4 with a child they're going to reveal more
5 information as you go forward. How many of
6 those 87 percent numbers have been changed to
7 the side of physical or sexual abuse? I don't
8 think they answered that question. It was
9 never posed.

10 There are cases when they go out --
11 I know CPS has a hard job being overworked. I
12 myself have done over maybe 1500 cases in my
13 12 year career that were specifically assigned
14 to me in addition to me helping other team
15 members. It's hard when you have multiple
16 families and you're inundated and the cases
17 don't stop coming in and maybe you're the only
18 person working that night. Which has happened
19 on occasion.

20 These children, are they being
21 interviewed in a special location? You had
22 the director of the CAC before, the Child
23 Advocacy Center, and they do a
24 multidisciplinary process where you come in
25 and you have a neutral person interview the

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 child in a child-friendly neutral
3 environment. We're not going into the house
4 and interviewing when the offender is in the
5 other room. We're not going into the school
6 where there's rules and regulations and you're
7 already told if you talk about that bruise
8 you're going to be taken away. There's a
9 problem right there with the way we are doing
10 interviews I believe.

11 If you can, when you do have your
12 overview with them again, ask them about
13 implementing an instant response team. New
14 York City does it. I don't believe Nassau
15 County does. So instant response is when you
16 do get this call from the state central
17 registry and it funnels down and you have a
18 case where there's an allegation of physical
19 abuse and there is a visible injury, your
20 child should have been brought to the CAC and
21 interviewed by a forensic interviewer. It
22 should not have been marked as duplicate.
23 That child was failed on that part. That's
24 the deficiency.

25 Any type of sexual abuse or any

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 innuendo of sexual abuse the child should be
3 interviewed in the CAC. Where there is
4 someone who know how to do a forensic
5 interview of a child and is not asking where
6 the offender might still be present.

7 I think it was you, Legislator
8 Gaylor, that asked if you can move 30 cases
9 and distribute it out. That's very hard. The
10 CPS worker has a rapport with the family and
11 you pass the buck on to somebody else that new
12 case worker has to start new with that family
13 and it becomes difficult for that family. So
14 it's not like a file you pick up here. You
15 have to start all over and get a rapport with
16 that family and that child. The children are
17 paramount here. We have to focus on what's
18 best for them.

19 The Child Advocacy Center prevents
20 multiple interviews by multiple agencies. You
21 have everybody come together and get to
22 observe what one forensic interviewer does an
23 interview with a child and it prevents the
24 trauma from happening over again. But it also
25 helps everyone gain information at the same

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 time. I thank you very much for my time.

3 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you so
4 much Marilyn. Francesca Amato.

5 MS. AMATO: Hi. My name is
6 Francesca Amato of Punish 4 Protecting
7 Incorporated. I'm not only here today to
8 grieve and stand with the mother and siblings
9 of Thomas Valva, but before I even say that I
10 also want to say to you the only good that can
11 come out of this is that your son is the voice
12 for countless millions and millions of
13 children. That's the only good. For that I
14 don't even have words for you mom.

15 I'm here to inform all of you that
16 this horrendous tragedy could have been
17 avoided if there was any accountability in the
18 system. I want to let everybody to know right
19 now I don't negotiate with terrorists.

20 For 12 and a half years I have
21 worked as a family rights advocate across the
22 nation and have kept a data base of the
23 countless families that have suffered from the
24 most egregious decisions made by judges which
25 have resulted in making matters a thousand

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 times worse if there was even any real issue
3 at all to begin with.

4 During and after separation and at
5 a time when emotions may peak these bad actors
6 intentionally exasperate conflict by placing
7 their pecuniary interests before our
8 children.

9 Family courts and the Title Four
10 judges target everyone and do not
11 discriminate. It doesn't matter if you are
12 black, white, yellow, blue, rich or poor. All
13 are subjected to this unless we effectively
14 stop it now. I have witnessed many times
15 where the courts have granted unfettered
16 access to actual known abusers which have
17 resulted in the perpetual harming of children,
18 and never once ever proceeding to the side of
19 caution. I court watch judges all over the
20 state and country and I'm appalled every day.
21 I watch CPS workers falsify records and lie in
22 every single courtroom I've ever sat in for 12
23 and a half years.

24 So I really would have the real
25 nitty-gritty statistics because I see it with

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 my eyes for 12 and a half years. I work with
3 the families. And you want to talk about case
4 overload? Talk to me about case overload. I
5 work without pay. I do this for the families
6 and beg and plead for judges and CPS and
7 whomever to save and protect these families.
8 I have been to the Department of Justice, the
9 FBI. You name it. I spoke before Congress.
10 I spoke before the New York State Attorney
11 General's Office. I served Letitia James on
12 the 21st 28 pages of federal crimes against
13 all our families.

14 Tonight you didn't see anybody
15 foaming from the mouth. You didn't see any
16 mothers with needles hanging out of their
17 mouths. You've see articulate mothers who
18 have clean, safe backgrounds restrained from
19 protecting their children. This is disgusting
20 and appalling and it's been going on for six
21 decades. There is no reform for this system.
22 The only thing that needs to be done is
23 abolish and arrest and prosecute every single
24 judge, CPS worker and anybody else that's
25 complicit to these crimes.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 When the American people didn't
3 vote this in 1962 that means this is treason
4 and it's never going to work. You can't have
5 a justice system, a fake jury, no jury rather,
6 no evidence-based practices, a judge that
7 makes all the decisions and you can't have
8 that when the people never voted it in. That
9 is a disgrace. That's actually completely
10 federal crimes on American soil. Therefore,
11 you can't fix it. You can't reform it. The
12 trillions and trillions of dollars that you
13 put into it it's all nonsense and we don't
14 want to hear it anymore. We're disgusted with
15 all of this.

16 I've witnessed the unfettered
17 access given to abusers and mothers and
18 fathers that are protective are the ones that
19 are restrained from their children. So don't
20 tell me, don't ever tell me that they proceed
21 to the side of caution because they do not
22 ever.

23 The truth is that these Title Four
24 courts prey on the families that they claim to
25 protect while receiving funding under the

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 administration of Children and Families.
3 Their own admittance, 88 percent of sex
4 traffic children come from your organizations
5 and you're all one body. Family court, CPS,
6 ACS, I don't care what name you give it.
7 Foster care. Forced adoption. The black
8 market of the adoption industry. You are all
9 one body. You all work together. That's what
10 you do and we've had it.

11 These judges have all violated
12 their oaths of office and are continually
13 depriving people of their constitutionally
14 protected rights. In the family court, which
15 was never, again, voted in by the people,
16 family show up to have their rights violated
17 daily. For years we always have heard from
18 all of the authorities and people in office
19 that they do not have jurisdiction. Or that
20 you need to find an attorney. No offense to
21 you because we love you by the way. If we had
22 people like you we wouldn't have these
23 problems. And that they do not have
24 jurisdiction or that you need to find an
25 attorney for the crimes committed against you

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 that are being rendered as a civil matter by
3 them.

4 Under the ASFA Act of 1997, the
5 removal of children was incentivized. This
6 system of zero percent, yes zero percent,
7 accountability has ripped families apart and
8 has more blood on its hands than our worst
9 terror attacks combined due to your greed.

10 I am here today to say that we the
11 people of the state of New York are sick of
12 this tyranny. Countless people have contacted
13 the State Attorney General Letitia James in
14 the past to no avail. I'm sure all my
15 families back here can agree to that, right?

16 We recently put her on notice on
17 the 8th and on the 21st, 2020 with a sworn
18 affidavit. Due to these courts being devoid
19 of the Constitution, they currently are the
20 cause of severe human rights abuses and
21 continually torture families through the
22 falsehoods and manufactured conflicts.

23 Parents are punished for protecting
24 their own old flesh and blood while officers
25 of the court, who swore to protect and serve

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 us, are intentionally depriving parents of
3 their rights day in and day out.

4 Being a parent is a constitutional
5 protected right. Any judge knowingly
6 depriving a person of their rights while
7 acting under color of law is committing
8 treason. I work as a national advocate and
9 can tell you that some of these judges are
10 involved in more than just their misconduct in
11 the courtroom. These are judges that are
12 involved in covering up the deaths of children
13 in other states.

14 I stand with thousands and
15 thousands and thousands of families after both
16 my son and I were targeted and continue to be
17 targeted by Anthony McGinnity and have come to
18 realize that this is the gateway to child and
19 human trafficking. This is the door to child
20 trafficking. Period.

21 New York ranks fifth in the nation
22 for human trafficking. The Hudson Valley is
23 number one. Family courts empower narcissists
24 and the judges in this venue do whatever they
25 wish under the guise of the children's best

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 interest standard. Narcissists are empowered
3 and perjury is highly encouraged in family
4 court. Why would we want to give these people
5 anymore chances? The only answer to this is
6 abolish and arrest.

7 The issue is that the people don't
8 truly know about family court, CPS, ACS or
9 whatever, ASS, name you want to give them,
10 until it's too late. Once CPS gets involved,
11 anything is possible. Once family court gets
12 involved anything is possible. They
13 intentionally tear apart families and get
14 rewarded for it. I consider them to be child
15 predator services. This system that is based
16 off greed has totally been exposed now.

17 I have dedicated my life to
18 stopping this system after having understood
19 that it preyed on those it claims to protect.
20 My biggest fear is that there may be people
21 here asking for reform of these courts, which
22 we saw tonight, but make no mistake, this is
23 not a father or mother issue. It is not an
24 isolated issue at all. These courts are not
25 broken. They are designed this way to ensure

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 that the state is receiving unlimited access
3 to federal grant money. They do not need
4 anymore funding. They need to be cut off.

