# NASSAU COUNTY LEGISLATURE <br> 1550 FRANKLIN AVENUE, ROOM 126 MINEOLA, NEW YORK 11501 (516) 571-6292 

## Inter-Departmental Memo

To: Hon. Richard Nicolello, Presiding Officer
Hon. Kevan Abrahams, Minority Leader
All Members of the Nassau County Legislature

From: Maurice Chalmers, Director Office of Legislative Budget Review


Date: September 15, 2023
Re: Memorandum of Understanding between Nassau County and the Civil Service Employees Association (CSEA)

The Office of Legislative Budget Review (OLBR) has prepared this report to provide an estimated fiscal cost for Clerk Item \#269-23, which is a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between Nassau County and the Civil Service Employees Association (CSEA). The prior agreement expired on December 31, 2017, and this MOU ends a long period without a labor contract being in place. This MOU also includes the Nassau Community College (NCC) however, for the purposes of this cost analysis, OLBR and the Administration have only included the financial impact to the County.

If this MOU with CSEA is passed, the only remaining expired contracts will be with the Correction Officers Benevolent Association (COBA) and the Investigators Police Benevolent Association (IPBA). The CSEA MOU will be the fourth ratified contract that the County has entered into with a union since all the CBAs expired in FY 17. Previously, the County signed labor agreements with all three Police Unions, the Superior Officer's Association (SOA), the Detectives Association Inc. (DAI) and most recently with the Police Benevolent Association (PBA).

The Nassau Interim Finance Authority (NIFA) will still need to approve this MOU, and if approved, it will be incorporated into one consolidated Collective Bargaining Agreement (CBA) within six months of its final ratification. The Administration has informed OLBR, that they
anticipate support from NIFA because the Control Board, through their hired Labor Specialist, Mr. Dellaverson, was a lead negotiating agency for this CBA. Therefore, NIFA is aware of all the terms and the financial impact of this MOU.

The term of this CBA is for the period commencing January 1, 2018, through December 31, 2030. The timeline differs from the prior negotiated contracts, which included a shorter duration with an expiration date of June 30, 2026. However, in an effort to show that it remains consistent with the bargaining pattern of the current agreements with PBA, DAI and SOA, the Administration has separated the financial impact of the CSEA contract into two-time frames. Phase 1 provides costs of the Agreement through June 30, 2026; to clearly compare the bargaining patterns with the already settled police agreements. Phase 2 reflects the timeframe through December 31, 2030, to reflect the costs that are beyond the expiration of the current Police contracts. The Administration's cost of both phases is illustrated in the table below.

| CSEA$\$ \$$ in millionsCounty WorkforceJanuary 1, 2018 through December 31, 2030 (13 Year Term) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Proposal | 2020 | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2024 | 2025 | 2026 | 2027 | 2028 | 2029 | 2030 |
| General Wage Increases - 15.40\% (Phase 1) | 3.8 | 11.5 | 20.3 | 29.3 | 39.5 | 52.1 | 58.5 | 58.5 | 58.5 | 58.5 | 58.5 |
| NCC - Schedule C (Phase 1) |  |  |  |  | 29.3 | 30.4 | 31.5 | 32.6 | 33.8 | 35.0 | 36.4 |
| County Service Stipend (> 15 Years) |  |  |  |  | 4.6 | 4.7 | 4.9 | 5.0 | 5.1 | 5.3 | 5.3 |
| Excelsior 1/1/24 |  |  |  |  | (24.4) | (24.4) | (24.4) | (24.4) | (24.4) | (24.4) | (24.4) |
| Additional Premium Savings |  |  |  |  | (35.3) | (4.5) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Lump Sum - Full-time |  |  |  | 13.2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Lump Sum - Part-time |  |  |  | 0.5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| HRA Contribution (Phase 1) |  |  |  |  | 4.0 | 5.0 | 4.0 | 4.0 | 4.0 | 4.0 | 4.0 |
| Vacation - 2 Day Reduction |  |  |  |  | (1.5) | (1.5) | (1.5) |  |  |  |  |
| Additional 15 Minutes Per Workday |  |  |  |  | (8.3) | (8.3) | (8.3) | (8.3) | (8.3) | (8.3) | (8.3) |
| 20 Year Health Vesting (post 6/30/26) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | (0.1) | (0.3) | (0.5) | (0.7) |
| Termination Payment Schedule |  |  |  |  | (0.1) | (0.2) | (0.5) | (0.5) | (0.5) | (0.5) | (0.5) |
| Sub-Total Annual Net | 3.8 | 11.5 | 20.3 | 43.0 | 7.9 | 53.3 | 64.2 | 66.8 | 67.9 | 69.1 | 70.3 |
| Proposal | 2020 | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2024 | 2025 | 2026 | 2027 | 2028 | 2029 | 2030 |
| General Wage Increases (Phase 2) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 8/1/26 2.50\% |  |  |  |  |  |  | 11.0 | 12.0 | 12.0 | 12.0 | 12.0 |
| 9/1/27 2.50\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 10.3 | 12.3 | 12.3 | 12.3 |
| 10/1/28 2.50\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 9.5 | 12.6 | 12.6 |
| 11/1/29 2.85\% |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 9.8 | 14.8 |
| NCC - Schedule C (Phase 2) |  |  |  |  |  |  | 10.5 | 21.7 | 22.5 | 23.4 | 24.3 |
| HRA Contribution (Phase 2) |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.5 | 1.5 | 2.0 | 2.0 | 2.0 |
| Vacation - Provision Sunset |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.5 | 1.5 | 1.5 | 1.5 |
| Sub-Total Annual Net |  |  |  |  |  |  | 22.0 | 47.0 | 59.8 | 73.6 | 79.5 |
| Cumulative Total | 3.8 | 15.3 | 35.6 | 78.6 | 86.4 | 139.8 | 225.9 | 339.7 | 467.3 | 610.0 | 759.8 |

The longer term is seen as providing stability in the labor force as well as with the budget process. As reflected in the table above, the Administration estimates the total cost to be roughly $\$ 759.8$ million. OLBR's estimated cost of the contract will be discussed and compared later in the report.

The discussion on the next page provides the estimated cost impact of the new agreement from the status quo, as well as highlights of the key provisions of the MOU. For the latter, OLBR engaged the Administration to ensure that the interpretation of the MOU was as intended.

## Wage Increases

The table below reflects the scheduled General Wage Increases (GWI), as proposed in the Agreement:

| Proposed MOU Agreement |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | ---: | :---: |
| $\underline{\text { Phase }}$ | Date | $\mathbf{G W I}$ |  |
| Phase I | July, 1 2020 | $2.00 \%$ |  |
|  | July, 1 2021 | $2.00 \%$ |  |
|  | July, 1 2022 | $2.50 \%$ |  |
|  | July, 1 2023 | $2.00 \%$ |  |
|  | July, 1 2024 | $3.00 \%$ |  |
|  | July, 1 2025 | $3.00 \%$ |  |
| $\underline{\text { Phase 2 }}$ | August 1, 2026 | $2.50 \%$ |  |
|  | September 1, 2027 | $2.50 \%$ |  |
|  | October 1, 2028 | $2.50 \%$ |  |
|  | November 1, 2029 | $2.85 \%$ |  |

Through Phase 1 of the contract, wages for all active CSEA members will be increased annually by the GWI in July of each year, based on the percentages reflected in the table above through July 1, 2025. Through Phase 2 of the contract, all members will receive a $2.5 \%$ GWI every 13 months, which are due to occur on August 1, 2026, September 1, 2027, and October 1, 2028. During the last year of the contract, members will receive a $2.85 \%$ GWI on November 1, 2029.

After the ratification of this agreement, current CSEA employees will receive retroactive payouts from July 1, 2020. In addition, their salaries will jump to the wages effective as of July 1, 2023, which includes the compounded impact of the prior years' (2020-2022) GWIs from this MOU. In addition to the GWI increases above, members will continue to receive their eligible step increases which will boost salaries significantly. A key component of this MOU is the consolidation of all new salary charts with higher wages.

The impact of the compounded raises along with retroactive payments will boost salaries and help recruit and retain employees. The Administration and the Union believe the increased salary scale will rectify some of the recruitment challenges in many County departments. The County is replacing the existing "C" and "D" salary schedules with new schedules that will be slowly phased into one unified CSEA graded salary plan by July 2026. Additional details pertaining to the salary schedules will be further discussed under the "salary schedule' provision.

## Financial Impact

The chart on the next page provides OLBR's projected costs and savings of the contract by fiscal year. OLBR estimates the net costs associated with the contract to be approximately $\$ 765.7$ million. In addition to the GWI, the costs include the associated changes from the new salary schedules and inflators. Costs of approximately $\$ 1,045.8$ million are reduced by anticipated savings of $\$ 280.1$ million, from concessions in the contract for a net cumulative cost of $\$ 765.7$ million. The majority of the savings results from the change in NYSHIP's health care coverage, which will be discussed under the "Health Insurance" provision section.

|  | CSEA Labor Contract Analysis (millions) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 2020 | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2024 | 2025 | 2026 | 2027 | 2028 | 2029 | 2030 | Total |
| Projected Cost |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total GI Wage \& Salary Schedule Growth | 3.9 | 11.8 | 20.9 | 30.2 | 70.7 | 86.0 | 111.7 | 134.8 | 148.3 | 162.7 | 176.9 | 958.0 |
| Lump Sum Payment | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 13.7 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 13.7 |
| 15 Year Stipend | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 5.1 | 5.1 | 5.3 | 5.4 | 5.5 | 5.6 | 37.1 |
| Health Reimbursement Contribution | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 5.0 | 4.5 | 5.5 | 6.0 | 6.0 | 6.0 | 37.0 |
| Subtotal Costs | 3.9 | 11.8 | 20.9 | 43.9 | 79.7 | 96.1 | 121.4 | 145.6 | 159.7 | 174.3 | 188.6 | 1,045.8 |
| Projected Offsets |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Health Insurance Savings* | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | (59.7) | (28.9) | (24.4) | (24.4) | (24.4) | (24.4) | (24.4) | (210.4) |
| Reduce two Vacation/Personal Days | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | (2.1) | (2.3) | (2.5) | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | (7.0) |
| Eliminate 15 Minutes from Workday | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | (7.1) | (7.5) | (8.0) | (8.4) | (8.7) | (9.0) | (9.2) | (57.9) |
| Termination Payment Schedule | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | (0.1) | (0.2) | (0.5) | (0.5) | (0.5) | (0.5) | (0.5) | (2.8) |
| 20 Year Health Vesting | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | (0.2) | (0.4) | (0.5) | (0.5) | (0.5) | (2.1) |
| Subtotal Savings | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | (69.0) | (38.9) | (35.5) | (33.7) | (34.0) | (34.3) | (34.6) | (280.1) |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Estimated Contract Cost By Year | 3.9 | 11.8 | 20.9 | 43.9 | 10.7 | 57.2 | 85.8 | 111.9 | 125.7 | 139.9 | 153.9 | 765.7 |
| Net Cumulative Contract Cost By Year | 3.9 | 15.7 | 36.6 | 80.5 | 91.2 | 148.4 | 234.2 | 346.2 | 467.9 | 596.1 | 765.7 |  |
| *Health Insurance Savings is based on the Administration's Estimate |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Although the methodologies may differ for specific categories, over the 13-year term of the contract, OLBR's net cumulative cost is only roughly $\$ 6.0$ million higher than the Administration's and NIFA's estimated figure of $\$ 759.8$ million. The difference results from higher inflators used by OLBR to calculate the final costs. Both the Administration and OLBR used inflators to factor in the salary extras such as holiday, overtime, termination, and pension, among others. OLBR's inflators, which were based on the latest actual three-year average compiled from the County's W-2 data file, were slightly higher than the Administration, accounting for much of the difference.

The following are highlights of some key provisions of the contract:

## Salary Schedule

The total cost resulting from the salary changes is estimated to be $\$ 958.0$ million. The County agrees to replace the existing "C" and "D" salary schedules that have been in place since the expiration of the CSEA agreement on December 31, 2017. The current County "C" schedule is for employees who were hired on or after January 1, 1997, but prior to April 1, 2014. The current County "D" schedule is for employees hired on or after April 1, 2014, and is the schedule that a new hire would currently be placed on, prior to this proposed MOU.