5 This system can no longer
6 continue. CPS, ACS, family court workers are
7 so quick to remove children and often falsely
8 claim that a parent abused or neglected their
9 children but they're abused in the system and
10 they're abused by being ripped from their
11 families. That's abuse under Ace research, a
12 first childhood experiences. Then go on to
13 place children in foster care where they go on
14 to be physically, emotionally, mentally and
15 sexually abused.

16 Parents are affected daily by this
17 injustice system of family court. I am the
18 author of a two-time best selling book called
19 Punished for Protecting, The Injustice System
20 of Family Court.

21 This is a system based off fraud
22 and decent and more than often children are
23 placed in harm's way. We all must have a
24 moral compass and obligation to end this
25 nightmare. I strongly advocate for the repeal

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 of the Family Court Act, abolishment of the
3 family courts and arrest every single last
4 judge, every single last person that's
5 involved. These are crimes. They have
6 victimized our families. Ignorance of the law
7 excuses no one.

8 You can find me on Punish 4
9 Protecting, Punish for Being a Parent dot com
10 or on Facebook at Francesca Amato. And I just
11 want to read off some judges besides Judge
12 Zimmerman and all the other judges involved
13 that have been a part of the death of this
14 child and this poor mother what she had to
15 deal with. And I'm so proud of your
16 strength. I know you have faith in God.

17 Anthony McGinnity of Ulster
18 County. Maryanne Meisel Ulster County. Terry
19 Savona, Ulster County. Joan Picarillo, Queens
20 County. Lauri Currier-Woods, Orange County.
21 Joan Posner, Dutchess County. Michael
22 McGuire, Sullivan County. Tracy McKenzie,
23 Dutchess County. Sharon Lavallo, Erie
24 County. Mary Tarantelli, Chemung County.
25 Spiro Pines, Broome County. Michael Sullivan,

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 Chautauqua County. Alana Grubell, Kings
3 County. Peter Delizzo, who wants to give a
4 child to a man who is a pedophile and he's
5 actually wanted on the Interpol. He wants to
6 give full custody of this child who is being
7 protected in Russia.

8 John Starry, Staten Island. John
9 Brennan, Herkimer County. Leonard Steinman,
10 Nassau County. Matthew Cooper, Jennifer
11 Sketcher, Amy Ingram. These are some of the
12 child attorneys that lie constantly. Referee
13 Marilyn Sugarman. Janet Defiori, Chief Judge
14 of New York State. Who's been told by all of
15 my victims for years and years and years
16 what's going on. They know what's going on.

17 Lawrence Marks, Peter Matrone,
18 Debra Caplan. Patrick O'Sullivan. Sorry.
19 I'm Italian. And I tried to do it within
20 three minutes but I know didn't make that.

21 But that's the list. That's some
22 of the worst of the worst. But they're all
23 worst. Judge Morganthal.

24 Also part of my team is here
25 today. I have licensed social workers,

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 retired New York State Police, Constitutional
3 experts, doctors. You name it. Families that
4 are ripped apart. Dorothy's been put through
5 hell through this county. She's been
6 literally put through hell. ACS is torturing
7 her. It's disgusting what's going on and
8 we've had enough of it. We want to see them
9 shut down and held accountable. These are
10 good, good families. They're not on drugs.
11 They're not abusers. They're good families.
12 All we want to do is protect our children and
13 you all lie to us and tell us that you're
14 protect them by stealing them and endangering
15 them. It makes no sense. Abolish. Arrest.

16 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you
17 Francesca. Elizabeth Petrakis.

18 MS. PETRAKIS: Good evening
19 legislative panel. Thank you for having us.
20 I would like to send my sincere condolences to
21 Justyna. I'm heartfelt. Just horrible. I'm
22 a mother of three. My name is Elizabeth
23 Petrakis. Mother of three. Resident of Old
24 Brookville, Nassau County. I'm here to just
25 inform you guys about a few things.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Fact. There's one divorce to every
3 2.4 marriages in the United States. The fear
4 of the unknown during divorce continues to
5 affect millions who face divorce each year
6 feeling lost, confused and alone due to the
7 lack of resources. Divorce has been linked to
8 emotional and financial destruction. Drugs
9 and alcohol abuse, domestic violence, child
10 abuse, suicide and even the murder of a spouse
11 or a child. There are over one million
12 children affected by divorce each year.

13 Fact. When there are no real
14 resources people feel overwhelmed, lost and
15 alone. It is at those darkest hours that
16 terrible things can happen, including suicide,
17 homicide of a spouse or child or even a family
18 member. Divorce is not only financially,
19 emotionally and physically devastating but
20 also divorce kills.

21 I'm not a lawyer but I have had
22 firsthand experience representing myself just
23 as Justyna and other women here, and men I'm
24 sure, in my own divorce case that lasted
25 approximately ten years in Nassau County. It

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 was before Honorable Judge Anthony Falaga as
3 well as before Honorable Judge Stacy Bennett.

4 My case dragged out over many years
5 and cost over \$700,000 in legal fees. Due to
6 in part the frivolous motion practice by both
7 parties' counsel and adjournments by the court
8 month after month, year after year. I
9 realized soon that I was not only fighting my
10 spouse, I was fighting my lawyers. I was then
11 fighting the judges. Judges who didn't have
12 all the facts. Yet wrote decisions based on
13 misrepresentations by law guardians regarding
14 my children.

15 It was finally after almost ten
16 years, after severe physical, emotional and
17 financial devastation that our case was
18 appointed a referee by the judge. It was
19 miraculous. The referee was given an outline
20 of issues to address with counsel and the
21 parties by the judge. Both parties' counsel
22 were forced to sit and present all of the real
23 issues that were outstanding to the referee
24 and they were given a prompt deadline to
25 comply with options for solutions. My husband

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 and I had no choice but to sit down and
3 discuss the problems. Financial problems and
4 dealing with children issues and we had to
5 come up with solutions.

6 The referee would also assist to
7 resolve issues and a settlement would be
8 reached. Before an unbiased referee was
9 appointed to our case help and resources were
10 scarce to none. I too was lost and alone. I
11 soon realized that so many people were in my
12 shoes and I knew something had to be done.

13 In 2013 I created a company called
14 Divorce Prep School. What Divorce Prep School
15 is it provides a three-hour educational
16 seminar to empower and protect men, women and
17 children through the knowledge of certified
18 professional panelists. Just like you guys
19 are sitting there on a panel. The panel
20 included four judges, lawyers, financial
21 planners, child psychologists, mediators, life
22 coach, family therapist, forensic accountant
23 and more as people would navigate through the
24 arduous process of divorce. They could find
25 resources and guidance from these certified

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 experts so that they could stay in control of
3 their lives and not feel alone nor overwhelmed
4 before, during or after divorce.

5 The problem. In Nassau County
6 alone there are approximately 5,000 divorces
7 filed each year. That means there are 10,000
8 individuals who are in need of guidance and
9 resources. Prolonged divorced cases cause
10 emotional, physical prolong and financial
11 devastation, and even death to litigants,
12 their children and their families.

13 I know firsthand that the courts
14 haven't done anything to fix this problem.
15 The courts are also overwhelmed. They're
16 backlogged and they need help. While many
17 people are pointing the fingers at the courts
18 for what happened in this terrible case, and I
19 know it's easy to point fingers, I have to say
20 that there's a problem that needs a solution.
21 The truth is that it's not only the judges'
22 faults entirely. The fact is that the judges
23 and courts need more resources of their own
24 and they are in need of an innovative solution
25 that can help to ensure that something like

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 this that never happens again.

3 What happened to me after ten years
4 of litigating when the judge finally appointed
5 a mediator, not a mediator a referee, for us
6 to deal with issues, that was the only time
7 something got done on our case. That was the
8 only time we were able to resolve issues.

9 I am proposing and I would like to
10 formally and respectfully request that you,
11 the legislative panel of representatives,
12 collectively sign to sponsor an emergency bill
13 to Congress that will empower and protect the
14 lives of divorcing individuals and their
15 families through the knowledge of experts by
16 mandating the attendance of every divorcing
17 litigant to a three-hour informational
18 seminar. By implementing mandatory attendance
19 of litigants litigants would be able to find
20 resources from experts. The solution is that
21 litigants attendance would also provide
22 substantial funding to the courts. If the
23 issue is that there is no money for the courts
24 to hire mediators or referees -- I'm talking
25 hiring appointed referees to each case of a

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 litigated case. Anyone who files for divorce
3 has to not only attend a divorce prep program
4 or something of that nature, but also needs to
5 be appointed by the judge a referee and/or a
6 mediator.

7 My proposal would also raise over
8 \$1 million each year for each court that this
9 program is in and that money could be
10 allocated to hire mediators and referees.

11 If the question is what is the
12 problem? Is there a solution? Do any of you
13 up there, we're hearing all night that there
14 are problems. Do any of you on the
15 legislative panel have a solution in mind? I
16 think that we don't have a solution but I have
17 found a solution. I have worked tirelessly on
18 this. I have a passion. I have a fire inside
19 of me to help save lives and I have been
20 working on this since 2013. I know deep down
21 in my soul that a program that would be
22 mandated by Congress, signed by the President
23 of the United States mandating every litigant
24 to attend a three-hour educational program and
25 also be assigned referees and mediators for

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 their divorce cases things would be moved
3 along very quickly.

4 And additionally, a specialized
5 task force dedicated to assisting and
6 overseeing the hiring and progress of
7 mediators and referees as well as making sure
8 that cases are getting the attention they
9 deserve are moving ahead.

10 Here's the question. What is the
11 solution? It's not abolish and arrest because
12 everybody up there on the panel they're not
13 going to abolish and arrest judges. We need
14 solutions. People need --

15 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Can we give
16 everyone the courtesy.