Effective January 1, 2024, the current salary schedules will be increased to $60 \%$ of the difference between the Nassau Community College's (NCC) Schedule "C" plan and the current salary schedules. The new salary chart is appealing because the percentage impact for a new hire on this new schedule compared to the current "D" schedule, ranges between $13.8 \%$ through $28.2 \%$ depending on step and grade; with wage values growing by a minimum of \$5,805 for a starting salary at OA/OB in a low grade to roughly $\$ 27,216$ for a Top Step 11 in the highest grade. Appendix A shows the percentage and associated dollar impact by grade of the change in the employee's salary as of January 1, 2024.

After a $21 / 2$ year term on the $60 \%$ schedule, effective on July 1, 2026, the existing salary schedules will move to $100 \%$ of the difference between NCC Schedule "C" and all the existing County salary schedules. The difference in current starting salary compared to the new salary chart on August

1, 2026, ranges from $27.3 \%$ to $53.5 \%$; with wage values growing by $\$ 11,011$ for a starting salary in the lowest grade to roughly $\$ 54,035$ for the Top Step in the highest grade. Appendix B reflects this percentage impact by grade of the change in the employee's salary on August 1, 2026.

To provide an example of the magnitude of the chart change, the current salary of a Grade 10 step 5 employee on the current Schedule "D" would increase by $\$ 14,758$, or $29.2 \%$ by January 1,2024 (refer to Appendix A). The same employee's salary would grow by $55.4 \%$ at the same step by August 1, 2026 (refer to Appendix B). Hiring and retention will improve greatly under the new charts which had been an impediment with the current chart.

However, OLBR has brought to the Administration's attention that certain grades and steps on the new CSEA Salary Schedules (mainly the initial steps) may not comply with Nassau County's Living Wage Law and/or NYS Minimum Wage law. Nassau County's Living Wage Law currently requires a minimum hourly wage of $\$ 16.12$ per hour. The Living Wage will increase on August 1 of each year by a measure of the Consumer Price Index (CPI), commonly referred to as inflation. New York State Minimum Wage in Nassau County will rise to $\$ 17.00$ per hour on January 1, 2026, and then each January thereafter will increase by a measure of CPI. All employers in Nassau County are required to pay the higher of these two hourly wages.

The Administration explained that "the Living Wage law is addressed by the Department of Human Resources." And the County will be complying as the current practice of a supplemental payroll, also known as a "Living Wage Allowance," will continue for employees who are not compensated as per the minimum wage and living wage laws. This will be an added cost for the County but is expected to be minimal.

## Lump Sum Payment

Every full-time CSEA member scheduled to work at least 35 hours per week, shall receive a signing bonus of $\$ 3,000$. Full-time employees scheduled to work less than 35 hours per week will receive a signing bonus of $\$ 1,000$ except for part-time and seasonal employees who shall receive a bonus of $\$ 250$. Signing bonus shall be paid to each eligible employee in active status on the date of full and final ratification. OLBR is projecting a lump sum payment cost of $\$ 13.7$ million in FY 23.

## Retroactive Wages (FY 20, FY 21, FY 22 and FY 23)

Every active employee, and any employee who is deceased or retired prior to the ratification date, will receive payment for service under the above schedule of General Wage Increases. The cost for FY 20, FY 21 and FY 22 is approximately $\$ 36.6$ million. The cost for FY 23 could be up to $\$ 30.2$ million, depending on the timing of payments. The Administration has stated that these payments will be made before the end of FY 23. There are no additional retroactive adjustments for wages for any other prior period. This expense is already captured in the GWI calculations previously discussed above and is not an additional cost.

## Stipend-Fifteen Years

Every member of the bargaining unit, who has attained at least fifteen years of service as a Nassau County employee, as of January 1, 2024, shall receive an annual stipend of $\$ 2,000$. The stipend will increase by the GWIs thereafter and will be considered as part of the base earnings, for
purposes of all premium pay calculations. Every eligible member of the bargaining unit after January 1, 2024, will receive the stipend, at the then prevailing rate. The cost associated with this clause, over the term of the contract, is approximately $\$ 37.1$ million through FY 30.

## Health Insurance - Excelsior

Effective by January 1, 2024, all active and retired employees represented by the Union will have their health coverage provided by the New York State Health Insurance Program (NYSHIP) Excelsior Plan. Approximately $75.1 \%$ of the expected savings from this MOU are from the change in health insurance coverage and based off an actuary report commissioned by the Administration. The new coverage applies to the employee, spouse, and dependents for all active employees and retirees. The Excelsior Plan is an option within the NYSHIP program that includes the same network providers, which according to the union, offers public employers and their employees affordability including many of the same features and benefits of the Empire Plan. The savings to the County will result from decreased premium costs as the plan requires higher copays and deductibles compared to the Empire Plan.

According to the Administration, the current Empire and Blue Cross Blue Shield coverages will be removed and replaced by Excelsior, but coverage remains under the NYSHIP umbrella. It has been explained, as per New York State Department of Civil Service, that the County cannot change the coverage for only a portion of the workforce, since NYSHIP requires that the coverage must be replaced for the entire Employer's unit (active and retirees).

Currently there are significant rate differences between the Empire and Excelsior plans. If the savings are calculated on a straight-line method, taking the variance between the cost of the two plans for the current County's active headcount and the retirees, OLBR estimates that these savings based on the current premiums could be more than double the Administration's estimate of \$210.4 million used in the summary report. The table below compares the current annual health insurance rates for the Empire plan compared to the Excelsior plan for active, retired and Medicare eligible employees:

## 2023 Empire vs. Excelsior Rates

| Actives and Non-Medicare Eligible Retirees |  |  |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Plan | Empire | Excelsior | Difference |
| Family | 37,070 | 25,174 | $(11,896)$ |
| Individual | 15,700 | 13,159 | $(2,541)$ |
| Medicare Eligible Retirees |  |  |  |
| Medicare Individual | 5,564 | 864 | $(4,700)$ |
| Medicare Family (1 primary) | 15,898 | 4,420 | $(11,478)$ |
| Medicare Family (2 or more primary, | 14,503 | 2,992 | $(11,510)$ |
| *Medicare Individual - only one enrollee who is Medicare primary. |  |  |  |
| *Medicare Family 1 -Family at least two persons, but only one Medicare primary. |  |  |  |
| *Medicare Family 2 -Family at least two persons, with two Medicare primary. |  |  |  |

The Administration hired an actuarial consultant, to review the cost implications of this transition. OLBR was informed by the Administration that the entire savings cannot be realized, since there are many other factors that need to be taken into consideration, which will redistribute as well as
diminish the values. The Administration reviewed with OLBR a draft of the consultant's report that provides a summary of the potential savings from switching health insurance plans.

According to the consultant's report, the potential projected savings, based on the current premium structure, before any adjustments are made is roughly $\$ 222.1$ million in the first three years (20242026).

However, according to the consultant's report, significant discounts need to be applied, which offset the stated savings from the current premium structure. The Administration points out adjustments for geographic area, County demographics, the future changing enrollment ratio between single and family plan as well as adjusting for the current employees who were hired after April 2014 and contribute $15 \%$ towards their plan.

Over the entire 13-year term of the contract, after all the above deductions are made, the total initial estimated savings of $\$ 537.7$ million is reduced by $\$ 308.1$ million to an adjusted savings total of $\$ 229.7$ million. According to the Administration, they removed an additional $\$ 19.3$ million to reduce the savings for the College portion, which results in a figure of roughly $\$ 210.4$ million.

The Administration further provided the bullets below to explain why these adjustments were needed:

- "The underwriting multiple (family premium divided by individual premium) for the nonMedicare plan is significantly understated compared to industry norms. This will have to be adjusted with the large influx of new members.
- The pricing relativity (cost-sharing) between the Excelsior Plan and the Empire Plan is understated.
- With the influx of CSEA, this statewide plan becomes influenced by the higher downstate cost of services".

In order to be conservative and not overstate the value of the savings, OLBR has included the Administration's discounted value, based on the actuarial consultant's report, which is estimated to be roughly $\$ 210.4$ million. The Administration assumes that the savings will be roughly $\$ 59.7$ million in FY 24 and $\$ 28.9$ million in FY 25, thereafter the value decreases to $\$ 24.4$ million annually from FY 26 through FY 30.

The MOU includes a provision regarding this change in health insurance coverage which states "in the event that any aspect of the transition to NYSHIP Excelsior is determined to be impermissible by a Court of competent jurisdiction or an action from the New York State Department of Civil Service, this Agreement will reopen to allow the parties to refashion the Agreement to ensure the net costs of the Agreement are equivalent to the net costs before such determination of impermissibility was made".

The analysis includes $\$ 37.0$ million in costs for Health Care Contributions. With the transition to this new coverage, the County will also create a Health Reimbursement Arrangement (HRA) with an annual contribution of $\$ 4.0$ million (pro-rata on a monthly basis). The Union and the County will design, jointly the disbursement process but the County's contribution is fixed at $\$ 4.0$
million per year. The County will make a one-time contribution of $\$ 1.0$ million to the HRA on or about July 1, 2025. The fixed annual contribution (pro-rata on a monthly basis) will be increased to $\$ 5.0$ million on July 1, 2026 and $\$ 6.0$ million on July 1, 2027 and annually thereafter. These amounts will be reviewed based on experience during FY 24 and FY 25 to determine if the intent of the parties is being served.

Employees who maintain alternative health insurance coverage, will have the option to opt-out of health care coverage with the County effective in the FY 23 plan year. They will be eligible to receive an annual opt-out payment of $\$ 2,000$ for waived individual coverage, and $\$ 4,000$ for waived family coverage. This is an increase from the current maximum of $\$ 500$ for individual and $\$ 2,000$ for family.

As part of the agreement, the flexible spending program (FSA 125) will be made available to the bargaining unit, as soon as possible, after full and final ratification.

## Rules - Vacation Leave and Personal Leave

Each full-time employee (except School Crossing Guards) shall be entitled to a merged time off bank inclusive of vacation leave and personal leave. This bank will be posted to the employees' benefit each year, in advance, on January 1. In exchange for which, current contractual entitlements shall be reduced by two days per year, per employee, after he/she has attained three years or more of service.

This provision does not modify any existing rules or policies relating to utilization of leave balances. In the absence of a separate agreement, this provision, in its entirety, will sunset (become inoperative) after the FY 26 vacation year. OLBR includes a total savings of $\$ 7.0$ million for the additional two days worked per year for the years FY 24 - FY 26.

## Workday Extension

The regular workday shall be lengthened by 15 minutes attached at the end of the daily schedule for a total of seven hours per appearance. This increase in work time will not increase any compensation nor diminish any overtime rate. The current practice of excusing lateness of less than six minutes shall be eliminated. OLBR has calculated a savings of $\$ 57.9$ million for this provision.

## Rules - 20 Year Health Care Vesting

Effective on and after June 30, 2026, only employees who retire with at least 20 years of County service will be eligible to continue health benefits in retirement. However, through June 29, 2026, the service requirement remains 10 years. Disability retirees will continue to receive health benefits under the rules in effect on January 1, 2018.

Currently, the County only requires a minimum of ten years of service to receive retirement health benefits. OLBR has estimated that the savings, which grow annually, in the health insurance costs from the 20 -year service requirement to be roughly $\$ 2.1$ million through 2030. In addition, the Administration further takes the position that this provision will reduce the County's liability for the Other Post Employment Benefits (OPEB) filing that is required under GASB 45.

## Rules - Termination Pay

Terminal pay may be paid in a single lump sum or in three equal annual installments, at the employee's option. All terminal payments shall be paid at the rate of pay earned at the time of retirement. Terminal pay will be capped at one and one-half years of salary for any member of the bargaining unit hired on or after the date of execution of this Agreement. The County will make best efforts to make such termination payments within 60 days of the employee's termination date. In addition to the new termination cap for new members, this provision eliminates postretirement GWIs from all termination payments. OLBR has estimated savings of $\$ 2.8$ million over the life of this contract as a result of this provision.

## Additional Rules

The following highlights additional Rules of the Contract:
> The County shall establish a supplemental payroll to be paid to employees bi-weekly in the week following the existing payroll period. Such supplemental payroll shall include the timely payment of overtime wages incurred during the regular payroll period.
$>$ The County may implement a fully electronic payroll subject to the constraints of the New York State Labor Law. The electronic payroll will obligate direct deposit of pay and pay advice (pay stubs) available electronically. This provision will not be effective until agreed upon by organizations representing at least half of the County's represented work force.
$>$ Subject to legal and administrative constraints, the Employer will establish a 401(a) program.
> "Emergency Leave" provisions shall be revised to limit future applicability to four days for any occurrence (Section 44-14 Absence- Ex-traordinary Circumstances).