17 MS. PETRAKIS: I also have to let
18 you know that it's true that judges don't
19 allow litigants to speak and lawyers often
20 times do not represent the real issues that
21 need to be addressed. And cases get adjourned
22 and adjourned month after month, year after
23 year and that's why families fall apart. Law
24 guardians that can be biased are appointed to
25 cases and it's terrible what can happen to

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 families. It's terrible that people are
3 dying. Spouses are killing spouses. Fathers
4 are killing their children. Vice versa. It's
5 terrible. When cases become acrimonious this
6 is what happens.

7 I would like to just let you know
8 that I have requested that this bill be
9 sponsored by other legislators. And I had
10 sent out many letters to and including Nassau
11 County Executive Laura Curran, Chief
12 Administrative Judge Lawrence Marks, Chief
13 Honorable Judge Janet Fiori, Chief
14 Administrative Judge Vito Caruso, Peter King
15 and others.

16 Now, I received a response just the
17 other day from Vito Caruso's chambers stating.

18 LEGISLATOR WALKER: If you could
19 just kind of wrap it up.

20 MS. PETRAKIS: I just want to say
21 thank you. That they said thank you
22 Mrs. Petrakis. Thank you for your email.
23 However, Judge Caruso would like to decline to
24 hear anything further of how you would like to
25 implement something into the courts to help

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 save lives.

3 That to me is very disturbing, and
4 I would like to ask again, respectfully
5 request, that you all as a panel collectively
6 sign to sponsor an emergency bill that would
7 empower and protect the lives of divorcing
8 litigants. And I would like for everyone here
9 in the public to sign a petition. Thank you.

10 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.
11 Evette Stark.

12 MS. STARK: I don't have anything
13 officially prepared. But it's ironic that I'm
14 following the last speaker. I just want to
15 say that the family and the divorce courts
16 involving CPS and every other known entity
17 they operate with judges in these so-called
18 family courts. They're really admiralty
19 courts and these are administrative. They're
20 not even judges with jurisdiction. They
21 violate the rights of the children in the
22 courts and myself as an adult just coming out
23 of a ten-year divorce. However, I was sued
24 for \$9 million last week for slandering my
25 lawyer ex-spouse. Part of the inside crowd.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 So, in reference to anything
3 involving family court and divorce court, I
4 think both of these courts need to be killed
5 and all of the people working for them need to
6 go to jail. Because, and I will tell you why,
7 because these are incentivized courts to
8 weaponize children with parents. That's
9 number one.

10 I just want to say I'm in
11 solidarity with many people who are here.
12 Because I have also gone to the congressional
13 hearing and I have also marched with many
14 different groups in Washington DC. The
15 Million Parent March, the Punishment 4
16 Protection Group that's here and also For The
17 Children people, as well as the American
18 Families and the American Parents March.

19 I have been to Charles Schumer's
20 office with ten people and met with his
21 assistants and talked about child protective
22 services and divorce court. You know what?
23 They are two sides of the same coin. And the
24 same abuses and the same deprivation of rights
25 and the same twisting intrinsically of the

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 facts that happen. Extrinsically and
3 intrinsically. Intrinsically everything is
4 twisted so the facts are wrong. Then the
5 court uses these facts extrinsically to give
6 you no money or to force the sale of your home
7 or to take your children away from you and put
8 them with abusive parents who are like
9 psychotic and are not being evaluated properly
10 by Child Protective Services.

11 I was forced to go to a referee
12 trial and I have a traumatic brain injury and
13 I have many physical problems. I walk with a
14 walker and I'm scheduled to hopefully have
15 surgery in a week on my back and even my
16 shoulder. But I have a lawyer spouse who's
17 threatening to through me out of my house
18 because my judge, Matthew Cooper in New York
19 City, along with Janet DiFiori who knows me
20 very well because I wrote to her for many
21 years, is threatening to throw me out of my
22 house.

23 Before I go I just want to say two
24 things and I want to read some judges' and
25 lawyers' names.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 First of all, the federal law, the
3 US code titled 18 Section 242 very clearly
4 states that any public official who violates
5 anyone's rights is committing a felony and
6 should go to prison for up to a life term or
7 receive the death penalty depending on the
8 circumstances. And then, I don't know if
9 there's a record here or not but I definitely
10 want these names put on the record.

11 In 2016 I wrote a letters about
12 Child Protective Services and divorce court.
13 I wrote letter to Loretta Lynch, who was the
14 attorney general of the United States at that
15 time. Preet Bahara, who is now teaching at
16 NYU, the US Attorney's Office from the
17 Southern District of New York. The Honorable
18 Andrew Cuomo, governor of New York State, who
19 needs to be removed. James Como, director of
20 the FBI headquarters, who's involved in some
21 of this impeachment stuff with Trump. Eric T.
22 Schneiderman Esquire, who was the New York
23 State Attorney General and seemed to be
24 abusing women or had some issues with some
25 violence towards women.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Cyrus R. Vance, who is a New York
3 County District Attorney's Office. David
4 Crowley, who is the assistant district
5 attorney. Senator Brad Hoilman, who is from
6 district in Greenwich Village in New York
7 City. Liz Krueger. Lamonte Montgomery. And
8 Letitia James, who I'm going to serve on
9 Friday in support of the Punished 4
10 Protecting. She was the city public advocate
11 then. Now she's the attorney general. Wait
12 until I serve these papers on Friday.

13 Congressman Jerrold Nadler. And I
14 had a cc go to counsel member Corey Johnson in
15 District Three who is in Chelsea, just next to
16 Greenwich, who I know personally. I know many
17 of these people personally because I don't
18 just live in my area. I protest. I show up
19 at town meetings. I'm very involved with
20 seniors in my community. I'm just appalled by
21 the continuation of the abuse and the
22 corruption and the violence of the child
23 protective services system, the family courts
24 and divorce courts. And I just want to
25 read -- I'm almost done -- I just need to read

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 a few more people's names on the record.

3 Matthew Cooper. Actually I don't
4 give these people any honorable names okay.
5 It's Matthew Cooper. He's an administrative
6 judge in an admiralty court. Jennifer
7 Schecter. Who just got like a promotion to
8 the supreme court who held a \$6 million
9 slander suit against me from my husband, a
10 lawyer. It was dismissed. But she held it
11 for a year and a half. So the referee judge
12 could use that against me. Against all my
13 Facebook information. Going to court with
14 many of the people that are here. And I told
15 the truth. She dismissed it because the
16 corruption is the truth.

17 Whatever this panel is presenting
18 is mumbo-jumbo. Half of you probably need to
19 go to jail. I don't know how many people on
20 this panel are pedophiles. A lot of this, a
21 lot of the information here and the underlying
22 system of business is about pedophilia and it
23 is about trafficking children and it is about
24 human abuse. Not just for children but for
25 the adults.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Okay. You
3 have to wrap it up.

4 MS. STARK: No. I want to read.
5 You will let read these names because these
6 are your judges that run your courts.

7 Debra Caplan, who oversee the clerk
8 of the court and ignored all my letters for
9 all the attorneys and judges oaths of office
10 and their bonds. Peter Multon. Lawrence
11 Marks. Referee Marilyn Sugarman. She should
12 be shot. Janet DiFiori ignored me for so many
13 years. Matthew Cooper again.

14 I want to say that my husband,
15 Richard Katz, needs to be added here. Jeffrey
16 R. Schissel, his accountant. I have not
17 included bankers by the way. These are just
18 lawyers. Jonathan Andrew Rappaport. Preston
19 Anvrams Leshings. Bill Vasaledes. He's out
20 of Astoria. Michael P. Joseph, who is my
21 husband's ex-lawyer. Richard Katz again, my
22 husband. Tim Corbo, the clerk of Matthew
23 Cooper. All the clerks need to be evaluated.
24 They're all trading bonds without our
25 permission. All of our cases are being traded

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 in the court room for CRIS. For the judges.

3 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Okay.

4 MS. STARK: Uh-uh. C-R-I-S.

5 Their private retirement systems. That's why

6 we're held hostage for ten years because

7 they're trading, they're bonding our cases.

8 They're bonding our slavery and our labor.

9 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Okay Evette.

10 MS. STARKS: So they make money.

11 I'm not done. Judges --

12 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Excuse me.

13 MS. STARK: Judges retire with \$7

14 million, \$5 million. Nobody knows about it.

15 They're not taxed by the IRS. Are you any of

16 those judges? I'm wondering. That's all I

17 have to say.

18 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Sara Dipper.

19 MS. STARK: Enforce the law.

20 Prosecute crooked judges. They are the

21 heads.

22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Sara Dipper.

23 MS. DIPPER: My name is Sara

24 Dipper. I am here on behalf of Punish 4

25 Protecting with Francesca Amato. I am one of

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 her many assistants, and I have worked very,
3 very vigorously for her for the past two years
4 advocating for other families as well as
5 myself.

6 I hold in my hand a copy of the
7 children's bill of rights and I have never
8 ever seen this upheld held in family court not
9 once. Do you understand? Not even once. I
10 have seen -- I will list the attorneys that
11 have completely ignored and judges that have
12 completed ignored these things. Ann Weaver.
13 Kelly Brady, who is the AFC for my children,
14 who if she is zealously representing my
15 children she doesn't even speak to them.

16 CPS workers Lea Sackett, who gave
17 testimony in court to the fact that my child
18 had his head put through the wall by his
19 father but yet that case was unfounded. No
20 credible evidence of child abuse. He has a
21 scar on the back of his head from that.