## Other Provisions

The parties will meet after member ratification of this Agreement to review any special circumstances pertaining to members of the bargaining unit currently participating in EmblemHealth-HIP or VYTRA. This review will analyze the viability of any option which does not conflict with this Agreement and the rules of the New York State Department of Civil Service.

The Parties have participated jointly in the negotiation and drafting of this Agreement and the parties have availed themselves of the advice of counsel. In the event an ambiguity or question of intent or interpretation arises, this Agreement shall be construed as if drafted jointly by the parties and no presumption or burden of proof shall arise favoring or disfavoring any Party by virtue of the authorship of any of the provisions of this Agreement.

## Reopener Clause

This agreement does not include a reopener clause.

## Conclusion

The proposed MOU ends nearly a six-year stalemate where no contract has been in effect between the County and CSEA. The Union asserts that this MOU will provide more competitive wages as well as stability to employees and help reduce the hiring constraints that have made it difficult to
recruit and retain employees; the County asserts that there will be fiscal consistency, and as such, the MOU should harmonize the relationship between both parties. The MOU was approved by the voting union members and leadership by roughly a $79 \%$ approval vote ( 2,321 to 614 ).

The Administration has affirmed that the proposed MOU conforms with NIFA requirements, and the Agreement was negotiated with NIFA being a party to the terms and cost estimates from the MOU. As such, it is expected that the agreement will gain the support of the Control Board. If this Agreement passes, the only remaining expired contracts will be with COBA and the IPBA. The County will now have MOUs in effect with CSEA and all three Police Unions (PBA, DAI and SOA).

OLBR estimates the cost of the MOU to be approximately a net of $\$ 765.7$ million over the term covered by the Agreement which is close to NIFA and the Administration's estimate. In exchange for the new and more attractive salary charts, a signing bonus, retro pay, stipend and an HRA contribution, the CSEA union members will transition to the Excelsior Plan which will offer large savings to the County to offset the costs.

Furthermore, the costs were anticipated when the FY 23 operating budget was drafted and as such there is funding to absorb the award in the current budget.

cc: Arthur Walsh, Chief Deputy Executive<br>Andrew Persich, Budget Director, OMB<br>Tatum Fox, Deputy County Executive<br>Dennis Steiner, Senior Budget Examiner<br>Chris Ostuni, Majority Counsel<br>Meredith Hughes, Legal Director and Deputy Majority Counsel<br>Michele Darcy, Minority Finance Director<br>Cecilia Capers, Deputy Minority Counsel<br>Michael Pulitzer, Clerk of the Legislature<br>James Darcy, Counsel to the Legislative Clerk

## Appendix A <br> Percentage Difference In Starting Salary By January 2024

| Grade | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { 0A } \\ \text { 1ST } 1 / 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 0B } \\ \text { 2ND } 1 / 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 1 \\ 2 R D \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | 3TH YR | $\begin{gathered} 3 \\ 4 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | 5TH YR | $\begin{gathered} \hline 5 \\ 6 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 6 \\ 7 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 7 \\ \text { 8TH YR } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 8 \\ \text { 9TH YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 9 \\ 10 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 10 \\ \text { 11TH YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{c\|} \hline 11 \\ \text { 12TH YR } \\ \hline \end{array}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 301 | 28.2\% | 27.1\% | 34.6\% | 33.4\% | 32.8\% | 32.1\% | 31.5\% | 31.4\% | 31.4\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 302 | 27.9\% | 26.9\% | 34.4\% | 33.2\% | 32.5\% | 31.9\% | 31.3\% | 31.2\% | 31.1\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 303 | 27.6\% | 26.6\% | 34.1\% | 32.9\% | 32.3\% | 31.7\% | 31.1\% | 31.0\% | 30.9\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 304 | 27.3\% | 26.4\% | 33.9\% | 32.7\% | 32.1\% | 31.5\% | 30.8\% | 30.8\% | 30.7\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 305 | 27.0\% | 26.1\% | 33.7\% | 32.5\% | 31.8\% | 31.2\% | 30.6\% | 30.5\% | 30.4\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 306 | 26.7\% | 25.8\% | 33.4\% | 32.2\% | 31.6\% | 31.0\% | 30.3\% | 30.2\% | 30.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 307 | 26.3\% | 25.5\% | 33.2\% | 32.0\% | 31.3\% | 30.7\% | 30.1\% | 30.0\% | 29.9\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 308 | 25.9\% | 25.2\% | 32.8\% | 31.7\% | 31.0\% | 30.4\% | 29.8\% | 29.7\% | 29.6\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 309 | 25.5\% | 24.9\% | 32.5\% | 31.3\% | 30.7\% | 30.1\% | 29.5\% | 29.4\% | 29.4\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 310 | 25.1\% | 24.5\% | 32.2\% | 31.0\% | 30.4\% | 29.8\% | 29.2\% | 29.2\% | 29.1\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 311 | 24.8\% | 24.2\% | 31.9\% | 30.7\% | 30.1\% | 29.5\% | 29.0\% | 28.9\% | 28.8\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 312 | 24.4\% | 23.9\% | 31.6\% | 30.5\% | 29.9\% | 29.3\% | 28.7\% | 28.6\% | 28.6\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 313 | 24.0\% | 23.6\% | 31.3\% | 30.2\% | 29.6\% | 29.0\% | 28.5\% | 28.4\% | 28.3\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 314 | 23.7\% | 23.3\% | 31.0\% | 29.9\% | 29.4\% | 28.8\% | 28.2\% | 28.2\% | 28.1\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 315 | 23.4\% | 23.0\% | 30.8\% | 29.7\% | 29.1\% | 28.6\% | 28.0\% | 28.0\% | 27.9\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 316 | 23.1\% | 22.7\% | 30.6\% | 29.5\% | 28.9\% | 28.4\% | 27.8\% | 27.8\% | 27.7\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 317 | 22.8\% | 22.5\% | 30.4\% | 29.3\% | 28.7\% | 28.2\% | 27.6\% | 27.6\% | 27.6\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 318 | 22.6\% | 22.3\% | 30.2\% | 29.1\% | 28.5\% | 28.0\% | 27.5\% | 27.4\% | 27.4\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 319 | 22.4\% | 22.1\% | 30.0\% | 29.0\% | 28.4\% | 27.9\% | 27.4\% | 27.3\% | 27.3\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 320 | 22.2\% | 22.0\% | 29.9\% | 28.8\% | 28.3\% | 27.8\% | 27.2\% | 27.2\% | 27.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 321 | 22.1\% | 21.9\% | 29.8\% | 28.7\% | 28.2\% | 27.7\% | 27.2\% | 27.1\% | 27.1\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 322 | 22.0\% | 21.8\% | 29.7\% | 28.6\% | 28.1\% | 27.6\% | 27.1\% | 27.0\% | 27.0\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 323 | 21.9\% | 21.7\% | 29.6\% | 28.5\% | 28.0\% | 27.6\% | 27.0\% | 26.9\% | 26.9\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 324 | 21.7\% | 21.5\% | 29.5\% | 28.4\% | 27.9\% | 27.4\% | 26.9\% | 26.9\% | 26.9\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 325 | 21.6\% | 21.4\% | 29.4\% | 28.3\% | 27.8\% | 27.3\% | 26.8\% | 26.8\% | 26.8\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 326 | 21.5\% | 21.4\% | 29.3\% | 28.3\% | 27.8\% | 27.3\% | 26.8\% | 26.8\% | 26.8\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |
| 327 | 21.4\% | 21.3\% | 29.2\% | 28.2\% | 27.7\% | 27.2\% | 26.7\% | 26.7\% | 26.7\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 16.2\% | 13.8\% |

## Appendix A

Dollar Difference In Starting Salary By January 2024

| Grade | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { 0A } \\ \text { 1ST } 1 / 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { 0B } \\ \text { 2ND } 1 / 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 1 \\ \text { 2RD YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 2 \\ 3 T H \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 3 \\ 4 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 4 \\ 5 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 5 \\ 6 T H \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 6 \\ 7 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 7 \\ \text { 8TH YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 8 \\ 9 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 9 \\ \text { 10TH YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 10 \\ \text { 11TH YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 11 \\ 12 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 301 | 5,805 | 6,413 | 9,762 | 9,675 | 9,686 | 9,694 | 9,701 | 9,812 | 9,922 | 6,279 | 6,356 | 6,437 | 5,997 |
| 302 | 5,977 | 6,608 | 10,083 | 9,998 | 10,014 | 10,030 | 10,041 | 10,160 | 10,280 | 6,542 | 6,625 | 6,711 | 6,286 |
| 303 | 6,148 | 6,800 | 10,403 | 10,323 | 10,345 | 10,365 | 10,381 | 10,509 | 10,638 | 6,803 | 6,896 | 6,992 | 6,624 |
| 304 | 6,320 | 6,996 | 10,723 | 10,645 | 10,674 | 10,703 | 10,724 | 10,865 | 11,006 | 7,083 | 7,200 | 7,320 | 6,980 |
| 305 | 6,532 | 7,238 | 11,122 | 11,047 | 11,084 | 11,120 | 11,162 | 11,340 | 11,521 | 7,479 | 7,614 | 7,750 | 7,400 |
| 306 | 6,746 | 7,481 | 11,523 | 11,464 | 11,533 | 11,608 | 11,687 | 11,892 | 12,100 | 7,904 | 8,050 | 8,200 | 7,846 |
| 307 | 7,019 | 7,789 | 12,029 | 12,007 | 12,107 | 12,201 | 12,291 | 12,516 | 12,741 | 8,372 | 8,531 | 8,692 | 8,332 |
| 308 | 7,373 | 8,192 | 12,691 | 12,675 | 12,788 | 12,893 | 12,992 | 13,238 | 13,480 | 8,915 | 9,087 | 9,261 | 8,890 |
| 309 | 7,790 | 8,665 | 13,472 | 13,460 | 13,581 | 13,699 | 13,808 | 14,069 | 14,336 | 9,539 | 9,727 | 9,914 | 9,531 |
| 310 | 8,262 | 9,199 | 14,353 | 14,350 | 14,495 | 14,629 | 14,758 | 15,051 | 15,347 | 10,282 | 10,493 | 10,702 | 10,317 |
| 311 | 8,793 | 9,800 | 15,343 | 15,348 | 15,512 | 15,667 | 15,813 | 16,138 | 16,462 | 11,103 | 11,335 | 11,567 | 11,170 |
| 312 | 9,390 | 10,477 | 16,458 | 16,469 | 16,651 | 16,823 | 16,987 | 17,341 | 17,694 | 12,005 | 12,256 | 12,511 | 12,093 |
| 313 | 10,084 | 11,263 | 17,751 | 17,762 | 17,957 | 18,142 | 18,318 | 18,702 | 19,084 | 13,016 | 13,290 | 13,565 | 13,112 |
| 314 | 10,877 | 12,163 | 19,235 | 19,242 | 19,455 | 19,656 | 19,846 | 20,260 | 20,675 | 14,177 | 14,473 | 14,771 | 14,276 |
| 315 | 11,752 | 13,154 | 20,867 | 20,880 | 21,111 | 21,331 | 21,539 | 21,994 | 22,451 | 15,472 | 15,797 | 16,122 | 15,582 |
| 316 | 12,688 | 14,215 | 22,613 | 22,628 | 22,875 | 23,114 | 23,339 | 23,834 | 24,328 | 16,840 | 17,193 | 17,546 | 16,956 |
| 317 | 13,686 | 15,345 | 24,477 | 24,485 | 24,750 | 25,002 | 25,243 | 25,777 | 26,307 | 18,282 | 18,660 | 19,040 | 18,388 |
| 318 | 14,754 | 16,557 | 26,473 | 26,468 | 26,748 | 27,013 | 27,264 | 27,832 | 28,398 | 19,796 | 20,205 | 20,609 | 19,873 |
| 319 | 15,821 | 17,767 | 28,464 | 28,373 | 28,584 | 28,784 | 28,970 | 29,494 | 30,019 | 20,925 | 21,298 | 21,673 | 20,679 |
| 320 | 16,992 | 19,094 | 30,649 | 30,541 | 30,761 | 30,967 | 31,159 | 31,718 | 32,278 | 22,560 | 22,958 | 23,357 | 22,264 |
| 321 | 17,697 | 19,890 | 31,963 | 31,926 | 32,229 | 32,518 | 32,791 | 33,445 | 34,102 | 23,934 | 24,405 | 24,872 | 23,895 |
| 322 | 18,874 | 21,223 | 34,160 | 34,118 | 34,445 | 34,753 | 35,046 | 35,750 | 36,453 | 25,647 | 26,149 | 26,651 | 25,607 |
| 323 | 20,095 | 22,610 | 36,442 | 36,365 | 36,681 | 37,156 | 37,259 | 37,980 | 38,701 | 27,263 | 27,775 | 28,289 | 26,646 |
| 324 | 21,417 | 24,107 | 38,908 | 38,709 | 38,936 | 39,144 | 39,338 | 39,997 | 40,656 | 28,615 | 29,086 | 29,556 | 26,780 |
| 325 | 22,829 | 25,707 | 41,543 | 41,115 | 41,148 | 41,165 | 41,171 | 41,668 | 42,165 | 29,577 | 29,934 | 30,287 | 26,905 |
| 326 | 24,334 | 27,415 | 44,357 | 43,631 | 43,405 | 43,174 | 42,935 | 43,208 | 43,486 | 30,363 | 30,561 | 30,758 | 27,009 |
| 327 | 25,935 | 29,226 | 47,344 | 46,265 | 45,725 | 45,185 | 44,645 | 44,645 | 44,645 | 30,994 | 30,994 | 30,994 | 27,216 |