22 Laurie Miller who gave a false
23 report in court. False testimony on record.
24 As well as Clea French, who indicated me in a
25 case on absolutely no fact whatsoever. I

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 appealed it and it was overturned.

3 As well as Jillian Hill and she was
4 presented with pictures of my son's face with
5 a handprint across it where he was hit by his
6 father. And there was no credible evidence of
7 child abuse in that case either.

8 I am so sick and tired of missing
9 my children. I guarantee every one of you up
10 there have a child or grandchild or niece or
11 nephew that you all will love very much and
12 you would go to the ends of the earth to
13 protect all of them. Am I correct? Of course
14 you would. So, I would lay down in fire
15 before I would ever let somebody harm my
16 children. But I don't have the opportunity to
17 protect them because I have one hour a week
18 under paid supervised visitation.

19 I am so tired of the fake family
20 court system. Yes, I said fake family court
21 because it is not in fact a court system.
22 It's a for-profit business. The judges are
23 administrators in that business. Yet they
24 sign orders every single day destroying
25 children's lives, destroying parents' lives.

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 Keeping the protective parent who is trying to
3 keep their child safe away from them. Why?
4 Why is the court system doing that? Explain
5 that. I would love an answer for that
6 please.

7 Thank you very much Francesca.
8 It's all about money. It's all about the
9 fraud.

10 If the CPS worker who was up here
11 earlier stated how they lose sleep over their
12 stressful jobs and whatnot, it holds no
13 comparison to the amount of nights that I have
14 laid awake in my bed worrying about the safety
15 of my children and every other child and
16 family that I advocate for. I do this every
17 day, 25 hours a day, eight days a week, and I
18 do it because I want to change the system.
19 This system needs to be abolished. These
20 judges need to be arrested and put in prison.

21 I will name the judges at this
22 point that I am absolutely going to see behind
23 bars. I will not rest until that happens. Do
24 you all understand that?

25 Joan Posner, who destroyed my life,

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 out of Dutchess County. Took my children from
3 me. Kept me from my children for an entire
4 year. I couldn't even speak to my children.
5 I understand that there are other mothers and
6 fathers that have gone through that longer,
7 but every single minute you are not able to
8 have your child know that they are safe it is
9 absolute torture no matter how long it goes
10 on.

11 Joan Posner. Tracy McKenzie. Who
12 signed an order stating that I am not allowed
13 to speak to Francesca. Last time I checked I
14 had the freedom of speech. I have every
15 single right to uphold my First Amendment
16 freedom of speech. Joan Posner signed a gag
17 order saying I am not allowed to post things
18 on Facebook. Guess what? World, listen to me
19 on Facebook. I don't care. Any social
20 media. I am not afraid of these people. I am
21 not afraid of what they are trying to do to me
22 any longer because they backed me into a
23 corner and I will not back down any longer. I
24 got up off my knees because I am sick and
25 tired of this.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 The last judge I will name is also
3 Joseph Agito, who is the supervising judge
4 over in the Ninth Judicial District. He took
5 my children from me again. After Posner
6 already had done that. He took my children
7 from me after my life was threatened by my
8 children's father. I apparently coached my
9 children in that situation. That is
10 absolutely ridiculous.

11 As far as I am concerned, I have
12 never ever seen any attorney for the children
13 zealously represent their clients. If you are
14 representing a client how you do represent
15 them if you don't even speak to them? Please
16 tell me that. Because as far as I'm
17 concerned, Kelly Brady, who my is children's
18 AFS, has only talked to children maybe a
19 handful of times. She does not know my
20 children. She does not know me.

21 I'm so tired of hearing well, you
22 have to do this, you have to do that. I've
23 done everything that the court has asked me to
24 do. Everything. And I still don't have my
25 children back. Why?

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 They allow children to be, as well
3 as on top of keeping them from their parents,
4 loving parents, they overmedicate children to
5 chemically restrain them so they don't have to
6 deal with all the emotion and the trauma that
7 these children experience.

8 So, as far as I am concerned, the
9 pediatricians who prescribe that medication,
10 the judges who allow that, the attorney for
11 the children who allow these atrocious,
12 disgusting drugs to be prescribed -- my son is
13 on Risperdal. There is a lawsuit that was won
14 because men can grow breasts on that
15 medication. I begged to have my son taken off
16 of that medication and it has not happened.
17 He is ten years old, my little boy, and he
18 should not be on that medication because the
19 reason he is on it is to keep him calm and
20 keep him quiet because nobody wants to deal
21 with his emotions.

22 As far as I am concerned, Letitia
23 James, our attorney general, we served her
24 January 21st and she had 48 hours to shut down
25 the family court system and it's still running

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 right now. Why? She needs to be held
3 accountable. She's the one who is supposed to
4 be the one who is watching these judges.
5 There's no checks and balances in family
6 court. None whatsoever. If that is her job
7 as the attorney general then she needs to do
8 it.

9 As everybody that is in this room
10 and all the CPS workers that were in this room
11 earlier, quite honestly, I've only met maybe
12 three or four good CPS workers and all the
13 rest of them they're corrupt. In Dutchess
14 County the corruption is basically in the
15 water. I'm telling you. I have seen it
16 firsthand time and time again. Not only in my
17 case but in all the cases I advocate for.

18 I am tired of hearing moms cry to
19 me, fathers cry to me, I miss my children. I
20 need to be with my children. I need to know
21 they're safe. I am tired of laying awake and
22 crying and missing my children, holding their
23 stuffed animals, hugging their blankets and
24 crying. There are certain days that I cannot
25 even bring myself to get out of bed because of

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 the PTSD and the depression that I suffer from
3 because of this system.

4 We need to abolish the system and
5 arrest these judges and arrest these people
6 that have abused us. The social workers. The
7 people that have abused us should not be able
8 to walk around freely. They should be behind
9 bars.

10 As far as I'm concerned, Joan
11 Posner retired in 2018 and when I put her
12 behind bars that's where she will stay for the
13 rest of her retirement. Mark my words. I
14 will not rest until I know children are safe
15 and until I know that this actually changed
16 something and this is over because there is no
17 reason that any parent or child should ever
18 have to suffer through this again.

19 If any CPS worker or anybody
20 involved in this, a judge, attorney, whoever
21 they may be, can take your child from you that
22 day and go home and sit across from the dinner
23 table and look at their child and tuck them
24 into bed and get them up in the morning and be
25 able to hug them and kiss them any time they

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 want to, why am I deprived that right? Why is
3 everybody else deprived that right? There is
4 no reason for that whatsoever. God gave me
5 the ability to bear my children. I was
6 blessed by the Lord to have my children. So
7 how dare any man step on that. Thank you very
8 much.

9 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Mark Ronald
10 Simon.

11 MR. SIMON: Good evening
12 everyone. Condolences to the families,
13 Justyna. I'm here as a father, a grief
14 father, a minister and concerned neighbor.
15 There are two sides to the story. I know this
16 may not fit the agenda of this committee right
17 now but you need to hear from families like
18 myself and the people that have spoken
19 recently. I'm speaking from my own
20 experiences with the family court, with CPS.

21 We were victims of CPS in Nassau
22 County on and around 2015 by unverified
23 complaints by Dr. Bronz Coxio and Lisa Marti
24 from Long Beach School District.

25 In summary, my family and I were

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 victims of Hurricane Sandy and we were
3 rebuilding our home and there was a false
4 allegation of neglect. Long story short, with
5 the assistance of our public advocates, one of
6 them in the room, Dr. Marcus from Brooklyn,
7 and also concerned neighbors, the claims were
8 dismissed and they filed the case as
9 unfounded.

10 My question to this committee is,
11 why aren't the wrong doers that made these
12 unverified complaints and frivolous reports
13 not punished?

14 Currently, I'm a victim of
15 constructive fraud, malicious prosecution and
16 identity theft. Magistrates at Kings Family
17 Court are Nicholas J. Pollos, Elizabeth
18 Shannis and supervising Judge Amanda White are
19 all guilty of misrepresentations, conspiracy
20 against me at the Kings Family Court.

21 It has been over a decade, a decade
22 of me making complaints to state assemblymen,
23 attorney general, the president, Congress. A
24 decade, I want to emphasize that, against
25 these wrongdoers. Of recent, this is new

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 discovery now, of recent, after reviewing the
3 court filing with Dr. Marcus from Brooklyn,
4 usually when I went on my own to review the
5 court file at Kings Family Court they would
6 say there's certain paperwork in there
7 that's -- what's the word they used? That
8 it's proprietary or you can't view certain
9 paperwork in the file. It's not
10 confidentiality. Restrictive or something.

11 Now, just side bar, I've been in
12 other venues dealing with foreclosure because
13 of what family court has done to me and my
14 family. I was able to view files in supreme
15 court and federal court. Why is it in this
16 venue, family court, I'm not able to view the
17 whole file? That's another question I have
18 before this venue here.

19 Due to new discovery, they
20 mistakenly left an application that was filled
21 out by my now 18 year old daughter's mother
22 and it alleges that I was married to her and
23 divorced. This is a lie. I was never married
24 to my children's mother. We were young. Over
25 a decade ago. But I've just found out that I

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 have been maliciously prosecuted against under
3 false allegations. They had it in their file
4 that we were married.

5 I'm in the process of giving notice
6 to this fraudulent court. I've tried over the
7 decade to redress this issue. I've never been
8 served properly. There's no proof of service
9 on the record. There's no proof of
10 jurisdiction. I have hired attorneys. I did
11 it on my own. It's just a mess. They keep
12 adjourning, adjourning and no redress.

13 Prior to this I filed a petition
14 for visitation with my daughter in 2003. Long
15 story short, within that decade all my
16 visitation was violated by the mother.

17 When the Judge Amanda in Queens
18 Family Court, this is where the mother alleged
19 she lived, she ordered more visitation for
20 me. The mother maliciously used the court
21 system as a sword against me. Maliciously
22 filed two police reports during the era of
23 President Obama's era of reformation with
24 domestic violence and stuff like that.

25 Filed malicious, frivolous police

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 reports against me leading to my 11 year
3 tenure at New York City Transit as a bus
4 operator termination. Mind you, this time I'm
5 married with four sons with my wife, and I
6 can't tell you the amount of stress it's put
7 on my marriage and my relationship with my
8 daughter. Not even seeing my daughter, who is
9 now 18 years old, that hates me because she
10 says I gave up on her.

11 I painfully decided to not fight
12 and withdrew my petition for my first born
13 daughter. And the family court has failed my
14 daughter. The family court is not a venue of
15 adjudication. Nor just -- it's not just nor
16 or fear. It must be abolished. I stand with
17 Francesca Amato and the abolishment of the
18 family court and the child support agency.

19 In closing, there is emoluments
20 violations going on with these state actors.
21 Myself and others give verbal notice, verbal
22 notice that investigations be ordered by
23 remonstrance directly with the legislature
24 will be filed to revoke business licenses and
25 persecute bad state actors. Thank you for

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 your time.

3 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.

4 Anthony Cibell.

5 MR. CIBELL: Thank you for having

6 me. I'm going to go a little bit over three

7 minutes. First, I'd like to give notice to

8 the American flags there with their gold

9 fringe. We know what that means.

10 I'm going to say what I said

11 yesterday in front of our legislature. From

12 what I have witnessed thus far in the year and

13 change that I've had to deal with the family

14 courts and Child Protective Services, I can

15 tell you that these individuals are not in

16 fact government and are not de jour through

17 their private corporate statuses.

18 These courts are being run as banks

19 and involved in daily systemic fraud whilst

20 tearing families apart through methods of

21 coercion, intimidation and the fact that there

22 is no one that has accountability over their

23 nefarious acts while acting under color of

24 law.

25 The reason why I believe that it is

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 all too common to hear that these people that
3 we go to for help don't have the jurisdiction
4 or tell us that it's a civil matter is because
5 they do not wish to impede on the state's
6 ability to generate this blood money of Title
7 Four funding from social security. While no
8 one may be perfect no one deserves to deal
9 with these tyrants as they are far worst than
10 the enemy combatants that I once faced called
11 the Majilis over in Iraq.

12 I took an oath years ago to protect
13 the Constitution of the United States against
14 all enemies both foreign and domestic. These
15 judges have also taken a very similar oath
16 under the Constitution and have once sworn to
17 act under it and uphold it. Yet they are
18 not. That is treason.

19 While today I am glad to say that I
20 have identified the domestic threat, family
21 courts don't offer any constitutional
22 protection as they are private and not in fact
23 courts of record.

24 Make no mistake, when I might be
25 mentioning family court let's not forget the

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 other courts that handle matrimonial matters
3 which are under Title Four programs. The
4 judges in both venues are not acting in the
5 capacity of judges. They're paid
6 administrators under contract with Title Four
7 agencies. That means that their judicial
8 performance is tainted due to their emoluments
9 rendering them in no way impartial. You heard
10 it. These courts are not only defrauding
11 health and human services and the United
12 States government but they're operating as
13 banks through their grants and bonds that they
14 create off of each case.

15 These courts are not upholding the
16 United States Constitution as well as the New
17 York State Constitution. Yet the judges are
18 New York State judges.

19 The Constitution of the United
20 States has a 13th Amendment that no longer
21 appears on current copies of the
22 Constitution. The intent of this missing 13th
23 Amendment was to prohibit lawyers from serving
24 in government. I am sure that all of you in
25 this crowd here tonight have heard the term a

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 licensed attorney. Get ready for this in case
3 you guys don't know. There is no such thing
4 as an attorney license to practice law. The
5 United States Supreme Court held a long time
6 ago that the practice of law cannot be
7 licensed by any state. This was so stated in
8 a case named Schwarick versus Board of
9 Examiners 352 US 232 1957.

10 The issue today is that too many
11 people trust the concept of having an
12 attorney. Having an attorney makes you a ward
13 of the court. According Legal US dot com, a
14 ward is defined as a person, usually a minor
15 or incompetent who has a guardian appointed by
16 them to care for and take responsibility for
17 that person. As officers of the court, these
18 lawyers are bar British accredited registry
19 members are loyal to no other than that of
20 their Titled Four D and E gods and the British
21 crown, which they have sold their souls to.

22 Most of their day includes lying to
23 clients to entice them, deceiving parents and
24 leading them into more conflict and conspiring
25 with Child Protective Services to manufacture

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 lies. By applying the Corrupt Motive Doctrine
3 or Powell Doctrine to this current CPS Title
4 Four equitable fake court child trafficking
5 crisis, we can all prove, and I say we can all
6 prove here, the families that have been
7 victimized by this system. That any evidence
8 of a corrupt motive, any perjured testimony
9 and acts done in bad faith demonstrate
10 illegitimate and fraudulent acts, thus
11 rendering everything done to us as fruit of
12 the poisonous tree and that they were done
13 knowingly seeking a preordained result most of
14 the time done in ex-parte fashion. These
15 courts prey on families and rake in massive
16 federal funding.

17 This is a human rights crisis and
18 consists of many federal crimes. Our state
19 attorney, Letitia James, was put on verbal
20 notice on January 8 of 2020 about these
21 criminal enterprises which are masquerading as
22 serving in the children's best interests.

23 The attorney general was also
24 served notice by affidavit on January 21, 2020
25 in which we broadcasted live on Francesca

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 Amato's page in which now has resulted in 19.5
3 thousand views.

4 We had informed her that we knew
5 that she did not create this mess but she does
6 have the power to stop it as it is happening
7 under her watch. The state attorney general
8 has not yet responded to the people of the
9 state of New York. Instead she wishes to
10 focus her energy on tweets and things going on
11 in Missouri and instigating a propaganda
12 agenda of insinuating that the NYPD is
13 targeting MTA fare evaders only because of
14 their skin color.

15 Consider this all of you a verbal
16 FOIL request. Keeping in mind that you work
17 for us and not the other way around. We know
18 who the major stakeholders are in this
19 industry. Maximus Incorporated is under Soros
20 Fund Management. That means George Soros.
21 The guy that rounded up the Jews and he worked
22 for the Nazis, his own people, but now the
23 Internet wants to change history and says he
24 was a victim. 31 percent of their money comes
25 from New York State alone and they're

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 operating in many countries.

3 To our state attorney general,
4 you're supposed to work for us not for the
5 those who profit from human rights abuses
6 which are protected under the uniformed
7 commercial code. Because the United States
8 Constitution or New York State Constitution
9 doesn't apply in this venue.

10 Here is a list of what I'm asking
11 you, telling you, putting you on verbal
12 notice. A comprehensive financial report,
13 either a comprehensive annual financial
14 report, a CAFR or a court registry investment
15 system like Evette Katz mentioned earlier,
16 CRIS, of the following entities.

17 Suffolk County Supreme Court, 234
18 Griffith Avenue, Riverhead, New York 11901.
19 400 Carlton Avenue, John P. Callahan Jr.
20 Courthouse, Central Islip, New York 11722.
21 One Court Street Riverhead, New York 11901.
22 210 Center Drive Arthur Cromarty Court Complex
23 Riverhead, New York 11901. 3105 Veterans
24 Memorial Highway, first floor, Ronkonkoma, New
25 York 11779. Any others admitted.

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 Suffolk County Family Court, 400
3 Carlton Avenue John F. Callahan Courthouse
4 Central Islip, New York 11722. 210 Center
5 Drive, Arthur M. Cromarty Complex, second
6 floor, Riverhead, New York 11901. Any others
7 admitted.

8 Suffolk County Child Protective
9 Services.

10 Two. Presentment of the legal
11 structure, including type of entity,
12 certificate of incorporation, tax status,
13 capital structure, including identification of
14 all shareholders slash owners.

15 Articles of incorporation bylaws
16 for the following entities. Suffolk County
17 Supreme Court et al. Suffolk County Family
18 Court et al. Suffolk County Child Protective
19 Services.

20 Three. Detailed report of all
21 sources of income slash proceeds on a
22 case-by-case basis, names admitted, for fiscal
23 year 2019 for the following entities. Suffolk
24 County Supreme Court, Suffolk County Family
25 Court and Suffolk County Child Protective

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Services.

3 One more thing. Laws. I hear the
4 people mentioning laws. This is total
5 lawlessness and it's protected under uniform
6 commercial code and our kids are considered
7 commerce. That's the problem here.

8 When people say that CPS is being
9 weaponized against them it's no conspiracy
10 theory. Even Nancy Pelosi's son herself, Paul
11 Pelosi, who my good friend Patrick Howie, a
12 great reporter, he covered this story that
13 Paul Pelosi used CPS to steal three children
14 of his girlfriend Karina Fang.

15 If CPS is going to exist, this is
16 what I'm going to tell you guys, that they
17 should all be wearing body cameras. Believe
18 me, that will shut down their business a lot
19 and the state won't be able to make that much
20 money anymore.

21 If our state really cared about
22 families these courts would have adopted
23 criminal court evidentiary standards and
24 burned the proof a long time ago. Letitia
25 James was put on notice and I'm holding her

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 criminally responsible for in the death of
3 Thomas Valva.

4 Whoever was talking earlier, I
5 believe it was the commissioner of CPS,
6 mentioned the policies and procedures of CPS
7 is a total liar. She's knowingly provided
8 false information and should be arrested.
9 These people have sold their souls and lie on
10 a daily basis as they just did tonight. And I
11 also need to inform you that I have two
12 insiders in CPS agencies in New York State.