## Appendix B

Percentage Difference In Starting Salary By August 2026

| Grade | $\begin{gathered} \hline 0 \mathrm{~A} \\ \text { 1ST } 1 / 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { OB } \\ \text { 2ND } 1 / 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 1 \\ 2 R D ~ Y R \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 2 \\ 3 T H Y R \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 3 \\ 4 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 4 \\ 5 T H \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 5 \\ 6 T H \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 6 \\ 7 \mathrm{TH} \mathrm{YR} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 7 \\ 8 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 8 \\ 9 T H \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 9 \\ \text { 10TH YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 10 \\ \text { 11TH YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 11 \\ 12 T H \mathrm{YR} \end{gathered}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 301 | 53.5\% | 51.6\% | 65.1\% | 62.9\% | 61.8\% | 60.6\% | 59.5\% | 59.4\% | 59.2\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 302 | 52.9\% | 51.1\% | 64.7\% | 62.5\% | 61.3\% | 60.2\% | 59.1\% | 58.9\% | 58.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 303 | 52.3\% | 50.6\% | 64.2\% | 62.1\% | 60.9\% | 59.8\% | 58.7\% | 58.5\% | 58.4\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 304 | 51.8\% | 50.2\% | 63.8\% | 61.7\% | 60.5\% | 59.4\% | 58.3\% | 58.1\% | 58.0\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 305 | 51.3\% | 49.7\% | 63.4\% | 61.2\% | 60.1\% | 59.0\% | 57.8\% | 57.7\% | 57.5\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 306 | 50.7\% | 49.2\% | 63.0\% | 60.8\% | 59.6\% | 58.5\% | 57.4\% | 57.2\% | 57.0\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 307 | 50.1\% | 48.7\% | 62.5\% | 60.3\% | 59.1\% | 58.0\% | 56.9\% | 56.7\% | 56.6\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 308 | 49.4\% | 48.1\% | 61.9\% | 59.8\% | 58.6\% | 57.5\% | 56.4\% | 56.2\% | 56.1\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 309 | 48.7\% | 47.4\% | 61.3\% | 59.2\% | 58.1\% | 57.0\% | 55.9\% | 55.7\% | 55.6\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 310 | 48.0\% | 46.8\% | 60.8\% | 58.6\% | 57.5\% | 56.4\% | 55.4\% | 55.2\% | 55.1\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 311 | 47.3\% | 46.2\% | 60.2\% | 58.1\% | 57.0\% | 55.9\% | 54.9\% | 54.7\% | 54.6\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 312 | 46.6\% | 45.6\% | 59.7\% | 57.6\% | 56.5\% | 55.5\% | 54.4\% | 54.3\% | 54.2\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 313 | 46.0\% | 45.1\% | 59.2\% | 57.1\% | 56.0\% | 55.0\% | 54.0\% | 53.9\% | 53.7\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 314 | 45.3\% | 44.5\% | 58.6\% | 56.6\% | 55.6\% | 54.6\% | 53.5\% | 53.4\% | 53.3\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 315 | 44.8\% | 44.0\% | 58.2\% | 56.2\% | 55.2\% | 54.1\% | 53.1\% | 53.0\% | 53.0\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 316 | 44.2\% | 43.6\% | 57.8\% | 55.8\% | 54.8\% | 53.8\% | 52.8\% | 52.7\% | 52.6\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 317 | 43.8\% | 43.2\% | 57.4\% | 55.4\% | 54.4\% | 53.4\% | 52.5\% | 52.4\% | 52.3\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 318 | 43.4\% | 42.8\% | 57.1\% | 55.1\% | 54.1\% | 53.1\% | 52.2\% | 52.1\% | 52.0\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 319 | 43.0\% | 42.5\% | 56.8\% | 54.9\% | 53.9\% | 52.9\% | 52.0\% | 51.9\% | 51.9\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 320 | 42.7\% | 42.2\% | 56.5\% | 54.6\% | 53.6\% | 52.7\% | 51.8\% | 51.7\% | 51.6\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 321 | 42.5\% | 42.1\% | 56.4\% | 54.5\% | 53.5\% | 52.5\% | 51.6\% | 51.5\% | 51.5\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 322 | 42.3\% | 41.8\% | 56.1\% | 54.3\% | 53.3\% | 52.3\% | 51.4\% | 51.4\% | 51.3\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 323 | 42.0\% | 41.6\% | 56.0\% | 54.1\% | 53.1\% | 52.4\% | 51.3\% | 51.2\% | 51.2\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 324 | 41.8\% | 41.4\% | 55.8\% | 53.9\% | 53.0\% | 52.0\% | 51.1\% | 51.1\% | 51.1\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 325 | 41.6\% | 41.2\% | 55.6\% | 53.8\% | 52.8\% | 51.9\% | 51.0\% | 51.0\% | 51.0\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 326 | 41.4\% | 41.1\% | 55.4\% | 53.6\% | 52.7\% | 51.8\% | 50.9\% | 50.9\% | 50.9\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |
| 327 | 41.2\% | 40.9\% | 55.3\% | 53.5\% | 52.6\% | 51.7\% | 50.9\% | 50.9\% | 50.9\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 31.8\% | 27.3\% |