13 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Anthony, if
14 you could just please wrap it up.

15 MR. CIBELL: Yes. These fake
16 courts are actually being run as banks with
17 grants as well as bonds and securities created
18 off of each case. The judges are in position
19 of emoluments and there needs to be
20 investigations ordered by remonstrants like my
21 great friend just said to the legislature to
22 revoke business licenses and prosecute them.

23 One more thing. Two or three more
24 things. Today at 4:21 p.m., Daniella Royce of
25 ABC 7, who claims that she saw me speak

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 yesterday, she contacted me and wanted to know
3 about this story. And she said that I sounded
4 like a conspiracy theorist when I said that
5 these courts are doing all this stuff that I
6 just brought before you. And she even
7 questioned Justyna's credibility as being a
8 good parent when she spoke to me.

9 Also, Judge Lorentz, the other day
10 I happened to be passing by, I'm not even from
11 Long Island.

12 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Anthony
13 please.

14 MR. CIBELL: I saw him walking,
15 escorted by heavy brass police laughing
16 crossing the street. You know what it is?
17 You know what you got to do to make this
18 right. I just want you to know that you guys
19 were all put under notice tonight and we will
20 hold you under 18 USC 44 which is misprison of
21 felony and under the misprison of treason, 18
22 USC 2382. Thank you.

23 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.
24 Dorothy Price Hill. Certainly you have time
25 to speak but if you could try to keep it as

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 close to the three minutes.

3 MS. HILL: Yes. Absolutely.

4 Thank you and good evening. I work on Wall
5 Street for over 20 years so I'm sort of used
6 to burning the midnight hour so thank you to
7 everyone.

8 I just want to first and foremost
9 say to Justyna, and I was at the first vigil,
10 my heart completely goes out to you. That
11 Friday when I got the news I couldn't sleep.
12 I have two children of my own. I lived in
13 Germany not too far from the Polish border. I
14 spent many wonderful times in Poland. There's
15 nothing I know that can ever bring him back.
16 Our love for you and we will always be there
17 for you and your children.

18 I saw Gia last night. She's the
19 youngest of the three girls and I asked her
20 first if I could hug her and she let me. It's
21 about love. We're all going to come together
22 and we're all going to be there. So thank
23 you.

24 My story goes back to 2006. I was
25 a single mom living on the Upper East Side

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 working in private equity with a very good
3 job. I had full residential legal custody of
4 my twins after my first husband, who is now a
5 fugitive living in the Middle East, Brooklyn
6 born American man, I found hardcore porn
7 basically snuff porn. I don't know if any of
8 you know about that. But that was when my
9 bubble burst and my innocence was really
10 shattered.

11 He through the server at me when I
12 told him I was going to take it to the NYPD.
13 We were living on Central Park South. Really
14 living the dream life. My children were at
15 Christ's Church Day School, a private school
16 where the Trump children also went. I was
17 very active in our church living a very happy
18 life. I met a man online from Nassau County
19 on a friendship dating site. He didn't show
20 me his photo right away. I thought that he
21 was sort of shy.

22 A month or two later we finally had
23 a date in the city, and I got to know him over
24 time and I thought it was sort of an anomaly.
25 Wasn't the kind of typical guy that I dated.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 I gave him a chance. The person I gave a
3 chance to is now under investigation for the
4 murder of many women here on Long Island.

5 I'm going to tell you right now,
6 the family courts are so incredibly corrupt.
7 I found out today that the CPS is
8 electronically monitoring my 18 year old son's
9 email, which is a federal felony. I am the
10 president of a fintech company based in
11 California. Based on all of my background
12 having worked for Goldman Sachs and McKenzie.
13 We are developing software solutions for banks
14 to prevent money laundering from child sex
15 trafficking, organized crime, drugs
16 trafficking, arms trafficking.

17 When I confronted my second
18 husband, Christopher Wolf, and I will go
19 public and I have gone public as most of you
20 know. And by the way, Patrick Ryder
21 Commissioner of Nassau County Police believes
22 me, which is very nice. I went to Dartmouth
23 College with Senator Gillenbrand. She's my
24 classmate. Our other classmate is Alex Azar.
25 Alex is a wonderful man. He runs the

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 Department of Health and Human Services in
3 Washington and reports to President Trump.
4 I mentioned to him at our 30th
5 Dartmouth reunion what was going on and he
6 said Dorothy, call me. We will talk. We will
7 help you.

8 Fast-forward. I am the one who
9 wrote the 80 memo to the FBI about this child
10 sex trafficking out of Suffolk County and the
11 illegal secret parties being held in Oak Beach
12 being hosted by Joseph Brewer. My husband's
13 very good friend. And by Jimmy Burke, the
14 former Suffolk County Police chief, who, by
15 the way, the porn that was found in his duffle
16 bag contained allegedly two of the Gilgo
17 victims.

18 Fast-forward. I have gone to the
19 FBI. I have gone to Congressional Congressman
20 Suozzi, who refuses to return my calls.
21 Congressman Pete King was very kind and helped
22 me. The bottom line is that there's
23 additional DNA in the Gilgo case that I have
24 not yet submitted. I submitted human hair and
25 dried human skin samples to the NYPD because

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 Suffolk County Police refused to take it. And
3 guess what? They laughed at me when I went to
4 them. And so did the Nassau County Police
5 when I told them that jewelry that was found
6 on Peaches and her little daughter, that's my
7 jewelry that was stolen out of my jewelry box
8 by Christopher Wolf who went to CPS in January
9 2019, my second husband, no kids thank God,
10 said to CPS she's violent. I had to leave our
11 marriage. Dorothy's violent. All of you who
12 know me, I love to give hugs I'm
13 affectionate. I'm not violent.

14 Guess what? Three weeks later CPS
15 went to the Devito home in Manhasset on Castle
16 Ridge Road to my son, 17 years old, using
17 forms 1021 and 1024 and kidnapped my son,
18 placed him in foster care in Bay Shore. He
19 ran away I found out. Then they went to court
20 and accused me of child neglect because I did
21 not pick him up from probation after he
22 pummeled me in the ribs and I had to go to
23 Manhasset Northwell for emergency. My son has
24 a conduct disorder, which is diagnosed.
25 Probably from all the trauma of watching his

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 mother fight for justice in the Gilgo case.
3 But that's going to be blown wide open I
4 assure you. My daughters are doing
5 spectacularly well at Carnegie Mellon
6 University.

7 The bottom line is that Judge Ellen
8 Greenburg is personally responsible for the
9 harm done to my children. Also for not giving
10 me an order of protection against Chris Wolf
11 who strangled me in our home at 315 Manhasset
12 Woods Road and is telling CPS I'm the violent
13 one. Let them tell you one thing. Sadistic,
14 psychopaths with secret lives of sex parties
15 and online porn addictions don't make good
16 dads. And they certainly don't make very good
17 witnesses as well.

18 His employer has fortunately come
19 forward and told me they will fully cooperate
20 with the investigation because I will show you
21 right now that Megan Waterman, one of the
22 Gilgo victims, told her mom, mom, you wouldn't
23 believe some of the clients that I have on
24 Long Island. They include judges. Thank
25 you.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Meta J.

3 Mereday. Dr. Burchell M. Marcus.

4 MR. MARCUS: Greetings to one and
5 all in the neighborhood. My name is Dr.
6 Burchell M. Marcus. I'm community director
7 for the borough of Brooklyn and I'm also the
8 Brooklyn advocate.

9 I have been on this journey
10 fighting against CPS for over 20 years. I've
11 witnessed too many atrocities. I was one of
12 the local investigators on the Nix Mary Brown
13 case in Brooklyn when the children were
14 neglected and Nix Mary Brown was killed. It
15 broke my heart. And from then on I took it
16 very seriously to investigate how the system
17 works.

18 As of today, every time I step into
19 a CPS office they seem to be scared of me
20 because I have the laws on my side. I'm
21 speaking of common laws not admiralty laws
22 that's being performed in these courts. We
23 are not at sea. We are on land. Admiralty
24 courts have to go. All crimes are commercial
25 and when you deem our people, human beings, as

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 products you violating common law.

3 I have a master's in constitutional
4 law. I speak at colleges and universities.
5 And what I have seen over the years they don't
6 want us to speak at some universities because
7 we are exposing too much of truth. I just
8 want to ask real quick, how many of you have a
9 law degree or how many of have you studied
10 law? Could you raise your hands if you have
11 any knowledge of law. I guess not. Silence
12 is acquiescence.

13 Now, it's your job to abolish,
14 dismantle CPS and ACS. I'm going to fight
15 until I die and make sure that these courts
16 and this organization called CPS is no longer
17 in effect. We have to abolish it. Some of
18 these courts that are practicing maritime
19 admiralty law, as my colleague just mentioned,
20 the flags you have behind you are maritime
21 flags. They're not the flags of the United
22 States of America. They're the flags of the
23 United States for America. Is difference.

24 If you study law, read Blacks Law
25 Dictionary, it will tell you about all these

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 codes that we have been prosecuted under. Too
3 many families -- I have two cases right now
4 where ACS walked into the hospital and took
5 people's children away from them. That's a
6 crime. Under the Social Security Act of 1935
7 it clearly states that no agent should remove
8 any child without the consent of the parent.
9 Read it. ACS is violating human rights. They
10 are in violation of human rights. We have an
11 attorney here. He can speak on that.