## Appendix B

Dollar Difference In Starting Salary By August 2026

| Grade | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { OA } \\ \text { 1ST } 1 / 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { OB } \\ \text { 2ND } 1 / 2 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 1 \\ 2 R D ~ Y R \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 2 \\ 3 \text { TH YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 3 \\ 4 \mathrm{TH} \mathrm{YR} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 4 \\ 5 \mathrm{TH} \mathrm{YR} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 5 \\ 6 \mathrm{TH} \mathrm{YR} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 6 \\ 7 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 7 \\ 8 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline 8 \\ 9 \text { 9TH } \mathrm{YR} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 9 \\ \text { 10TH YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 10 \\ 11 \mathrm{TH} \text { YR } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 11 \\ \text { 12TH YR } \end{gathered}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 301 | 11,011 | 12,185 | 18,363 | 18,225 | 18,259 | 18,288 | 18,315 | 18,526 | 18,735 | 12,302 | 12,453 | 12,612 | 11,907 |
| 302 | 11,342 | 12,562 | 18,972 | 18,839 | 18,883 | 18,926 | 18,963 | 19,189 | 19,417 | 12,817 | 12,980 | 13,147 | 12,480 |
| 303 | 11,674 | 12,934 | 19,580 | 19,455 | 19,512 | 19,565 | 19,611 | 19,854 | 20,099 | 13,328 | 13,510 | 13,699 | 13,152 |
| 304 | 12,005 | 13,311 | 20,186 | 20,068 | 20,138 | 20,208 | 20,263 | 20,533 | 20,802 | 13,877 | 14,106 | 14,341 | 13,859 |
| 305 | 12,416 | 13,779 | 20,944 | 20,832 | 20,918 | 21,002 | 21,098 | 21,437 | 21,783 | 14,653 | 14,917 | 15,183 | 14,693 |
| 306 | 12,829 | 14,249 | 21,705 | 21,623 | 21,771 | 21,931 | 22,098 | 22,490 | 22,885 | 15,486 | 15,771 | 16,065 | 15,578 |
| 307 | 13,355 | 14,843 | 22,666 | 22,657 | 22,864 | 23,060 | 23,250 | 23,679 | 24,106 | 16,403 | 16,714 | 17,030 | 16,544 |
| 308 | 14,039 | 15,621 | 23,922 | 23,926 | 24,159 | 24,377 | 24,585 | 25,054 | 25,515 | 17,467 | 17,804 | 18,144 | 17,650 |
| 309 | 14,845 | 16,534 | 25,402 | 25,417 | 25,667 | 25,912 | 26,139 | 26,638 | 27,144 | 18,690 | 19,057 | 19,423 | 18,924 |
| 310 | 15,756 | 17,565 | 27,074 | 27,109 | 27,404 | 27,682 | 27,949 | 28,508 | 29,071 | 20,145 | 20,557 | 20,967 | 20,484 |
| 311 | 16,782 | 18,727 | 28,953 | 29,005 | 29,339 | 29,658 | 29,959 | 30,579 | 31,196 | 21,754 | 22,208 | 22,662 | 22,178 |
| 312 | 17,935 | 20,033 | 31,068 | 31,135 | 31,506 | 31,858 | 32,196 | 32,870 | 33,542 | 23,520 | 24,012 | 24,511 | 24,010 |
| 313 | 19,274 | 21,551 | 33,520 | 33,593 | 33,990 | 34,369 | 34,731 | 35,464 | 36,192 | 25,502 | 26,037 | 26,576 | 26,034 |
| 314 | 20,807 | 23,290 | 36,336 | 36,405 | 36,838 | 37,250 | 37,642 | 38,432 | 39,222 | 27,776 | 28,356 | 28,939 | 28,345 |
| 315 | 22,496 | 25,203 | 39,432 | 39,517 | 39,988 | 40,438 | 40,869 | 41,735 | 42,605 | 30,312 | 30,950 | 31,586 | 30,937 |
| 316 | 24,304 | 27,253 | 42,745 | 42,839 | 43,343 | 43,832 | 44,297 | 45,242 | 46,182 | 32,993 | 33,684 | 34,377 | 33,666 |
| 317 | 26,232 | 29,434 | 46,282 | 46,368 | 46,909 | 47,426 | 47,926 | 48,942 | 49,952 | 35,817 | 36,559 | 37,303 | 36,509 |
| 318 | 28,294 | 31,775 | 50,069 | 50,137 | 50,708 | 51,254 | 51,776 | 52,857 | 53,936 | 38,785 | 39,585 | 40,378 | 39,458 |
| 319 | 30,354 | 34,113 | 53,847 | 53,757 | 54,200 | 54,625 | 55,026 | 56,024 | 57,025 | 40,997 | 41,728 | 42,462 | 41,056 |
| 320 | 32,616 | 36,674 | 57,991 | 57,876 | 58,340 | 58,780 | 59,195 | 60,260 | 61,327 | 44,200 | 44,980 | 45,761 | 44,204 |
| 321 | 33,977 | 38,212 | 60,484 | 60,508 | 61,132 | 61,732 | 62,304 | 63,551 | 64,803 | 46,892 | 47,814 | 48,729 | 47,443 |
| 322 | 36,249 | 40,787 | 64,653 | 64,673 | 65,348 | 65,988 | 66,602 | 67,943 | 69,282 | 50,248 | 51,232 | 52,215 | 50,842 |
| 323 | 38,609 | 43,464 | 68,983 | 68,944 | 69,600 | 70,545 | 70,817 | 72,190 | 73,564 | 53,414 | 54,417 | 55,425 | 52,904 |
| 324 | 41,161 | 46,355 | 73,661 | 73,398 | 73,889 | 74,346 | 74,779 | 76,033 | 77,290 | 56,062 | 56,986 | 57,907 | 53,170 |
| 325 | 43,887 | 49,446 | 78,661 | 77,970 | 78,095 | 78,192 | 78,271 | 79,218 | 80,164 | 57,948 | 58,648 | 59,338 | 53,418 |
| 326 | 46,795 | 52,744 | 83,999 | 82,751 | 82,389 | 82,017 | 81,632 | 82,152 | 82,681 | 59,488 | 59,875 | 60,261 | 53,624 |
| 327 | 49,886 | 56,242 | 89,667 | 87,756 | 86,800 | 85,845 | 84,890 | 84,890 | 84,890 | 60,723 | 60,723 | 60,723 | 54,035 |