12 Stop playing games with people. We
13 are not persons. We are human beings. We are
14 people. Black's Law Dictionary says that a
15 person, the definition of a person is a child
16 or one who cannot speak for themselves. So, I
17 am saying to each and every one of you it's
18 your duty to stand up. It's your duty to stop
19 this atrocity from happening. Too many lives
20 are on the ballot. It's time to shut it
21 down. It's time to shut it down. If you
22 don't take action to shut it down you all
23 don't need to be sitting up there. You don't
24 need to be sitting up there.

25 They spoke about the bonds. Each

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 and every case, all crime of commercial, each
3 and every case that goes into these admiralty
4 courts are being traded on the stock market.
5 Just go and check Dunn and Bradstreet. You
6 will see your name on Dunn and Bradstreet.
7 Your social security and your birth
8 certificates are being traded around the
9 world. Go and check it out. Stop deceiving
10 the people. Thank you very much.

11 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.
12 Adelina Blanco.

13 MS. BLANCO: Good evening. My
14 name is Adolina Blanco, and I am a resident of
15 Nassau County. I am here to talk about two
16 different sides of CPS. One, the side that
17 failed me when I was a teenager. When I went
18 to talk to my counselor about what was going
19 on in my home and they did absolutely
20 nothing. To the point where I had to leave my
21 home because they did absolutely nothing. I
22 turned out great by the way. I guess being
23 out on the street at 16 years old taught me a
24 lot. Taught me how to survive. Taught me how
25 to be a fighter.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 And I believe in this, everything
3 happens for a reason. It was God's intent to
4 have me here tonight because this is my first
5 time here. And listening to everybody, I
6 wasn't going to discuss the second side.
7 Okay? I was just going to talk about me. But
8 now I have to bring up the second side.

9 2015 my husband is arrested.
10 Because a scorned ex-girlfriend made a false
11 allegation against him. Okay? Her daughter,
12 that does not happen to be his child although
13 he has a child with her, according to CPS made
14 an allegation. There was no investigation.
15 Within 24 hours he was arrested. Okay?
16 Discovery was withheld from us. He could not
17 even defend himself. Okay? Put up my house.
18 Bailed him out. Three days later he had to go
19 back to where? Family court. Okay? Because
20 it wasn't enough for this woman that she
21 already had him arrested.

22 So now here comes family court.
23 Okay? 2015. Okay? It took us until November
24 of 2016 to have a trial because he would not
25 and he will never take a plea deal. Because

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 first and foremost, the first allegation that
3 was made we were out of the country. He was
4 not here. He was five hours away by plane.
5 Okay? That's one.

6 When we finally got the discovery
7 we found that the child upon questioning by
8 the detective, the arresting detective, when
9 questioned has she ever done anything to
10 herself, she said well, you know, two days ago
11 my mother did tell me to take something and
12 put it somewhere. I'm leaving certain things
13 out because she is a child that was instructed
14 by her mother to do something.

15 You know who should have went and
16 got arrested? Her mother. Okay?

17 Upon his acquittal, she decided
18 that she needed to take the next step which
19 was family court. So finally, in 2018,
20 everything in family court was cleared. So we
21 said well, finished. You get to see your
22 other daughter that you haven't seen since
23 2015. And he did the same thing that this
24 gentleman did. He said I am so afraid of what
25 she can do to me that I do want to even see my

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 child. Okay?

3 Think that's enough? No. Not
4 enough for her. She went after his job.
5 Which is the same thing that happened to that
6 gentleman. My husband lost his job. He was
7 working for the state. On an allegation that
8 he was acquitted for. Upon testimony in
9 court, okay, the mother lied 19 times. 19
10 times. The daughter lied 30 something times.
11 It took a jury of his peers 20 minutes to
12 acquit him on trumped up charges. Because
13 remember what I said, it was one allegation.
14 Okay? Then one allegation became 18 and I
15 became pretty good at being an investigator.
16 Okay? I had to help my husband run 24 hours
17 of the day for every other day that he was
18 alleged.

19 And there is corruption. There is
20 corruption in the court system. Which Ellen
21 Greenberg was my husband's judge too. Judge
22 Aaron, who already retired, made a guest
23 appearance at a hearing that was held against
24 my husband. The same judge that allowed a
25 woman that lied, okay, that gave her an order

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 of protection and now I know this, and this is
3 why I say everything happens for a reason. At
4 the time that she made the allegation she
5 stated that his older daughter that was in his
6 custody was her child. And that child is not
7 her child. So, for six months, okay, his
8 daughter couldn't even see him and he had full
9 sole custody of her from a previous marriage.

10 So we have a problem here. A big
11 problem. I forgot my paper. So I'm going to
12 try to remember every CPS worker's name that
13 came to my house. Okay? Vanessa Skeets.
14 Wait. Let's do it in order. Ms. Arnold.
15 Which did absolute no investigating. Vanessa
16 Skeets. Which was going to hit the home run.
17 Lorraine. Who I call the cleaner because she
18 was an aged woman, and when I said to her do
19 you have a son? She said yes. I said I
20 honest to God pray no one ever does this to
21 your son. Okay?

22 We are in what, 2020, right? The
23 woman is still going around slandering my
24 husband's name. Slandering my name. Telling
25 people she has an order of protection out

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 against me. Guess what? She can't. We have
3 no familiar tie. That I knew. Okay?

4 So we have to dismantle CPS and we
5 have to hold everybody accountable for it. He
6 has children that he didn't get to see because
7 of this for about a year. Okay? Then after
8 that he has a child that he hasn't seen since
9 2015.

10 And I know it's late but I'm
11 disgusted by the fact that CPS got to go home
12 and they didn't hear us. And when you guys
13 took your turn I know some people were making
14 noise. I was not. I was quiet and I was
15 paying attention. And I noticed and I
16 realized that you guys were trying to extend
17 the time. I know how it works. I attend
18 board meetings all the time. Okay? So I
19 apologize if we kept you here so long. But we
20 all voted you in place. So just like we voted
21 you in we can vote you out. So if you're not
22 going to do your job that is what we intend to
23 do.

24 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Steven
25 Kleinbart. Is Sara with you? Do you want to

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 come up together?

3 MR. KLEINBART: I'm Steven
4 Kleinbart. I am a survivor. Not as the
5 typical survivor that spoke before or others.
6 But I was taken from my parents with reasons I
7 won't get into that now. And it was not as
8 what others claimed as not nearly as bad as
9 was mentioned before. And had it just been
10 that I could have forgiven it and moved on,
11 here with my wife, if they only would have
12 left that part alone. But they continued to
13 go after me, my wife, my daughter and my
14 parents and that's why I am mentioning it
15 now. I would not have been willing to mention
16 it otherwise.

17 Now, I state several times by a
18 place where I saw a sign which I believe is
19 what every child should feel. It shows a
20 child sitting in a tree reading a book saying
21 this may not be Buckingham Palace but it's
22 home to me. That is a general feeling of how
23 any child is to feel by their parents. To
24 claim that a child will feel better in another
25 place or that the parents are unable to care

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 for the child, without any evidence of course,
3 is no reason at all to take a child away.

4 In December 2016 there was a
5 headline in the New York Post, ACS Doesn't
6 Care, and that was after the death of Jaden
7 Jordan, another child who was left to die by
8 social services. And he was another incident
9 of someone whose death was preventable. So,
10 there are numerous, certainly most, instances
11 of these cases when there is no evidence they
12 make everything wrong. There is evidence they
13 say there's no evidence.

14 I would like to add on that there
15 is an order to remove postings from the news
16 and not only is it unconstitutional but it's a
17 laughing matter. As a courtesy, I am not
18 giving names here. All involved know who they
19 are and all involved in the abduction of our
20 daughter and we've been through court. We've
21 already disproven every one of their claims
22 with irrefutable evidence. So if she remains
23 in this court it's hostage.

24 So all involved I'm giving you a
25 courtesy notice. You have thus far dug your

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 own graves. And if you continue any action to
3 continue this noncase you have buried
4 yourselves and you have caused yourselves to
5 be the shame of the world and you will be in
6 the news for that as a result of your own
7 actions. Thank you.

8 MS. KLEINBART: As you just heard
9 from my husband Steven, I am Sara. CPS has
10 been trying to force us to divorce. Yes, you
11 hear that. CPS of Kings County has been
12 trying to divorce us for four and a half years
13 due to three things.

14 One, that I made up that my
15 daughter has autism, which was diagnosed by
16 nine neurologists. Can you even make up
17 autism? Can you?

18 The second thing is educational
19 neglect. Despite the fact that we have state
20 of New York records, transcripts and proof she
21 was never once neglected. On the contrary.
22 From January 25, 2016 to October 15, 2018, the
23 day of her abduction, she went from grade zero
24 to fourth grade. Two and a half years of
25 seven days a week nonstop, Steven and Sara

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 Kleinbart, mom and dad of Hanna Kleinbart,
3 worked 24 hours a day with hired help to get
4 our daughter to verbalize, to communicate, to
5 socialize. Yet we were considered neglectful
6 parents by CPS.

7 The third reason why our daughter
8 was abducted in addition to what Steven stated
9 was, because mom created on February 11, 2017
10 pneumonia. Can a human being create
11 pneumonia? I was held hostage and was taken
12 away from my daughter for six months. Just
13 now, April 4, 2019, for six months because I
14 prayed in front of my daughter six feet away.
15 CPS stated it's detrimental. It's life
16 threatening if I pray in front of her. That
17 is unconstitutional.

18 Tonight, just before Steven and I
19 came here, three hours, CPS gagged us. We
20 were not able to talk. Not able to write. My
21 daughter has autism. She has not been allowed
22 to write anything. When she does they say we
23 are harming her. She's a visual learner. The
24 state of New York and the county, the district
25 stated she must be not more than six student

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 ratio. Three teachers. CPS placed her last
3 year in second grade and blamed us that now
4 she's two years behind in academics.
5 Furthermore, she is in a class ratio of 30
6 students one teacher. A child of autism,
7 autonomic nerve disease, asthma. They threw
8 her medication in the garbage. She has not
9 seen her GI in a year and a half. Can a
10 parent place a feeding tube into their child?

11 CPS stated I, mom, placed a feeding
12 tube into my child and had my daughter at age
13 eight years old state to her legal age
14 attorney mom harmed you right? by doing
15 surgery on you. I have no medical degree for
16 the record. Can I do that? Tell me how CPS
17 didn't lie to my face.

18 Judge Bendervale, Jr. of Kings
19 County, New York stated on October 15, 2018,
20 the day of the abduction, there is over 20,000
21 records. Nothing against these parents and
22 this family. Yet why was she abducted? Why
23 was she locked off from her entire family?
24 Why did CPS create two false birth
25 certificates? How is that legal? How? Yet

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 everyone is silent.

3 We wrote numerous letters to the
4 fraud department. That brings another thing.
5 CPS wrote in over 19 times parents are
6 lunatics. The child is not disabled. Guess
7 what? April 11, 2019 Steven and I found out
8 from social security state of New York
9 disability, ACS, I cannot mention the name at
10 the moment due to legal proceedings, the
11 agency that is holding my daughter hostage and
12 the foster-supposed family are all collecting
13 \$733 a month since the day of her abduction.
14 How can you state CPS is excellent when they
15 lie and fraudulently money laundering against
16 us.

17 One more tip of the iceberg. Get
18 ready for this everyone in this room. We,
19 here, are approved eight consecutive years by
20 the very agency under the state of New York as
21 foster parents. Adoption parents. And one
22 more. We are also entitled to have children
23 around the clock in our house. Which we do
24 have. We had hundreds of kids, I don't even
25 know how many, who've walked through our

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 door. Children who were beaten, abused
3 neglected, where CPS failed.

4 There was a child of 17 years old
5 who became crippled, blind and deaf and 80
6 percent paralyzed because CPS refused to help
7 this child. We have many more cases that I
8 can state but it will take at least another
9 two hours and I don't want to take anyone
10 else's time.

11 But each of you sitting there, you
12 go to sleep, hang out by coffee shops, go on
13 vacations. CPS stated Steven and I are no
14 good because our daughter, when she was eight
15 years old, requested to have a birthday party
16 by the president at the White House. Guess
17 what? We surprised her. First we did home
18 schooling. 7:35 a.m. Yes, you hear right.
19 Every morning our daughter was up at six a.m.
20 because that's what she wanted. She had play
21 time. She had three friends nearby who also
22 played with her. One of them was a home
23 schooled child. And guess what? 10:30 a.m.
24 she got break and we made that party at the
25 White House.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 We were told we're negligent. Is
3 it is? Three hours. 7:30 to 10:30 a.m. doing
4 schooling on her vacation. We are told we are
5 negligent.

6 Now listen to this and then I shall
7 try to close for the night.

8 Steven and I are standing here.
9 CPS has stated to us we will be most likely in
10 prison on February 25, 2020. February 25,
11 2020. Why? Because people around the globe
12 opened up a Go Fund Me to help us raise the
13 money for the legal fees because on October
14 17, 2019 was the first day in court. Since
15 April 14, 2016 our voice was heard. And
16 that's why they want to put us in prison. No
17 due process. We didn't get ever once served
18 by the judge, not by CPS, not by our
19 attorneys. My attorney stated April 24, 2019,
20 The reason why your daughter was taken was
21 because CPS needs a certain amount of
22 children. They are short. They need their
23 money. They need a paycheck and I do too. I
24 have it in writing. So no one can state I do
25 not have that.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 The next words she wrote to me was
3 beyond shocking. ACS doesn't care about you
4 or your child. They don't care if she lives
5 or dies. Don't worry. Everything is good.
6 But just keep it in the background your child
7 may die under CPS.

8 Now how is CPS helping? None of us
9 slept. Not a single person in my community
10 has slept. When three units of the police
11 department were called by CPS to surround my
12 home -- yes, you hear right -- and stated to
13 me, and that my husband was right behind me
14 and stated the following. You have two
15 options. One, go to prison now and you don't
16 see your child. Two, we take your child now
17 and you don't get arrested at this time. How
18 is that a help of CPS? Nothing was found
19 against us. We have clear, clean records.
20 How is that? I demand an answer.

21 My daughter is suffering --

22 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Sara if you
23 could just wrap it up please.

24 MS. KLEINBART: She's been
25 through CPS six months in a corrupt system

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 under the guidance of social workers that
3 they're teaching her to state she wants to be
4 adopted. Yet, they took away a year and a
5 half of all her related services and just a
6 week ago they stated in court mom and dad are
7 neglectful because they refuse to give therapy
8 to the child. How is that for a system of CPS
9 helping families and parents reunite?

10 I hope you take this to heart and
11 you bring our children home. We don't need
12 any more deaths of Thomas, Jaden or Zimmery
13 and many, many hundreds of thousands or more.
14 End this anti-Semitism. End human
15 trafficking. You want a job? There are
16 plenty. Don't waste our taxpaying monies.
17 Don't use special education children with
18 disabilities just because they cannot voice
19 their own. We are here. Please help every
20 one of them.

21 I end with a heart broken of
22 another victim of Thomas. He is placed on my
23 daughter's bed. Another child. That's
24 another reason why they're keeping my daughter
25 away. Because somebody who interviewed us

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 publicized on social media her bedroom.
3 That's not a reason to imprison me or my
4 husband. It's not a reason to take kids
5 away. I demand this end.

6 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Thank you.
7 Victoria Navaro.

8 MS. NAVARO: Hi. My name is
9 Victoria Navaro. My son Ray turned one in
10 July. He was taken from me in August because
11 a lieutenant of the Suffolk County Second
12 Precinct took the information from my ex about
13 17 unfounded reports that hospitals and
14 doctors made for my child that CPS unfounded
15 because there wasn't enough evidence.

16 Like these people here were saying
17 that there's not enough credible evidence. I
18 don't know why doctors don't have or aren't
19 credible when they're the ones making the
20 reports and documenting an eight month old
21 child being brought back to his mother with
22 bruises all over his body and CPS as well.
23 It's unfounded.

24 So ACS in Queens took that. Took
25 it because the lieutenant said I had

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 Munchausens. He called the law guardian in
3 Queens and said she has Munchausens. She's
4 imaging things. There were no bruises there
5 and there were pictures that day and when he
6 came back to me the following day he had more
7 bruises.

8 When I went to court I was ambushed
9 by the law guardian for my child and the
10 attorney for my ex who made the entire custody
11 hearing about what this lieutenant had said.
12 There was no report. There was no affidavit.
13 He wasn't even there. And my child, when I
14 left court that day a custody order was signed
15 behind my back under my petition. The three
16 of them went behind my back to another judge
17 two days later attempting to file a neglect
18 petition. They used that order that went
19 behind my back that I never got a copy of
20 until October. I never even knew it existed.

21 I was put through a fast track
22 neglect proceeding. I was forced -- I sat in
23 a room with social workers who tried to force
24 me to sign a handwritten document that said I
25 never saw any bruises and neither did the

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 doctors because that's what the lieutenant
3 told them. That the doctors had told him that
4 there were no bruises. That's how much damage
5 a police officer, like her ex-husband, that's
6 how much damage they can do because people
7 take them at their word. That's how much
8 power they have. He's still a lieutenant
9 somewhere. They just moved him around but
10 he's still there.

11 So are the two officers that threw
12 me in Stony Brook that day because they didn't
13 want -- they wanted to protect my ex. They
14 wanted him to take the baby home so that he
15 could come back with more bruises the
16 following day.

17 I do accounting for a living. I
18 feed numbers. I don't imagine things. My
19 baby never had a US passport and suddenly by
20 last Friday he was out of the country to a
21 nonextradition country. And they told me 24
22 hours after he was taken. How did he get a
23 passport? Who helped him get a passport to
24 get out of this country? I can never get him
25 back.

1 Health - 2-5-20

2 And this is what I have to live
3 with. Pictures of unfounded reports. This is
4 the social worker holding the baby. Taking
5 the pictures that were never reported. This
6 is what an uppercut on my baby looks like. Do
7 you really think these people have star
8 players? That's what a star player is.

9 Now my baby is gone and he has a
10 four year old brother who he hasn't seen in
11 over six months. Does he even remember his
12 brother? My son asks for him all the time.
13 He says Mommy, when is Ray coming home? I
14 don't know what to tell him anymore because
15 he's not even in the US. This is the amount
16 of damage they can do.

17 No offense to the police but they
18 contributed. I have Munchausens. No doctor
19 has ever claimed Munchausens. And the 17
20 reports that the doctors and hospitals made on
21 behalf of my child are being used against me
22 in court because I imagined all of this.
23 Imagined it? My baby was breast feeding when
24 they took him from me. They need to go. They
25 need to be abolished. They really do. I have

1 Health - 2-5-20
2 hundreds of pictures of bruises on my baby.
3 All of them are unfounded.
4 LEGISLATOR WALKER: That was our
5 last speaker. I thank you all for coming here
6 tonight. I thank you for staying. I know
7 it's a long night for all of you. Please get
8 home safe all of you.

9 (Meeting was adjourned at 12:35
10 p.m.)

11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATION

I, FRANK GRAY, a Notary
Public in and for the State of New
York, do hereby certify:

THAT the foregoing is a true and
accurate transcript of my stenographic
notes.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have
hereunto set my hand this 15th day of
February 2020

FRANK GRAY